

codex alimentarius commissio E



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 5(c)

CX/FA 09/41/6

November 2008

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Forty-first Session

Shanghai, China, 16-20 March 2009

REPORT OF THE ELECTRONIC WORKING GROUP ON THE GSFA

(Prepared by the United States of America with the assistance of Australia, Canada, European Community, Malaysia, ICA, ICBA, ICGA, ICGMA, IDF, IFAC, and IFMA-IMACE)

Governments and international organizations in Observer status with the Codex Alimentarius Commission wishing to submit comments on the report of the electronic Working Group on the GSFA are invited to do so **no later than 31 January 2009** as follows: Secretariat, Codex Committee on Food Additives, National Institute of Nutrition and Food Safety, China CDC, 7 Panjiayuan Nanli, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100021, China (Telefax: + 86 10 67711813, E-mail: secretariat@ccfa.cc *preferably*), with a copy to the Secretary, Codex Alimentarius Commission, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (Telefax: +39.06.5705.4593; E-mail: Codex@fao.org - *preferably*).

1. The 40th Session of the Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA) agreed to establish an electronic Working Group (eWG), lead by the USA, open to all Members and Observers, and working in English, to prepare a report for circulation for comments and consideration at its next session, containing recommendations for adoption, revision or discontinuation for (a): ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid (INS 442); nisin (INS 234); sorbates (INS 200-203); sucroglycerides (INS 474); phosphates (INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542); stearyl citrate (INS 484); cyclodextrin, beta- (INS 459); propyl gallate (INS 310); ascorbyl esters (INS 304, 305); and hydroxybenzoates, para- (INS 214, 218) and (b) provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) to ensure consistency with the provisions for aspartame (INS 951) and acesulfame potassium (INS 950).¹

2. The recommendations in this report are based on a “weight of evidence” approach. They take into account the report of the 40th CCFA’s eWG (see CX/FA 08/40/5), comments submitted in response to CL 2008/10-FA² and comments submitted by the participants in the eWG. Comments containing justifications supporting a particular recommendation were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification. The recommendations contained in this report do not necessarily reflect a unanimous opinion of the eWG members. Rather, the recommendations herein reflect an attempt to reach consensus to facilitate the Committee’s discussion at its 41st session. Individual members of the eWG reserve their right to provide additional comments and recommendations to the CCFA.

3. The CCFA’s eWG offers the following recommendations for consideration by the CCFA. The eWG only discussed provisions for the additives listed in the table below.

¹ ALINORM 08/31/12, para. 78.

² Comments submitted in response to CL 2008/10-FA were made available to all members of the eWG on the electronic forum and are not included in this report.

INS No.	Additive
200-203	Sorbates
214, 218	Hydroxybenzoates, para-
234	Nisin
304, 305	Ascorbyl esters
310	Propyl gallate
338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542	Phosphates
442	Ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid
459	Cyclodextrin, beta-
474	Sucroglycerides
484	Stearyl citrate
962	Aspartame-acesulfame salt

4. Revisions to existing Proposed Draft (Step 3), Draft (Step 6) or adopted food additive provisions proposed by the eWG are indicated in **bold font** in the following tables for each additive. Where appropriate, the additional information provided, either in response to CL 2008/10-FA or as part of the eWG deliberations, is included in the recommendations below.

FOOD ADDITIVES

SORBATES (INS 200-203)

5. The 29th JECFA (1985) assigned a group ADI of 25 mg/kg bw for sorbates.

6. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with sorbates.

Recommendation 1 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discontinue the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.1	Fresh fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42 ³	6	Preservatives in fresh fruit are inappropriate
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Canned fruit is already preserved (no technological need)
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Canned product is already preserved
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Not necessary in frozen products
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Not necessary in frozen products
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Not necessary in frozen products
12.3	Vinegars	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Why is preservative required in a product that has a minimum 5% acetic acid?
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Use of sorbates in beer questioned
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Targeted foodstuffs should be clearly defined

³ **Note 42:** As sorbic acid.

Recommendation 2 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
01.2.1	Fermented milks (plain)	300	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
01.2.2	Renneted milk (plain)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	200	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Consistent with the Standard 256-2007, Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads; In the past, industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in margarine.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured waterbased desserts	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg.
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg.
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	1,200	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	

Recommendation 2 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.3	Chewing gum	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Chewing gum products do exist, (for example liquid-filled chewing gums) which, because of their higher moisture content, may require the use of preservatives. The technical justification for the use of preservatives in chewing gum has already been endorsed by the Codex Committee on Food Additives in 2005, when a level of 1500 mg/kg was adopted for benzoates in chewing gum in the GSFA. Sorbates are often used in complement and/or as a substitute to Benzoates.
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	GMP		Note 42	6	
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42 & 82 ⁴	6	
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	5,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
10.2.2	Frozen egg products	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
10.2.3	Dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
12.2	Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
13.6	Food supplements	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.1.2.1	Frozen Fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Freezing provides adequate preservation 2) Sorbates are not allowed in frozen fruits in Canada
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars

⁴ **Note 82:** For use in shrimp; 6000 mg/kg for Crangon crangon and Crangon vulgaris.

