codex alimentarius commission E

FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION

JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 8(c) **CX/FA 08/40/13**

February 2008

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Fortieth Session

Beijing, China, 21-25 April 2008

DISCUSSION PAPER ON INCONSISTENCIES IN THE NAMES OF COMPOUNDS IN THE CODEX SPECIFICATIONS FOR IDENTITY AND PURITY OF FOOD ADDITIVES AND IN THE INTERNATIONAL NUMBERING SYSTEM FOR FOOD ADDITIVES

INTRODUCTION

1. The 39th session of the Committee noted that the in-session physical Working Group on the International Numbering System (INS) discussed the inconsistencies between the names of compounds in adopted Codex specifications and in the INS list. Subsequently, the Committee decided to establish an electronic Working Group (eWG)[1], led by the Delegation of Denmark, working in English, which would identify the problems and formulate recommendations for consideration at the next session of the Committee (ALINORM 07/30/12, para. 149).

BACKGROUND

2. The purpose of this work is to compare names of compounds included in the "Class Names and the International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989)", the INS list, with names of the same compounds included in the "List of Codex Specifications for Food Additives (CAC/MISC 6)", the Codex specifications list.

3. The INS is an open list of food additives with known technological purposes for which an international identification number can be justified. When a request for the inclusion of a new additive in the INS is presented to the Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA), the request, in most cases, does not include specifications or other types of identification information for the compound. CCFA is therefore not typically in a position to discuss whether the name of the proposed substance is correct or appropriate.

4. Codex specifications are normally developed by the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA), who assigns a name to the compound. The name is assigned in accordance with the principles developed at the 33rd JECFA[2]. The name chosen must be non-proprietary and should be a scientifically accurate description of the substance. In addition, the name should communicate to the consumer an accurate description of the substance, within the scope of existing names for food additives.

[1] Brazil, Denmark (lead country), European Community, Finland, Mongolia, Poland, Serbia, Switzerland, United Kingdom, United States of America and FAO participated in the eWG (the full list of participants is given in Annex 2 to this document).

[2] Thirty-third report of the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives, WHO Technical Report Series, No. 776, 1989.

5. Due to the difference in procedures for assigning names to compounds in the INS list and in the Codex specifications list, different names have sometimes been assigned to the same compound in each list, resulting in a lack of consistency between the lists.

PRELIMINARY WORK

6. As preliminary work, names and INS numbers of substances included in the two lists were compared and inconsistencies were identified. Of the 667 substances considered, it was determined that no action was needed for 489 substances because: 1) the substance was only found in the Codex specifications list (99 substances); 2) the substance was only found in the INS list (208 substances); or 3) the substance name and INS number were identical in both the Codex specifications list and the INS list. Purely editorial differences were found for 15 substances (a list of these has been sent to the Codex Secretariat). The remaining 163 substances with identified inconsistencies were divided into 8 groups according to the nature of the inconsistency.

7. The substances were grouped by the nature of the inconsistency, along with specific questions and suggestions for further action. The file including the 8 groups was circulated to the eWG for comment. In addition, the file was distributed by the Codex secretariat through the Codex e-mail list

GENERAL OVERVIEW OF COMMENTS RECEIVED

8. Initial comments were received from Serbia, the United States of America (USA) and Switzerland. As a general comment, the USA drew attention to the fact that when a name in the INS is changed, it is necessary to revise the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) and other Codex texts accordingly. Therefore, the USA suggested that in cases of inconsistency, the name in the Codex specifications should be changed in favour of the name in the INS. The FAO Secretary to JECFA indicated, however, that it is difficult to change the name of a substance in a JECFA specifications monograph as the name is tied to the JECFA evaluation. Specific comments from the USA, Serbia and Switzerland are incorporated in the following text.

HARMONIZATION OF NAMES IN THE TWO LISTS

9. The nature of the inconsistencies found in the 8 groups is explained in brief, below. More detailed information and recommendations are included in Annex 1.

10. **Minor differences (see part I of Annex 1).** The differences between the names in this group are typographical in nature. The names are the same; they are just arranged differently (in some cases for the purpose of electronic sorting).

