CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION





Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy - Tel: (+39) 06 57051 - Fax: (+39) 06 5705 4593 - E-mail: codex@fao.org - www.codexalimentarius.org

Agenda Item 5(a)

CX/FA 14/46/8 December 2013

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Forty-sixth Session

Hong Kong, China, 17-21 March 2014

PROVISIONS IN TABLES 1 AND 2 OF TABLE 3 FOOD ADDITIVES WITH "EMULSIFIER, STABILIZER AND THICKENER" FUNCTION AND HORIZONTAL APPROACH - OUTSTANDING FROM 45TH CCFA

Prepared by the Codex Secretariat

Background

- 1. The 45th CCFA considered the provisions in Table 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) for those food additives in Table 3 with the function "acidity regulators" or "emulsifiers, stabilizers, thickeners" presented in CX/FA 13/45/7 by using an horizontal approach, i.e. to identify those food categories in the Annex to Table 3 in which the use of "acidity regulators" or "emulsifiers, stabilizers, thickeners" was technologically justified and those food categories in which it was not.
- 2. The 45th CCFA completed consideration food additives in Table 3 with the function "acidity regulators," but due to time constraints, was only able to consider food additives in Table 3 with the function "emulsifiers, stabilizers, thickeners" and developing the horizontal approach for food categories up to 06.1 "Whole, broken or flaked grain, including rice". Therefore, the 45th CCFA agreed to request the 46th CCFA physical Working Group (p-WG) on the GSFA, to consider the remaining parts of the document i.e. from food category 06.2 "Flours and starches (including soybean powder)" up to and including food category 14.1.5 "Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusion, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa".
- 3. With regard to the horizontal approach, the 45th CCFA could not come to an agreement on whether food additives with a function of "stabilizer" or "thickener" were justified for use in surface-treated vegetables in food category 04.2.1.2 "Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes (including soybeans) and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds", and agreed to request the 46th CCFA p-WG on the GSFA, to reconsider the horizontal approach for this food category along with food category 04.1.1.2 "Surface treated fresh fruit", where the use of these additives had been previously determined by the Committee to be justified for use in glazes, coatings and decorations.²
- 4. The 45th CCFA also agreed that the provisions regarding food category 14.2.3 "Grape wines" and its subcategories would be considered by an electronic Working Group (e-WG) led by France,³ and that the provisions regarding food categories 01.1.1 "Milk and buttermilk (plain)", 01.1.1.1 "Milk (plain)", 01.1.1.2 "Buttermilk (plain)" and 01.1.2 "Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drink)" would be considered by an e-WG led by New Zealand.⁴ The reports of the two e-WGs are presented in CX/FA 14/46/10 (Agenda Item 5(c)) and CX/FA 14/46/11 (Agenda Item 5(d)).

Provisions for consideration by the 46th CCFA

- 5. Appendix 1 of this document compiles the provisions in Tables 1 and 2 of Table 3 food additives with "emulsifier, stabilizer and thickener" function that are outstanding from the 45th CCFA (with the exception of those provisions that have been considered by the two eWGs mentioned above), and describes the horizontal approach for the justification of the use of the additives in each food category.
- 6. Appendix 2 presents the technological justification for the use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners in food categories contained in the Annex to Table 3 for the food categories that have been discussed at the 45th CCFA.

² REP13/FA, paras. 82-83.

¹ REP13/FA, para. 85.

³ REP13/FA, para. 76.

⁴ REP13/FA, para. 77.

CX/FA 14/46/8 2

7. Appendix 3 presents the "Working Principles for Consideration of Table 3 Food Additives with Emulsifier, Stabilizer and Thickener function," which was agreed to by the 45th CCFA, to facilitate the discussion of the Committee.

Appendix 1: Emulsifiers, Stabilizers and Thickeners

Food Category No. 04.1.1.2 (Surface treated fresh fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: 143-1985: allows only glycerol and sorbitol (INS 420) at GMP (Standard does not address coatings)

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with Note 16 "For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish." **Justification for proposal**: Comments by eWG members. Corresponding commodity standard does not address coatings.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Emulsifiers are used in wax coatings for citrus and other fruit Brazil: Case-by-Case

EU - the use of additives should be limited in fresh fruit; the EU wonders whether the justification is relevant for all the provisions listed

Spain: glazing agents of carriers are different functional classes from ES&T and not subject of WG discussion.