Recommendation 2 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	600	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	

Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.1	Milk and buttermilk (plain)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Not necessary in basic products such as these, other physical preservation methods are adequate (e.g. pasteurization, UHT)
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for sorbates up to 3000 mg/kg. 3) The Codex Standard 221-2001, for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese there is provision for 1000 mg/kg
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for sorbates up to 3000 mg/kg. 2) The Codex Standard A-6-1978, amended in 2006, Cheese, there is provision for 1000 mg/kg
01.6.4	Processed cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Consistent with the Codex Standard A-8(b)-1978 for Processed Cheese 2) Canadian industry has indicated a technological need for sorbates up to 3000 mg/kg. 3) ML seems high. A ML of 2000 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Add note "surface treatment only" 2) Request more information
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Not necessary in heat treated products as the heat treatment provides adequate preservation. Add note "Only for non-heat treated dairy based desserts"
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function

Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) In the past, industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) Add note “only in low-sugar jams”
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) This additive functions as preservative and the level is necessary to achieve the intended technical need.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Sorbates are not allowed in standardized cocoa or chocolate products (as per the Codex Standard) 2) There are several products composed of a non-standard center filling (e.g., cherry fondant) covered by a standardized chocolate coating. Due to the higher water activity of the center filling, sorbate functions as a preservative in these types of products
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) 1500 mg/kg is required for technical application in products
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Consistent with Codex Standard for Noodles 2) No additives are necessary in dried pasta
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Consistent with Codex Standard for Noodles 2) add note “only in noodles”

Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
07.0	Bakery wares	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) Add note “Only pre-packed sliced bread and ryebread and partially cooked bakery wares and energy reduced bakery wares”
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Add note “for surface treatment of dried meat products” 2) Sorbates are not allowed in Canada in meat products
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Add note “for surface treatment of dried meat products” 2) Sorbates are not allowed in Canada in meat products
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	Add note “liquid products only”
12.4	Mustards	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Technological purpose questioned
12.5	Soups and broths	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés allows maximum 500 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	3,350	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 3,350 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 2000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) The Additive functions as a preservative and the maximum use level of 1000mg/kg is safe and necessary to achieve the intended purpose.
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function

Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
12.6.4	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) The Additive functions as a preservative and the maximum use level of 1000mg/kg is safe and necessary to achieve the intended purpose.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	ML seems high. A ML of 1500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.1.4.1	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 3) Suggest collapsing the subcategories into 14.1.4. Although 1000 mg/kg is permitted in some countries, the current use levels typically do not exceed 500 mg/kg as sorbic acid due to inadequate solubility and sensory concerns at higher use levels.
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 3) Collapse into 14.1.4
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Collapse into 14.1.4. If CCFA decides to continue to maintain the subcategories, we suggest including Note 127 (As served to the consumer) in 14.1.4.3.
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Set ML to 600 mg/kg. Add note "Only in liquid tea concentrates and liquid fruit and herbal infusion concentrates" 2) Set ML to 500 mg/kg due to solubility concerns at higher use levels. Add Note 160 (For use in ready-to-drink products and premixes for ready-to-drink products only)
14.2.2	Cider and perry	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.2.3	Grape wines	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) ML seems high. A ML of 200 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function

Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) 200 mg/kg adequate for tech need
14.2.5	Mead	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	ML seems high. A ML of 200 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 500 mg/kg 2) Level of 200 mg/kg adequate

HYDROXYBENZOATES, PARA- (INS 214, 218)

7. The 17th JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 10 mg/kg bw for para-hydroxybenzoates.

8. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with para-hydroxybenzoates.

Recommendation 1 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discontinue the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit	12	mg/kg	Note 27 ⁵	6	
04.1.1.3	Peeled or cut fresh fruit	12	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	1500	mg/kg	Note 27	3	
12.5	Soups and broths	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
13.6	Food supplements	2000	mg/kg	Note 27	3	
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Unable to confirm use in this food category
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Unable to confirm use in this food category
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Unable to confirm use in this food category
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Unable to confirm use in this food category
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Products should fit within food category system or be adequately defined

Recommendation 2 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.6.4	Processed cheese	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	500	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	120	mg/kg	Note 27 & A ⁶	6	Suggest adding a new note to reflect that hydroxybenzoates are not allowed in fermented milk according to Codex STAN 243 – Fermented Milks

⁵ **Note 27:** As para-hydroxybenzoic acid.

Recommendation 2 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	300	mg/kg	Note 27 & B ⁷	6	Suggest adding a new note to reflect that hydroxybenzoates are not allowed in dairy fat spreads according to Codex STAN 253 – Dairy Fat Spreads
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	12	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	12	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	

⁶ Note A: Excluding fermented milks.

⁷ Note B: Excluding dairy fat spreads.

Recommendation 2 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	700	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	1000 mg/kg is sufficient for technical application in products
05.3	Chewing gum	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	1) Although 1500 mg/kg is the most favoured technical level for manufacturers, 1000 mg/kg is acceptable. 2) 1000 mg/kg is sufficient for technical application in products
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
08.2.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts		GMP	Notes 3 ⁸ & 27	6	
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products		GMP	Notes 3 & 27	6	
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	36	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	100	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
12.3	Vinegars	100	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
12.4	Mustards	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
12.6	Sauces and like products	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	500	mg/kg	Note 27	6	While p-hydroxybenzoates are permitted for use at 1000 mg/kg in some countries, they are rarely used in acidic water-based flavored drinks since benzoate and sorbate are the preferred preservatives. To our knowledge, current use levels do not exceed 500 mg/kg so we would propose adopting 500 mg/kg.