11. **Use of synonyms (see part II of Annex 1).** The difference between the names in this group is that synonyms are included as a part of the INS name, but not in the name in the Codex specifications. There is no concern as long as the synonym that has been included as part of the INS name is listed as a synonym in the Codex specifications.

12. **Specifications covering more than one substance (see part III of Annex 1).** Some Codex specifications are associated with more than one substance in the INS. This is of no concern provided that: 1) the substances covered by the Codex specifications are the same as those listed in the INS; and 2) the names in the INS are identical to the names or synonyms in the Codex specifications.

13. **INS numbers covering more than one substance (see part IV of Annex 1).** This group includes INS numbers with names that encompass several Codex specifications. In these cases, Codex specifications for more than one substance refer to the same INS number. In order to make the INS unambiguous, this situation should be avoided when possible.

14. **Sulphur/sulfur compounds (see part V of Annex 1).** The names of these compounds are spelled differently in the two lists. The reason may be style differences in FAO and WHO publications. Except for the spelling, the names are identical in the two lists.

15. **Phosphates (see part VI of Annex 1).** This group includes phosphates that have different names in the two lists. Recommendations have been made in order to improve consistency between the lists and within the individual lists themselves.

16. **Use of nomenclature (see part VII of Annex 1).** This group includes substances with naming inconsistencies due to the use of designators (e.g., L-, D- and DL-) in one list but not in the other. In some instances, this is not a concern. In other cases, however, such as where an ADI has been allocated to only one specific isomer, it may be best to include the designation so as to avoid confusion.

17. **Miscellaneous (see part VIII of Annex 1).** This group contains substances with inconsistencies that did not fit in the other groups.

Annex 1

Substances[3] grouped by type of inconsistency

PART I - Minor differences

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Explanations and recommendations	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
beta-Carotene, synthetic	The differences between the names in this group are typographical in nature. The names are the same, but are arranged differently (in some cases for the purpose of electronic sorting). **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	160a (i)	Carotenes, beta-, (Synthetic)
Lycopene from Blakeslea trispora		160d (iii)	Lycopene (Blakeslea trispora)
Acetic acid, glacial		260	Acetic Acid (Glacial)
Magnesium DL-lactate		329	Magnesium Lactate (DL-)
L(+)-Tartaric acid		334	Tartaric Acid (L(+)-)
Calcium DL-malate		352 (ii)	Calcium Malate, (D,L-)
alpha-Cyclodextrin		457	Cyclodextrin, alpha-
gamma-Cyclodextrin		458	Cyclodextrin, gamma-
beta-Cyclodextrin		459	Cyclodextrin, beta-
Sodium aluminium phosphate, acidic		541 (i)	Sodium Aluminium Phosphate – Acidic
Sodium aluminium phosphate, basic		541 (ii)	Sodium Aluminium Phosphate – Basic
4-Hexylresorcinol		586	Hexylresorcinol, 4-
L-Glutamic acid		620	Glutamic Acid, (L(+)-)
5'-Guanylic acid		626	Guanylic Acid, 5'-
Mineral oil (high viscosity)		905d	Mineral Oil, High Viscosity
D-Tagatose		963	Tagatose, D-
Quillaia extract (Type 1)		999 (i)	Quillaia extract Type 1
Quillaia extract (Type 2)		999 (ii)	Quillaia extract Type 2
Insoluble polyvinylpyrrolidone		1202	Polyvinylpyrrolidone (Insoluble)
Aluminium sulfate (anhydrous)		520	Aluminium Sulphate

[3] The e-Working Group only considered the English name of the substances. Therefore in both French and Spanish version of this document, the name of substances is given in English only.

PART II - Use of synonyms

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
Azorubine	Carmoisine is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	122	Azorubine (Carmoisine)
Indigotine	Indigo carmine is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	132	Indigotine (Indigo Carmine)
Processed Euchema seaweed	PES is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	407a	Processed Euchema Seaweed (PES)
Gum Arabic	Acacia gum is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	414	Gum Arabic (Acacia Gum)
Sodium carboxymethyl cellulose	Cellulose gum is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	466	Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose (cellulose gum)
Cross-linked sodium carboxymethyl cellulose	Cross-linked cellulose gum is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	468	Cross-Linked Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose (Cross-linked cellulose gum)
Urea	Carbamide is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	927b	Urea (Carbamide)
Sucralose	4,1',6'-trichlorogalactosucrose is included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	955	Sucralose (Trichlorogalactosucrose)
Natamycin	JECFA has considered Natamycin to be the appropriate name and has included Pimaricin in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: The CCFA may consider changing the name in INS to Natamycin (Pimaricin).**	235	Pimaricin (Natamycin)
Sodium carboxymethyl cellulose, enzymatically hydrolysed	Cellulose gum, enzymatically hydrolysed is not included in specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to consider including this synonym in the specifications**	469	Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose, Enzymatically Hydrolysed (Cellulose Gum, Enzymatically Hydrolyzed)
Petroleum jelly	JECFA has considered Petroleum jelly to be the appropriate name and has included Petrolatum in the specifications as a synonym. **Recommendation: The CCFA may consider changing the name in INS to Petroleum jelly (Petrolatum).**	905b	Petrolatum (Petroleum Jelly)
Isomalt	29th JECFA considered the name ”Isomaltitol” and concluded that it was not appropriate as a name for the substance nor as a synonym. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to reconsider including Isomaltitol as a synonym in the specifications.**	953	Isomalt (isomaltitol)

PART III - Specifications covering more than one substance

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
Iron oxides Iron oxide black: INS No. 172(i); Iron oxide red: INS No. 172(ii); Iron oxide yellow: INS No. 172(iii).	Only minor differences. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	172 (i)	Iron Oxide, Black
		172 (ii)	Iron Oxide, Red
		172 (iii)	Iron Oxide, Yellow
Mineral oil (medium and low viscosity) Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class I): INS 950e; Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class II): INS 950f; Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class III): INS 950g.	Except for the editorials in the INS numbers in the Codex specifications list, the names and numbers in the two lists are identical. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	905e	Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class I)
		905f	Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class II)
		905g	Mineral Oil, Medium and Low Viscosity (Class III)
Modified starches Dextrin roasted starch: INS No. 1400; Acid treated starch: INS No. 1401; Alkaline treated starch: INS No. 1402: Bleached starch: INS No. 1403; Oxidized starch: INS No. 1404; Enzyme-treated starch: INS No. 1405; Monostarch phosphate: INS No. 1410; Distarch phosphate: INS No. 1412; Phosphated dostarch phosphate: INS No. 1413; Acetylated distarch phosphate: INS No.1414; Starch acetate: INS No.1420; Acetylated distarch adipate: INS No.1422; Hydroxypropyl starch: INS No. 1440; Hydroxypropyl distarch phospahe: INS No.1442; Starch sodium octenylsucinate: INS No. 1450; Acetylated oxidized starch: INS No. 1451.	Only minor differences. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	1400	Dextrins, Roasted Starch
		1401	Acid-Treated Starch
		1402	Alkaline Treated Starch
		1403	Bleached Starch
		1404	Oxidized Starch
		1405	Starches, Enzyme Treated
		1410	Monostarch Phosphate
		1412	Distarch Phosphate
		1413	Phosphated Distarch Phosphate
		1414	Acetylated Distarch Phosphate
		1420	Starch acetate
		1422	Acetylated Distarch Adipate
		1440	Hydroxypropyl Starch
		1442	Hydroxypropyl Distarch Phosphate
		1450	Starch Sodium Octenyl Succinate
		1451	Acetylated oxidized starch

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART III - Specifications covering more than one substance - continued			
Caramel colours Class I: Plain caramel, caustic caramel: INS No. 150a; Class II: Caustic sulfite caramel: INS No. 150b; Class III: Ammonia caramel: INS No. 150c; Class IV: Sulfite ammonia caramel: INS No. 150d.	From a technical standpoint, the names are equivalent. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	150a	Caramel I - Plain
		150b	Caramel II - Caustic Sulphite Process
		150c	Caramel III - Ammonia Process
		150d	Caramel IV - Sulphite Ammonia Process
Ferrocyanides of calcium, potassium and sodium 538, 536, 535	The individual names in the INS list are not included in the specifications as synonyms. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to consider including the individual INS names in the specifications.**	535	Sodium Ferrocyanide
		536	Potassium Ferrocyanide
		538	Calcium Ferrocyanide