⁸ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

Recommendation 2 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	450	mg/kg	Notes 27 & 160 ⁹	6	
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.2	Cider and perry	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.3	Grape wines	50	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.5	Mead	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	300	mg/kg	Note 27	3	The ML is too high and should be lowered to 300 mg/kg
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	

Recommendation 3 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Not permitted in the various Cheese related commodity standards (Stan A-6-1978; Stan 276-1973; Stan 274-1969; Stan 272-1968; Stan 271-1968; Stan 270-1968; Stan 269-1967; Stan 267-1966; Stan-1966; stan 266-1966; Stan 264-1966 Stan 263-1966; stan 277-1973
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	No technological need for use of preservatives in frozen fruit. The freezing provides adequate preservation
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	There is no technological need. The preservative function is ensured by pasteurization process
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	Except for low-sugar jams, there is no technological justification to add p-hydroxybenzoate as the sugar ensures the preservative function
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	A member state questions the technological need for such a preservative in foodstuffs that are stable after heat treatment

NISIN (INS 234)

9. The 12th JECFA (1968) assigned an ADI of 33,000 U/kg bw for nisin.

10. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with nisin.

⁹ **Note 160:** For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only.

Recommendation 1 – Nisin, INS 234 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discontinue the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1	Milk and dairy-based drinks	500	mg/kg	Note 28 ¹⁰	3	
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	There is no technological need.
01.3	Condensed milk and analogues (plain)	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	There is no technological need.
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	There is no technological need.
01.5	Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain)	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	The level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate. With a ML of 500 mg/kg, a child who would eat a portion of 25 g would reach the ADI
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	The level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate. With a ML of 500 mg/kg, a child who would eat a portion of 25 g would reach the ADI
01.6.4	Processed cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	The ML is far too high. Level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	12.5	mg/kg	Note 28	6	
01.8.1	Liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP	Note 28	6	There is no technological need
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	250	mg/kg	Note 28	6	
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen		GMP	Note 28	6	

Recommendation 2 – Nisin, INS 234 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.4.3	Clotted cream (plain)	10	mg/kg	Note 28	6	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	12.5	mg/kg	Note 28	6	
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	12.5	mg/kg	Note 28	6	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	500	mg/kg	Note 28 & C ¹¹	3	Allowed for use in flavoured fermented milks in Codex STAN 243 – Fermented Milks; suggest adding a note to indicate only for use in heat-treated fermented milks (flavoured)
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	3	mg/kg	Note 28	6	

¹⁰ **Note 28:** ADI conversion: if a typical preparation contains 0.025 µg/U, then the ADI of 33 000 U/kg bw becomes: [(33 000 U/kg bw) x (0.025 µg/U) x (1 mg/1 000 µg)] = 0.825 mg/kg bw.

¹¹ **Note C:** For use in heat-treated fermented milks (flavoured) only.

Recommendation 3 – Nisin, INS 234 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.6.4	Processed cheese	250	mg/kg	Note 28	6	1) The ML is far too high. Level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate 2) National legislation exists for use as an antimicrobial in pasteurized process cheese spreads (including those containing fruites, vegetables or meats) at a level of 250 mg/kg 3) 12.5 mg/kg is an adequate level for use of nisin in processed cheese for control of spore-forming organisms.
08.0	Meat and meat products, including poultry and game	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	More information needed on the use of nisin in the general Category 8.0 "Meat and meat products" because the adoption of the provision would allow the use of a preservative in fresh meat products.
10.2.1	Liquid egg products		GMP	Note 28	3	

ASCORBYL ESTERS (INS 304, 305)

11. The 17th JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 1.25 mg/kg bw for ascorbyl esters.
12. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose antioxidant with ascorbyl esters.

Recommendation 1 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 10 ¹²	3	
13.1.1	Infant formulae	10	mg/kg	Notes 10, 15 ¹³ , & 72 ¹⁴	6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 72-1981 (Infant Formula and Formula for Sepcial Dietary Purposes Intended for Infants): provision for use of ascorbyl palmitate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 1 mg/100 ml in formula as consumed. 2) Notes should be consistent with the Codex Standard Standard 72-1981, rev. 2007 (Infant Formula and Formulas for Special Medical Purpose). There are provisions only for ascorbyl palmitate in these Standards while Note 10 refers to ascorbyl stearate. Expression on the basis of both esters should be considered.

¹² **Note 10:** As ascorbyl stearate.

¹³ **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

¹⁴ **Note 72:** Ready-to-eat basis.

Recommendation 1 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
13.1.2	Follow-up formulae	50	mg/kg	Notes 10 , 72, & 15	6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 156-1987 (Follow-Up Formula): provision for use of ascorbyl palmitate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 5 mg/100 ml in formula as consumed. 2) Notes should be consistent with the Codex Standard 156-1987 (Follow-Up Formula) and Standard 74-1981 (Processed Cereal-based Foods). There are provisions only for ascorbyl palmitate in these Standards while Note 10 refers to ascorbyl stearate. Expression on the basis of both esters should be considered. In addition Note 15 (On fat or oil basis) may also apply in food category 13.1.2.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	500	mg/kg	Note 10	3	

Recommendation 2 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	500	mg/kg	Note 10	3	1) Consistent with the Standard 249-2006 (Instant Noodles) as antioxidants at a maximum level of 500 mg/kg singly or in combination as ascorbyl stearate. 2) Only in noodle but not in pre-cooked pasta
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	20	mg/kg	Note 10	8	

PROPYL GALLATE (INS 310)

13. The 46th JECFA (1996) assigned an ADI of 1.4 mg/kg bw for propyl gallate.

14. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose antioxidant with propyl gallate.

Recommendation 1 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA revoke the following food additive provisions for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130 ¹⁵	8	Consequential effect of recommendation to adopt provision in food category 06.4.3 at Step 3.
Recommendation 2 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	3	Consistent with Codex STAN 249-2006 (Instant Noodles): provision for the use of propyl gallate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 200 mg/kg singly or in combination with TBHQ, BHA, or BHT.