PART IV - INS numbers covering more than one substance

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
alpha Amylase from Bacillus stearothermophilus	INS 1100 covers several amylases. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	1100	Amylases
alpha-Amylase , and glucoamylase from Aspergillus oryzae, var.			
alpha-Amylase from Aspergillus oryzae, var.			
alpha-Amylase from Bacillus subtilis			
Amyloglucosidase from Aspergillus niger, var.			
Protease from Aspergillus oryzae, var.	INS 1101 (i) covers two proteases. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	1101 (i)	Protease
Protease from Streptomyces fradiae			
Riboflavin	The specifications with the title "Riboflavin" is manufactured by chemical synthesis. **Recommendation: JECFA may be asked whether it would be appropriate to change the title to ”Riboflavin, synthetic”.** When JECFA evaluated Riboflavin from Bacillus subtilis it was decided to use INS no. 101 (i) because the composition of the two substances was essentially the same. **Recommendation: The CCFA may consider adding Riboflavin from Bacillus subtilis to the INS list and determining whether it would need a new INS number.**	101 (i)	Riboflavin
Riboflavin from Bacillus subtilis			

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART IV - INS numbers covering more than one substance - continued			
	As shown below, INS 141 covers two chemically different compounds “Cholorophylls, copper complexes” and “Chlorophyllins, copper complexes.” **Recommendation: The CCFA may consider whether it would be appropriate to change the title for the INS group 141 in order to include both “Chlorophylls” and “Chlorophyllins” in the title.**	**141**	**Chlorophylls, Copper**
Chlorophylls, copper complexes	Not for consideration. Only used in this table for clarification of the suggestion above	141 (i)	Chlorophylls, Copper complexes
Chlorophyllins, copper complexes, sodium and potassium salts		141 (ii)	Chlorophyllins, Copper complexes, Sodium and Potassium Salts
Annatto extracts (acqueous-processed bixin)	The 39th CCFA decided only to allocate one INS no. to all bixin-based annatto extracts. **Recommendation: JECFA may be asked to consider whether it would be appropriate to include “bixin based anatto extracts” as a synonym in the specifications.**	160b(i)	Annatto Extracts, bixin-based
Annatto extracts (solvent-extracted bixin)			
Annatto extracts (alkali-processed norbixin, acidprecipitated)	The 39th CCFA decided only to allocate one INS no. to all norbixin-based annatto extracts. **Recommendation: JECFA may be asked to consider whether it would be appropriate to include “norbixin based anatto extracts” as a synonym in the specifications.**	160b(ii)	Annatto Extracts, norbixin-based
Annatto extracts (alkali-processed norbixin, not acidprecipitated)			
Annatto extracts (solvent-extracted norbixin)			
beta-apo-8’-Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester	The INS no. 160f covers both the methyl ester and the ethyl ester while the specification only covers the ethyl ester. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including the two esters separately in INS**	160f	Carotenoic Acid, Methyl or Ethyl Ester, beta-apo-8'-
Sodium fumarate	**Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the name in INS list to Sodium fumarate or in case that more than one sodium fumarate are used as an additive to include the individual sodium fumarates in the list.**	365	Sodium Fumarates
Sodium sulphate	INS 514 - Sodium sulfate covers two Sodium sulfates used as food additives: Sodium sulfate and Sodium hydrogen sulfate. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including the two substances individually.**	514	Sodium Sulphates

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART IV - INS numbers covering more than one substance - continued			
Potassium sulphate	INS 515 - Potassium sulfate covers two Potassium sulfates used as food additives: Potassium sulfate and Potassium hydrogen sulfate **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including the two substances individually.**	515	Potassium Sulphates
Sorbitol Sorbitol syrup	INS 420 covers both sorbitol and sorbitol syrup. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including the two additives individually with new numbers, preferably 420 (i) and 420 (ii)**	420	Sorbitol and Sorbitol Syrup
Calcium cyclamate Cyclohexyslulfamic acid Sodium cyclamate	INS 952 covers both cyclamic acid and its salts. Codex specifications have not been adopted for the potassium salt. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider listing cyclamic acid and its salts individually with new numbers, preferably using "little i's"**	952	Cyclamic Acid (and Na, K, Ca Salts)
Potassium saccharin Saccharin	INS 954 covers both saccharin and its salts. Codex specifications have not been adopted for the sodium and calcium salts. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider listing saccharin acid and its salts individually with new numbers, preferably using "little i's"**	954	Saccharin (and Na, K, Ca Salts)
Maltitol Maltitol syrup	INS 965 covers bothe maltitol and maltitol syrup. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including the two additives individually with new numbers, preferably 965 (i) and 965 (ii)**	965	Maltitol and Maltitol Syrup

PART V - Sulphur/sulphur compounds

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
Sulfur dioxide	Difference in spelling sulphur/sulfur. The reason may be difference between "FAO style" (recommended word list: **sulphur** *not* sulfur) and "WHO style" (spelling list: **sulfur** *not* sulphur). **No recommendation is possible in this case**	220	Sulphur Dioxide
Sodium sulfite		221	Sodium Sulphite
Sodium hydrogen sulfite		222	Sodium Hydrogen Sulphite
Sodium metabisulfite		223	Sodium Metabisulphite
Potassium metabisulfite		224	Potassium Metabisulphite
Potassium sulfite		225	Potassium Sulphite
Dioctyl sodium sulfosuccinate		480	Dioctyl Sodium Sulphosuccinate
Sulfuric acid		513	Sulphuric Acid
Sodium sulphate		514	Sodium Sulphates
Potassium sulphate		515	Potassium Sulphates
Calcium sulfate		516	Calcium Sulphate
Cupric sulfate		519	Cupric Sulphate
Aluminium sulfate (anhydrous)		520	Aluminium Sulphate
Aluminium sodium sulfate		521	Aluminium Sodium Sulphate
Aluminium potassium sulphate		522	Aluminium Potassium Sulphate
Aluminium ammonium sulphate		523	Aluminium Ammonium Sulphate
Sodium thiosulfate		539	Sodium Thiosulphate

PART VI - Phosphates

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
Phosphoric acid	Names for the individual phosphates in INS include "ortho" while the names in the specifications do not. The group names for the individual salts in INS do not include "ortho". **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider deleting "ortho" from the names in INS. Furthermore the CCFA should consider using the specifications names for the individual salts (e.g. disodium hydrogen phosphate instead of disodium phosphate)**	338	Orthophosphoric Acid
Sodium dihydrogen phosphate		339 (i)	Monosodium Orthophosphate
Disodium hydrogen phosphate		339 (ii)	Disodium Orthophosphate
Trisodium phosphate		339 (iii)	Trisodium Orthophosphate
Potassium dihydrogen phosphate		340 (i)	Monopotassium Orthophosphate
Dipotassium hydrogen phosphate		340 (ii)	Dipotassium Orthophosphate
Tripotassium phosphate		340 (iii)	Tripotassium Orthophosphate
Calcium dihydrogen phosphate		341 (i)	Monocalcium Orthophosphate
Calcium hydrogen phosphate		341 (ii)	Dicalcium Orthophosphate
Tricalcium phosphate		341 (iii)	Tricalcium Orthophosphate
Ammonium dihydrogen phosphate		342 (i)	Monoammonium Orthophosphate
Diammonium hydrogen phosphate		342 (ii)	Diammonium Orthophosphate
Magnesium hydrogen phosphate		343 (ii)	Dimagnesium Orthophosphate
Trimagnesium phosphate		343 (iii)	Trimagnesium Orthophosphate
Disodium pyrophosphate	The INS names use “diphosphate” while the names in the specifications for some substances use “pyrophpsphate” and in one case “diphosphate.” **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to consider using diphosphate for all 450 substances in order to be consistent.**	450 (i)	Disodium Diphosphate
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate		450 (iii)	Tetrasodium Diphosphate
Dicalcium pyrophosphate		450 (vi)	Dicalcium Diphosphate
Calcium dihydrogen diphosphate		450 (vii)	Calcium Dihydrogen Diphosphate