¹⁵ **Note 130:** Singly or in combination: butylated hydroxyanisole (INS 320), butylated hydroxytoluene (INS 321), tertiary butylated hydroxyquinone (INS 319), and propyl gallate (INS 310).

Recommendation 3 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
12.5	Soups and broths	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	3	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 117-1981 (Bouillons and Consommés): provision for the use of propyl gallate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 200 mg/kg singly or in combination with TBHQ, BHA, or BHT. 2) This additive is not technologically necessary in all soups; its antioxidant function is only needed in powdered and dehydrated products covered by category 12.5.2.
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	8	

PHOSPHATES (INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542)

15. The 29th JECFA (1985) assigned a group ADI of 70 mg/kg bw for phosphates.

16. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes acidity regulator, sequestrant, emulsifier, texturizing agent, stabilizer, and moisture-retention agent with phosphates.

Recommendation 1 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discontinue</u> the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1,100	mg/kg	Note 33 ¹⁶	6	1) Technical need questioned 2) Not allowed in untreated fresh vegetables in member states 3) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.1.1	Untreated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes [(including soybeans)], and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	

Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	1,320	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88 ¹⁷	6	Use of additive is technologically justified. Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.3.1	Condensed milk (plain)	880	mg/kg	Notes 33, 34 ¹⁸ , & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	22,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.5.1	Milk powder and cream powder (plain)	4,400	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	4,400	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	3	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452

¹⁶ Note 33: As phosphorus.

¹⁷ Note 88: Carryover from the ingredient.

¹⁸ Note 34: Anhydrous basis.

Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.6.4	Processed cheese	14,050	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, 452, and 541.
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	13,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, 452, and 541.
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	220	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338 and 341.
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	220	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, and 341.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341 and 451.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, 452.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341, 451, and 452.
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1,100	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 340, and 342.
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1,760	mg/kg	Notes 16 ¹⁹ & 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76 ²⁰	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.

¹⁹ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings, or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

²⁰ **Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 343, 450, 451, and 452
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 343, 450, 451, and 452
05.3	Chewing gum	44,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	The use of phosphates in chewing gum does not raise safety concerns as phosphates are part of the nutrient source of Phosphorous to human bodies. Phosphates play an important role in a wide range of chewing gum and they are also specifically used with calcium in specialized chewing gum. Phosphates used in this category: 341 and 451.
06.2.1	Flours	11,900	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 342, and 450.
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, and 450.
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	5,600	mg/kg	Note 33	3	Phosphates used in this category: 341 450, and 541.
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	3,100	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
08.2.3	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	1,100	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339 and 340
09.3.1	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.

Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	4,400	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 67 ²¹	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
10.2.2	Frozen egg products	1,290	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
10.2.3	Dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	GMP		Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
10.3	Preserved eggs, including alkaline, salted, and canned eggs	1,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1,320	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338 and 341
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	1,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341
12.1.2	Salt Substitutes	4,400	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	4,400	mg/kg	Note 33	3	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, and 451
12.4	Mustards	1,320	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339 and 451.
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen	1,320	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 450 and 451.
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	6,600	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 450 and 451.
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, and 343.
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, and 343.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, and 343.
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 342, and 452.
14.2.2	Cider and perry	880	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 338 and 452.
14.2.3	Grape wines	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 342, 451, and 452
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 342, 451, and 452
14.2.5	Mead	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 342, 451, and 452
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Phosphates used in this category: 341, 342, 451, and 452

²¹ **Note 67:** Except for use in liquid egg whites at 8800 mg/kg as phosphorus, and in liquid whole eggs at 14700 mg/kg as phosphorus.

Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates used in this category: 339, 341, 450, 451, and 452.

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA <u>discuss further</u> the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.1	Milk and buttermilk (plain)	1,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	3	1) In the past, industry in Canada has indicated that the use of monoammonium phosphate in uncultured buttermilk at 270 ppm expressed as phosphorus is technologically sufficient. 2) Only in UHT and sterilised milk. In addition the ML should be lowered to 400 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the technological function. 3) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	3	1) Should be lowered to 1000 mg/kg (as P) according to the proposal set out in alinorm 08/31/11 appendix VI to be adopted by the 31st session of the Codex Alimentarius Commission (CL 2008/02-MMP) 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) A value of 1100 mg /kg (as P) has been proposed by the Alinorm 08/31/11 appendix V for creams and prepared creams 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	10,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) 1000 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function (Stan 273-1968 Stan 275-1973). 2) Reduce maximum level to 3500 mg/kg, as referenced in the Codex Standard 221 (2001) for Unripened Cheese 3) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450i and 450 ii, 452, and 541.
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	880	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Not permitted in any of the Commodity standards related to cheese products 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450i and 450 ii, 452, and 541.
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	10,500	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) A ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.8.1	Liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	880	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of calcium phosphate, tribasic, in liquid whey, as a carrier for benzoyl peroxide but at lower levels than that proposed here. 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) A ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	12,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) A ML of 500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Recommends reducing the maximum value to 7500 3) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, and 452.
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Technological need is not recognized in such products 2) Maximum level should be raised to 350 mg/kg, as such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the color throughout the shelf-life of such foods. 3) Phosphates used in this category: 450 and 452.
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	10	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Technological need is not recognized in such products 2) Maximum level should be raised to 500 mg/kg, as such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the color throughout the shelf-life of such foods. 3) Phosphates used in this category: 450 and 452.
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Questions the technological need. 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341, 451, 452.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	530	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Questions the technological need. 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341i
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	10	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Revise maximum level to 350 mg/kg, such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the color throughout the shelf-life of such foods. 2) Phosphates used in this category: 450 and 452
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) ML of 400 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341i
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured waterbased desserts	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 341i
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) ML seems excessive 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338 and 341i.