PART VII – Use of Nomenclature

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
beta-apo-8’-Carotenal	The ”(C30)” included in the INS name is not necessary. However, this difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8’-(C30)
Sodium stearoyl 2-lactylate	Calcium stearoyl lactylate is included as a synonym in the Codex specifications. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	481 (i)	Sodium Stearoyl Lactylate
Calcium stearoyl 2-lactylate	Calcium stearoyl lactylate is included as a synonym in the Codex specifications. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	482 (i)	Calcium Stearoyl Lactylate

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART VII – Use of Nomenclature - continued			
Lactic acid	Lactic acid as specified is lactic acid without reference to a specific L-, D- or DL-isomer of lactic acid. The INS name may give the impression that each of these isomers have been evaluated and specified. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider deleting ”(L-, D-, and DL)” from the INS name or including each of them separately in INS.**	270	Lactic Acid (L-, D-, and DL-)
Ascorbic acid	The specifications name does not include the designator ”L”. However, the substance specified is the ”L”-compound. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to consider including the ”L” designator in the name.**	300	Ascorbic Acid (L-)
Calcium citrate	The naming of citrates are not consistent neither between the two lists nor within the individual lists. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked for advice on the appropriate naming of citrates.**	333(iii)	Tricalcium Citrate
Sodium L(+)-tartrate	Disodium L-tartrate is a synonym in the specifications. The ADI has been allocated to the L-compound. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including ”L-” in the INS name.**	335 (ii)	Disodium Tartrate
Potassium sodium L(+)-tartrate	The ADI has been allocated to the L-compound. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including ”L-” in the INS name.**	337	Potassium Sodium Tartrate
Sodium hydrogen DL-malate	The ADI has been allocated to the DL-compound. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including ”DL-” in the INS name.**	350 (i)	Sodium Hydrogen Malate
Sodium DL-malate	The ADI has been allocated to the DL-compound. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including ”DL-” in the INS name.**	350 (ii)	Sodium Malate
Monosodium L-glutamate	The ADI has been allocated to the L-compounds. In addition, glutamic acid in both the INS and in the Codex specifications is identified as the L-form. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including ”L-” in the INS names.**	621	Monosodium Glutamate
Monopotassium L-glutamate		622	Monopotassium Glutamate
Monoammonium L-glutamate		624	Monoammonium Glutamate

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART VII – Use of Nomenclature - continued			
Magnesium di-L-glutamate	The ADI has been allocated to the di-L-compounds. In addition, glutamic acid in both the INS and in the Codex specifications is identified as the L-form. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the names in the INS list to "Magnesium di-L-glutamate" and "Calcium di-L-glutamate" respectively.**	625	Magnesium Glutamate
Calcium di-L-glutamate		623	Calcium Glutamate (D,L-)
5'-Inosinic acid	The INS is not consistent in naming. The designator "5'-" is included in the names for all other comparable substances. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider including "5'-" in the INS names.**	630	Inosinic Acid
Dipotassium 5'-inosinate		632	Potassium Inosinate

PART VIII - Miscellaneous

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
Aluminium powder	The difference is regarded minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	173	Aluminium
Sodium lactate (solution)	The difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	325	Sodium Lactate
Potassium lactate (solution)	The difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	326	Potassium Lactate
Chlorophylls	**Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the INS name to be consistent with both the specifications name and the naming of 141 Chlorophyllins**	140	Chlorophyll
	This substance is included in GSFA, however there is no adopted Codex specifications. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider adopting the JECFA specification "Carotenes (Vegetable)" for INS 160a(ii).**	160a(ii)	Carotenes, beta- (vegetable)
Tannic acid	Tannic acid is not identical to Tannins, food grade. The ADI was allocated to Tannic acid. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the name in INS to Tannic acid.**	181	Tannins, Food Grade

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART VIII – Miscellaneous continued			
Erythorbic acid	Erythorbic acid/ erythorbate were assigned as names for these substances in order to avoid confusion with ascorbic acid/ ascorbate. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the names to Erythorbic acid/ erythorbate as INS names.**	315	Isoascorbic Acid (Erythorbic Acid)
Sodium erythorbate		316	Sodium Isoascorbate
Isopropyl citrate mixture	The specifications were prepared before JECFA developed its principles for assigning names to substances. **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to reconsider the name.**	384	Isopropyl Citrates
Calcium disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate	The INS name is neither consistent with the specifications name nor with the INS name for 386 Disodium Ethylenediaminetetraacetate. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the INS name to Calcium disodium ethylenediamine-tetraacetate**	385	Calcium Disodium EDTA
Carrageenan	The text about salts and furcellaran in the INS name is superfluous (furcellaran and the salts are included in the specifications). **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the INS name to Carrageenan,**	407	Carrageenan and its Na, K, NH4, Ca and Mg Salts (includes Furcellaran)
Glycerol ester of wood rosin	This substance is <u>one</u> ester product of wood rosin (of which the rosin is composed of various chemical components). **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the INS name to Glycerol ester of wood rosin.**	445	Glycerol Esters of Wood Rosin
Sodium polyphosphates, glassy	The names in the specifications for polyphosphates are not consistent (e.g. calcium polyphosphate is singular). **Recommendation: JECFA should be asked to reconsider the naming of polyphosphates.**	452 (i)	Sodium Polyphosphate
Potassium polyphosphates		452 (ii)	Potassium Polyphosphate
Salts of fatty acids	The specifications for Salts of fatty acids only include the calcium, potassium and sodium salts. **Recommendation: The CCFA should investigate whether all salts mentioned in INS are used as food additives.**	470	Salts of Fatty Acids (with Base Al, Ca, Na, Mg, K, and NH4
Thermally oxidized soya bean oil interacted with mono- and diglycerides of fatty acids	The specifications name is more correct than the INS name. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider using the specification name as the INS name**.	479	Thermally Oxidized Soya Bean Oil with Mono- and Di – Glycerides of Fatty Acids

Codex specifications (CAC/MISC 6)	Questions/suggestions	INS list (CAC/GL-35)	
Title of specifications		**INS No.**	**Name**
PART VIII – Miscellaneous - continued			
Magnesium hydroxide carbonate	The INS name contains an error. The substance used as a food additive is a basic magnisum carbonate. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider changing the name in the INS to the specifications name.**	504 (ii)	Magnesium Hydrogen Carbonate
Ammonia solution	Ammonia hydroxide is a synonym in the specifications. The difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	527	Ammonium Hydroxide
Bone phosphate	The explanatory text in the bracket is superfluous. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider deleting the bracket.**	542	Bone Phosphate (Essentially Calcium Phosphate, Tribasic)
Magnesium silicate (synthetic)	The difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	553 (i)	Magnesium Silicate
Shellac, bleached	Shellac, bleached is not identical to Shellac. Both bleached shellac and unbleached shellac are on the market. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider adding Shellac, bleached to the INS.**	904	Shellac
Hydrogenated poly-1-decene	**Recommendation: The CCFA consider changing the name in INS to Hydrogenated poly-1-decene**	907	Hydrogenated Poly–Decenes
Lysozyme hydrochloride	Lysozyme is generally prepared and used in hydrochloride form, however, Lysozyme is included in the specifications as a synonym. The difference is regarded as minor. **Recommendation: No action to be taken**	1105	Lysozyme
Polydextroses	The additional "A and N" is superfluous. The specifications cover both polydextrose (A) and polydextrose N. **Recommendation: The CCFA should consider using the specifications name as the INS name**.	1200	Polydextroses A and N

Annex 2

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS
LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS
LISTA DE PARTICIPANTES

CHAIRPERSON/PRESIDENT/PRESIDENTE

Ms Inge MEYLAND
Senior Scientific Adviser
DTU National Food Institute
Morkhoj Bygade 19
2860 Soborg
DENMARK
Tel.: +45 72 34 70 51
Fax.: +45 72 34 70 01
E-mail: ime@food.dtu.dk