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,600	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	1) Add note "only in processed potato products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.1	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	1) Add note "only in processed potato products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Technological need questioned as Phosphates are primarily used as water-retention agents 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	1) Technological need questioned as Phosphates are primarily used as water-retention agents 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	1) Add note "only in processed potato products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, and 451.
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	6,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) not permitted in the Commodity standard on cocoa powder Stan 105- 1981 2) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, 343, and 450.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Phosphates have technological function as emulsifier and the level is necessary to achieve the intended use. 2) Not permitted in the Commodity standard on chocolate products Stan 87-1981 3) Phosphates used in this category: 343, 450, 451 and 452.
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) 10,000 mg/kg is required for technical application in hard and soft candy products. 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 341, 450
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 450 and 452
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	440	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Technological need questioned in this basic product 2) For Anti- Caking Aid, higher levels of approximately 4000 mg/kg may be required 3) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 45

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
06.2.2	Starches	6,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) More information requested 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339 and 451
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) Need in fresh pasta not recognized 2) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) Need in dried pasta not recognized 2) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) Technological need as emulsifier and the maximum level is necessary to achieve the intended function. 2) Add note “ only in noodles” 3) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 341 and 450.
07.0	Bakery wares	9,300	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Basic foodstuff highly consumed. Technological need questioned for all products within this category 2) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, 343, 450, 452, and 541.
08.1.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts	1,100	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Industry has indicated a technological need for use of phosphates in fresh solid cut meat and poultry (with a defined minimum percent protein content) 2) This additive is not needed in unprocessed fresh meat 3) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, and 452.
08.2.1	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) This additive is not needed in unprocessed fresh meat 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, and 452

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
09.1.1	Fresh Fish	GMP		Note 33	6	1) Not needed in fresh fish (only necessary when fish is frozen to prevent driploss) 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452. 3) The use of phosphate based treatments enhances the keeping quality or stability of the fresh fish. Phosphates have been shown to have the technical effects of both a humectant and a preservative. Phosphates have been demonstrated to reduce microorganisms on the fish surface after initial treatment and during storage thereby increasing the product shelf life and reducing the risk to consumer safety. Phosphates have the demonstrated property of moisture retention (drip loss). The humectant technical effect complements the preservative properties by maintaining consumer acceptance over a longer shelf life
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "excluding fish products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "excluding fish products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "only in frozen mollusk and crustacean" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "only in surimi, fish and crustacean paste" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "only in frozen mollusk and crustacean" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	1) Add note "only in fish paste" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Add note "only in crustacean and fish paste" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Reduce ML to 400 mg/kg and add note "only in surimi and canned crustacean products" 2) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452.

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
10.2.3	Dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	GMP		Note 33	6	1) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452 2) Numerical level should be elaborated.
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Phosphates used in this category: 339, 340, 450, 451, and 452 2) ML of 1000 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.2.1	Herbs and spices		GMP	Note 33	6	1) Replace GMP by a numerical level of use 2) Phosphates used in this category: 341
12.6	Sauces and like products	8,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) Level seems higher than technologically necessary 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, and 452.
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		GMP	Note 33	6	1) Needs appropriate numerical level 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 341, 450, 451, and 452.
13.2	Complementary foods for infants and young children	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	1) INS 339) is used as an acidity regulator and its use is consistent with the criteria in Section 3.2 of the GSFA Preamble. 2) If this provision is to be consistent with the Codex Standard 074-1981, rev. 2006, Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children, the proposed level would be higher since 4400 mg/kg as phosphorus is stipulated in the Standard 3) Level is too high 4) Phosphates used in this category: 340, 341, and 343.
13.6	Food supplements	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	Phosphates 340, 341, and 343 supply nutrients, either as potassium phosphate, calcium phosphate, or magnesium phosphate. Maximum level should be revised to GMP, to meet the nutritional requirements of the particular country/region.
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) Suggests harmonizing with the permitted level of 1000 mg/kg in fruit juices and nectars 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 450, and 452.
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) Suggests 1000 mg/kg 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 450, and 452.
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) Suggests 1000 mg/kg 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 450, and 452.
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	1) Suggests 1000 mg/kg 2) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 450, and 452.

Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542 The eWG recommends that the 41st CCFA **discuss further** the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	12,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<p>1) ML seems very excessive. A ML of 500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function</p> <p>2) We believe that the proposed ML is based on phosphates and not expressed as phosphorus (P, Note 33). Suggest adopting 3000 mg/kg as phosphorus (Note 33) based on the technological need of INS 452i. For all other phosphates, a maximum level of 1000 mg/kg as P would be sufficient</p> <p>3) Maximum level should be changed to GMP, to meet the nutritional requirements of a particular country/region.</p> <p>4) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, 451, and 452</p>
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	880	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<p>1) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 450, and 452</p> <p>2) Add note: "Only for coffee based drinks for vending machine, instant tea and instant herbal infusions"</p>
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	12,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<p>1) Level is excessive</p> <p>2) This level, 12000 mg/kg, of phosphates is needed due to specific yeast growing conditions of the aromatized alcoholic beverage.</p>
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	2,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<p>1) Foodstuffs should be clearly defined</p> <p>2) The amount of Phosphate needed depends on the specific food application. The maximum level should be changed to GMP, to meet the nutritional requirements of the particular country/region.</p> <p>3) Phosphates used in this category: 338, 339, 340, 341, 342, 343, 450, 451, 452, and 542.</p>

AMMONIUM SALTS OF PHOSPHATIDIC ACID (INS 442)

17. The 18th JECFA (1974) assigned an ADI of 30 mg/kg bw for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid.

18. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose emulsifier with ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid.