MEMBER COUNTRIES

Brazil-Brésil-Brasil

Daniela ARQUETE
Expert on Regulation
Sepn 511 - Bloco A - Edifício Bittar II - Asa Norte
Brasília BRAZIL
Phone: +55 61 3448 6290
Fax: +55 61 3448 6274
E-mail: daniela.arquete@anvisa.gov.br

EC-CE

Michael SCANNELL
Head of Unit
Directorate General for Health and Consumer Protection
Rue Froissart 101, 2/54
B-1049 Brussels BELGIUM
Phone: +32 2 299.33.64
Fax: +32 2 299 85 66
E-mail: michael.scannell@ec.europa.eu

Finland-Finlande-Finlandia

Liisa RAJAKANGAS
Senior Adviser
Ministry of Trade and Industry
P.O.Box 32
FI-00023 Government FINLAND
Phone: +358 9 1606 3730
Fax: +358 9 1606 2670
E-mail: liisa.rajakangas@ktm.fi

Mongolia-Mongolie-Mongolia

Batsuuri NANTSAG
State Secretary of Ministry Food and Agriculture
Government Building, Peace avenue 16a
Ulaanbaatar-210349 MONGOLIA
Phone: +976 11 262802, +976 99115785
Fax: +976 11 452554, +976 11 262853
E-mail:
ng_batsuuri@yahoo.com/dkhishigjargal@yahoo.com/
n_odelger2006@yahoo.com

Poland-Pologne-Polonia

Mrs Anna Avraham
Food Safety CG Team
FDA Registrar Corp USA in East & Central Europe
tel. +48 791 660 299
foodsafetycg@hotmail.com

Serbia-Serbie

Ivan STANKOVIC
Professor of Bromatology and Food Safety Control
Instititute of Bromatology, Faculty of Pharmacy
450 Vojvode Stepe
11000 Belgrade SERBIA
Phone: +381 11 3970379
Fax: +381 11 3972840
E-mail: istank2003@yahoo.com

Switzerland-Suisse-Suiza

Michel DONAT
Head of Section Foodstuff and Commodities
Direction Unit Consumer Protection
Swiss Federal Office of Public Health
CH-3003 Bern SWITZERLAND
Phone: +41 31 322 95 81
Fax: +41 31 322 95 74
E-mail: michel.donat@bag.admin.ch

United Kingdom-Royaume-Uni-Reino Unido

Stephen JOHNSON
Head of Food Additives
Food Standards Agency
125,Kingsway,Aviation House, Room 506
London ENGLAND,WC2B 6NH
Phone: +44 20 7276 8508
Fax: +44 20 7276 8514
E-mail: stephen.johnson@foodstandards.gsi.gov.uk

United States of America-États-Unis d'Amérique Estados Unidos de América

Dennis KEEFE
Manager, International Activities
U.S.FDA, Center for Food Safety and Applied Nutrition, Office of Food Additive Safety
5100 Paint Branch Parkway
College Park, MD 20740-3835
USA
Phone: +1 301 436 1284
Fax: +1 301 436 2972
E-mail: dennis.keefe@fda.hhs.gov

Susan CARBERRY
Supervisory Chemist
U.S.FDA, Center for Food Safety & Applied Nutrition,
Office of Food Additive Safety;
5100 Paint Branch Parkway; HFS-265
College Park, MD 2740-3835 USA
Phone: +1 301 436 1269
Fax: +1 301 436 2972
E-mail: susan.carberry@fda.hhs.gov

Daniel E. FOLMER, Ph.D.
Review Chemist
U.S.FDA, Center for Food Safety and Applied
Nutrition, Office of Food Additive Safety
5100 Paint Branch Parkway
College Park, MD 20740-3835
USA
E-mail: daniel.folmer@fda.hhs.gov

Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN (FAO)

Annika WENNBERG
Senior Officer
FAO Joint Secretary to JECFA,
Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division,
FAO, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla
00153 Rome ITALY
Phone: +39 06 57053283
Fax: +39 06 57054593
E-mail: annika.wennberg@fao.org