Recommendation 1 – Ammonium Salts of Phosphatidic Acid, INS 442 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	5000	mg/kg		6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 243-2003 (Fermented Milks (Flavoured, Heat Treated and Non-heat Treated): the use of additives belonging to the class "emulsifiers" is technologically justified in flavoured fermented milks and flavoured fermented milks heat treated after fermentation. Use is justified in the dairy portion. 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	7500	mg/kg		6	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	10000	mg/kg	Note 97 ²²	6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 105-1981 (Cocoa Powders (Cocoa) and Dry Mixtures of Cocoa and Sugar) and Codex STAN 141-1983 (Cocoa (Cacao) Mass (Cocoa/Chocolate Liquor) and Cocoa Cake): provision for use as an emulsifier at a maximum level of 10 g/kg on the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products. 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	10000	mg/kg		6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 87-1981 (Chocolate and Chocolate products): provision for use as an emulsifier at a maximum level of 10 g/kg singly or 15 g/kg in combination with certain other emulsifiers, in products described under 2.1 and 2.2 of the commodity standard. 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	10000	mg/kg		6	

Recommendation 2 – Ammonium Salts of Phosphatidic Acid, INS 442 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)		GMP		6	1) As there is a numerical ADI, the ML should be numerical. 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.

²² **Note 97:** In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products.

Recommendation 2 – Ammonium Salts of Phosphatidic Acid, INS 442 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like		GMP		6	1) As there is a numerical ADI, the ML should be numerical. 2) INS 442 is not allowed in the Codex Standard for cream and prepared creams (Codex Stan A-9-1976, rev 1-2003) 3) Consistent with the Proposed Draft Amendment to the List of Food Additives of the Codex Standard for creams and prepared Creams (N08-2008), as endorsed by the 40th Session of the CCFA and adopted by the 31st Session of the CAC. 4) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce		GMP		6	1) As there is a numerical ADI, the ML should be numerical. 2) Technological need of INS 442, as emulsifier in such products, is questioned. 3) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.
07.1.1	Breads and rolls		GMP		6	1) As there is a numerical ADI, the ML should be numerical. 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need to apply this additive.

CYCLODEXTRIN, BETA- (INS 459)

19. The 44th JECFA (1995) assigned an ADI of 5 mg/kg bw for beta-cyclodextrin.

20. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes stabilizer, binder, and carrier with beta-cyclodextrin.

Recommendation 1 – Cyclodextrin, beta-, INS 459 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for beta-cyclodextrin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg	Note 153 ²³	3	1) Consistent with the Codex Standard 249-2006, Instant Noodles 2) For use in noodles only, not needed in pasta

SUCROGLYCERIDES (INS 474)

21. The 49th JECFA (1997) assigned an ADI of 30 mg/kg bw for sucroglycerides.

22. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose emulsifier with sucroglycerides.

Recommendation 1 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discontinue the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	10000	mg/kg		6	No permitted under Codex STAN 104-1981 on cocoa powder and dry mixtures of cocoa and sugars
14.2.2	Cider and perry	5000	mg/kg		6	

²³ **Note 153:** For use in instant noodles only.

Recommendation 1 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discontinue the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	5000	mg/kg		6	
14.2.5	Mead	5000	mg/kg		6	

Recommendation 2 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	5000	mg/kg		6	Consistent with the Proposed Draft Amendment to the Standard for Additive for Fermented Milks Pertaining to Drinks Based on Fermented Milk (Codex STAN 243-2003), as endorsed by the 40 th Session of the CCFA and adopted by the 31 st Session of the CAC.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	2000	mg/kg		6	
01.5.1	Milk powder and cream powder (plain)	10000	mg/kg		6	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	5000	mg/kg		6	Consistent with the Proposed Draft Amendment to the Standard for Additive for Fermented Milks Pertaining to Drinks Based on Fermented Milk (Codex STAN 243-2003), as endorsed by the 40 th Session of the CCFA and adopted by the 31 st Session of the CAC.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	10000	mg/kg	Note 102 ²⁴	6	1) Consistent with Codex STAN 253-2006 (Dairy Fat Spreads) and Codex STAN 256-2007; provision for use as an emulsifier at 10000 mg/kg, and, in dairy fat spreads, for baking purposes only. 2) For baking purposes only.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	10000	mg/kg	Note 102	6	For baking purposes only.
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	5000	mg/kg		6	Level of 5000 mg/kg is adequate for technological need.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	5000	mg/kg		3	Level of 5000 mg/kg is adequate for technological need.
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP		6	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based Desserts.	5000	mg/kg		6	
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	5000	mg/kg		6	

²⁴ **Note 102:** For use in fat emulsions for baking purposes only.

Recommendation 2 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	5000	mg/kg		6	
05.3	Chewing gum	10000	mg/kg	Note D²⁵	6	1) Level of 10000 mg/kg is adequate. 2) 10000 mg/kg is required for technical application in products. 3) Sucroglycerides are approved for chewing gum use in the European Union and in the United States. Sucroglycerides are allowed in chewing gum in the US, Mexico, and Taiwan at GMP levels. In the European Union, sucroglycerides are currently authorized for their use in chewing gum singly or in combination with sucrose fatty acid esters (INS 473) at 10000 mg/kg. Russia also approves sucroglycerides in gum at 10000 mg/kg. 4) The JECFA ADI is a group ADI that covers both sucroglycerides and sucrose esters of fatty acids. Therefore, add note regarding use singly or in combination with sucrose esters of fatty acids (INS 473).
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	5000	mg/kg		6	
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	10000	mg/kg		6	
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg	Note 15	6	
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 15	6	
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	5000	mg/kg		6	
12.5	Soups and broths	2000	mg/kg		6	Consistent with Codex STAN 117-1981 (Bouillons and Consommés): provision for use as an emulsifier at maximum level of 2 g/L on ready-to-eat basis.
12.6	Sauces and like products	10000	mg/kg		6	
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	5000	mg/kg		6	
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	5000	mg/kg		6	
13.6	Food supplements		GMP		6	

²⁵ **Note D: For use singly or in combination: Sucrose Esters of Fatty Acids (INS 473) and Sucroglycerides (INS 474).**

Recommendation 2 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	5000	mg/kg	Note E ²⁶	6	1) Sucroglycerides are permitted for us at 5000 mg/kg in many countries, such as the ECMS, in non-alcoholic coconut, almond and aniseed-based drinks. At lower use levels in soft drinks (200 mg/kg), they also can be used as 1) alternate stabilisers, 2) to provide cloudiness in citrus drinks and 3) as substitutes or extenders of gum arabic. 2) Revise with Note "Only in non-alcoholic aniseed-based, coconut and almond drinks."
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	1000	mg/kg	Note F ²⁷	6	1) Revise with Note "Only in canned liquid coffee." 2) Revise with Note 160 (For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only).
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	5000	mg/kg		6	
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	5000	mg/kg		6	

STEARYL CITRATE (INS 484)

23. The 17th JECFA (1973) assigned an ADI of 50 mg/kg bw for stearyl citrate.

24. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes emulsifier and sequestrant with stearyl citrate.

Recommendation 1 - Stearyl Citrate, INS 484 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for stearyl citrate in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	100	mg/kg	Note 15	3	industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for this additive in margarine at this level of use

ASPARTAME-ACESULFAME SALT (INS 962)

25. The 55th JECFA (2000) concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties are covered by the ADIs for aspartame (40 mg/kg bw) and acesulfame potassium (acesulfame K) (15 mg/kg bw).

26. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose sweetener with aspartame-acesulfame salt.

27. The report of the eWG to the 39th CCFA noted that the proposed draft acceptable maximum use levels for these provisions are currently expressed in the GSFA in terms of aspartame-acesulfame salt or equivalents of aspartame or acesulfame K.²⁸ Because JECFA concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties in aspartame-acesulfame salt are included in the ADIs established for aspartame (INS 951) and acesulfame K (INS 950), the equivalent level of aspartame and acesulfame K from the use of the double salt should not exceed the individual maximum use level for aspartame or for acesulfame K.

²⁶ **Note E: For use in non-alcoholic aniseed-based, coconut and almond drinks only.**

²⁷ **Note F: For use in canned liquid coffee only.**

²⁸ CX/FA 07/39/9.

28. The *ad hoc* Working Group on the GSFA to the 40th CCFA recommended, and the Committee agreed, to examine the provisions for the aspartame-acesulfame salt in order to ensure that these provisions are consistent with those for aspartame and for acesulfame K and are reported on a consistent basis.²⁹ As part of its mandate, the eWG established by the 40th CCFA was requested to develop recommendations for ensuring consistency between the provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt and those for aspartame and for acesulfame K.³⁰

29. The eWG considered an Options Paper that contained four approaches to resolve the issue of the reporting basis for aspartame-acesulfame salt.³¹ Based upon the comments to the Options Paper, the eWG recommends that the CCFA agree to the following approach for expressing the acceptable maximum use levels for aspartame-acesulfame salt.

Recommendation 1 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962

The acceptable maximum use levels will be expressed on the following:

- a. As *either* aspartame or acesulfame K equivalents
- b. Harmonized with the current GSFA maximum use levels for aspartame and acesulfame K (i.e., the maximum level of salt would be expressed as aspartame or acesulfame K depending upon which individual sweetener is listed in the GSFA with the lower maximum use level for that food category.)
- c. Replace the current Notes 113³² and 119³³ associated with the proposed draft provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt with the following notes:
 - New Note 113: Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.44). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual acesulfame potassium or aspartame should not exceed the individual maximum levels for acesulfame potassium or aspartame (the reported maximum level can be converted to aspartame equivalents by dividing by 0.68).
 - New Note 119: Use level reported as aspartame equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.64). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual aspartame or acesulfame potassium should not exceed the individual maximum levels for aspartame or acesulfame potassium (the reported maximum level can be converted to acesulfame potassium equivalents by multiplying by 0.68).
- d. Add the following note to all of the provisions for acesulfame K

Not to exceed the maximum use level for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 952).
- e. Add the following note to all of the provisions for aspartame:

Not to exceed the maximum use level for aspartame (INS 951) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 952).

30. The following are the outstanding proposed draft (Step 3) food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt contained in CX/FA 07/39/9 (Part 1) that have been revised as follows:

- Notes 68³⁴, 138³⁵, 144³⁶, and 145³⁷ have all been replaced with Note 161³⁸ consistent with the decision of the 39th CCFA³⁹ on the provisions for other sweeteners (e.g., acesulfame K, alitame, aspartame, cyclamates).

²⁹ ALINORM 08/31/12, para 72.

³⁰ ALINORM 08/31/12, para 78.

³¹ The Options Paper was made available to all members of the eWG on the electronic forum and is not included in this report.

³² **Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents.

³³ **Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents.

³⁴ **Note 68:** For use in products with no added sugar only.

³⁵ **Note 138:** For use in energy-reduced products only.

³⁶ **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only.

³⁷ **Note 145:** Products are energy-reduced or with no added sugar.

- The maximum use level for each of the aspartame-acesulfame salt provisions has been revised to harmonize with the current GSFA maximum use levels for aspartame and acesulfame K. These revised limits for the aspartame-acesulfame salt are indicated in **bold**.

31. The ad hoc Working Group on the GSFA to the 39^h CCFA agreed that sweeteners are technologically justified in the food categories⁴⁰ that are **shaded**.

Recommendation 1 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA include at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.1.3.1	Fruit Nectar	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 ⁴¹		Both aspartame and acesulfame K have established maximum levels in this category in the GSFA. If the key components of the salt are permitted in a food category, there should be no reason to prevent the use of the salt of them
14.1.3.3	Concentrates for fruit nectar	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 127 ⁴²		Both aspartame and acesulfame K have established maximum levels in this category in the GSFA. If the key components of the salt are permitted in a food category, there should be no reason to prevent the use of the salt of them

Recommendation 2 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	800	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 119 ⁴³ & Note 161	3	

³⁸ **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.

³⁹ ALINORM 07/30/12 Rev., para. 102-103 and Appendix VII.

⁴⁰ 39th CCFA, CRD 1 App. V.

⁴¹ **New Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.44). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual acesulfame potassium or aspartame should not exceed the individual maximum levels for acesulfame potassium or aspartame (the reported maximum level can be converted to aspartame equivalents by dividing by 0.68).

⁴² **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

⁴³ **New Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.64). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual aspartame or acesulfame potassium should not exceed the individual maximum levels for aspartame

Recommendation 2 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured waterbased desserts	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	200	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	500	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1,000	mg/kg	Note 77 ⁴⁴ & New Note 113	3	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K in this Category.
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	350	mg/kg	New Note 119	3	
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	GMP		New Note 113	3	
12.4	Mustards	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
12.5	Soups and broths	110	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	

or acesulfame potassium (the reported maximum level can be converted to acesulfame potassium equivalents by multiplying by 0.68)

⁴⁴ **Note 77:** For special nutritional uses only.

Recommendation 2 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	500	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	450	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	450	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
13.6	Food supplements	200	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	600	mg/kg	New Note 119, New Note 113 & Note 161	3	Suggest inserting both Notes 113 and 119; both provisions for ace-K and asp were adopted at the same Max Level of use in 2007
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	

Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	1,130	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Industry has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 500 ppm in beverages in general. 2) The 40th CCFA agreed to discontinue work for Aspartame in 01,2. In order to be coherent, the same logic should apply for INS 962 3) The Codex Standard for Fermented Milks does not allow the use of sweeteners in plain fermented milks (heat-treated and non-heat treated). Also, there is no existing provision in the GSFA for the use of aspartame in food Category 01.2
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	2,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer
01.4.4	Cream analogues	1,550	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	500	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	The use could mislead the consumer

Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	1130	mg/kg		3	1) There are existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame and acesulfame K in Food Category 04.1.2.2. Proposes revising the proposed ML to 500 mg/kg with the inclusion of Note 113 to reflect the ML for Acesulfame K in this Food Category. 2) The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	200	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	500	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Add Note 116
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Add Note 116
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K in this Category at a maximum level of 1000 mg/kg. Revise ML to 1000 mg/kg, consistent with Cat. 4.1.25 and 4.1.2.6, Jams and spreads 2) Add Note 116
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	500	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Technical need questioned
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Technical need questioned
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for aspartame at 2000 mg/kg in this Category. It is noted that there is provision at step 6 in the GSFA for aspartame with a ML of 3000 mg/kg in this food category. 2) add note 161
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Add note 161
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Add note 161
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 2500 mg/kg in confectionery.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	500	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 2500 mg/kg in confectionery.
05.3	Chewing gum	5,000	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	The technological justification for such a high level is required. A ML of 2000 mg/kg expressed as Acesulfame K should be sufficient to reach the desired effect.

Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 1000 mg/kg in this Category.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 1000 mg/kg in desserts in general
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Possible intake exceedance due to high consumption of such basic foodstuffs 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K in this Category.
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Use could mislead consumer
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	2,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for aspartame at 2000 mg/kg, not ace-K, in condiments. We would like to replace Note 113 by 119 in this Category 2) No technological need. The use could mislead the consumer
12.3	Vinegars	2,000	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	No technological need. The use could mislead the consumer
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	1360	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) Technological justification for such a high level is required. A ML of 350 mg expressed as Acesulfame K is sufficient to reach the desired effect. 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.1.2.2
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	3,100	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 127	3	1) Technological justification for such a high level is required. A ML of 350 mg expressed as Acesulfame K is sufficient to reach the desired effect. Add Note 161. 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.1.2.4
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	350	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 127	3	Add note 161
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	600	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Use could mislead the consumer
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	790	mg/kg	New Note 113 & Note 161	3	1) The ML is too high. A ML of 350 mg/kg (as expressed as AcK) should be sufficient to reach the desire effect 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.2.1
14.2.2	Cider and perry	790	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) The ML is too high. A ML of 350 mg/kg (as expressed as AcK) should be sufficient to reach the desire effect. Add note 161 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.2.2

Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962 The eWG recommends that the 41 st CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	1,080	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	1) The use could mislead the consumer 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.2.4
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	350	mg/kg	New Note 113	3	Note 113 instead of 119 should be inserted. This provision for ace-K , not asp, was adopted in 2007