UK: is the use of an emulsifier on the surface of fresh-fruit a Codex additive function? It may be a carrier, or an additive in an additive, but neither of these appear to set a precedent for emulsifiers in this FC.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16 ⁵	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						ICGMA: adopt with note "for use as emulsifier"
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	16	7		ICGINA. adopt with note for use as emulsine
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		7		
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	GMP		7		
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	GMP		7		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7		
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7		
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7	adopt with Note 16	
GELLAN GUM	417	GMP		7		
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7		
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	16	7		AIDGUM: supports proposal
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL						
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: adopt with note "for use as emulsifier"
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7		
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7		
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7		

⁵ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

-

LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	16	7
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	16	7
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	16	7
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	16	7
MICROCRYSTALLINE				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	16	7
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES				
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	16	7
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	16	7
PECTINS	440	GMP		7
POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	GMP		7
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		7
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,			16 &	
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71 ⁶	7
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH				
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND		1		_
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP		7
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL		1		_
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	16	7
TARA GUM	417	GMP		7
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	7
XANTHAN GUM	413	GMP		7

Food Category No. 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 3 "surface treatment"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: no corresponding commodity standards, Comments in CX/FA12/44/9 Add. 2 from ICGMA: ES&T are technologically justified in FC 04.2.1.2 are used to thicken & stabilize the film forming mixture in order that it adheres to the surface of the fresh fruit/veg.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Stabilizers are technologically justified for use in surface-treated vegetables. Modified food starches are typically used with components such as organic acids (lemon juice, citric, etc) and coating agents in spray applications to thicken and stabilize the film forming mixture in order that it adhere to the surface of the fresh fruits and vegetables.

Brazil: Case-by-Case

EU: case-by-case; the category 04.2.1.2 limits the use of glazing agents to nuts only (note 79);

⁶ **Note 71:** Calcium, potassium and sodium salts only.

> it should be reflected when considering the provisions below; the provisions not related to nuts should be disregarded **UK**: agrees with proposal

	1		1		UK. agrees with proposal	
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16	7	Adamt with mate 40 9 2	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					Adopt with note 16 & 3	
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	16	7		
AGAR	406	GMP		7		ICGMA: accept proposal
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		7	A damt with mate 2	
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	GMP		7]	
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	4 ⁷ & 16	7	Adopt with note 4, 16 & 3	
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	800	58 ⁸	7	A -l	Brazil: supports proposal
CALCIUM SULFATE	516	800	58	7	Adopt with note 3 & 58	Brazil: supports proposal
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7	A -1 4 4 O	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID					Adamt with mate 40 9 2	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7	A dant with note 2	
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	83000	79		Adopt with note 79 & 3	AIDGUM: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL					Adopt with note 16.9.2	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: accept proposal
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7	Adopt with hote 3	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	16	7	Adopt with hote to a 3	
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	16	7		
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4	Adopt with note 3	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	16	7		
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	16	7]	
MICROCRYSTALLINE					Adopt with note 16 & 3	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	16	7		
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	471	GMP	16	7		

⁷**Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product. ⁸ **Note 58:** As calcium.

OF FATTY ACIDS						
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: accept proposal
PECTINS	440	GMP		7	A dent with note 2	
POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN						
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7		
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					A dant with nate 2	
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH					Adopt with note 16, 71 &	
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,			16 &		3	
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7		
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH						
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND					Adopt with note 16 & 3	
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7		
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL					Adopt with note 16 & 3	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	16	7	Adopt with hote 10 & 3	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					Adopt with note 3	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP			•	
TARA GUM	417	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	AIDGUM: supports adoption
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	16	7	•	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP		7	Adopt with note 3	
CALCIUM GLUCONATE	578	800	58	7	Adopt with note 3 & 58	
CALCIUM HYDROXIDE	526	800	58	7	Adopt with hote 3 & 38	
MAGNESIUM CARBONATE	504(i)	GMP	16	7		
MAGNESIUM HYDROXIDE	528	GMP	16	7		
MAGNESIUM HYDROXIDE				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
CARBONATE	504(ii)	GMP	16	7	Adopt with note 16 & 3	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN						
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	16	7		
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	16	7		
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	2000			Adopt with note 3	

Food Category No. 06.2 (Flours and starches (including soybean powder))

Corresponding commodity standards: None; subcategory 06.2.1 has corresponding commodity standards

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified - Move all provisions to FC 06.2.1 with Note 186⁹ "for use in flours with additives only" **Justification for proposal**: No provisions in FC 06.2.2 for ES&T.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, Spain: Supports proposal, move to subcategory 06.2.1 with Note 186 Emulsifiers and stabilizers are needed for flours in general.

EU, UK: not justified

					EU, UK: Not justilled	
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Discontinue, keep GMP	
					provision in 06.2.1 add	
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58	4	note 186	
					Discontinue, adopt in	
					06.2.1 at 2000 mg/kg	
					with note 186 - allowed in	ICGMA: soy flour requires lecithin as emulsifier
					wheat flour at 2000	ICOMA. Soy flour requires recitifin as enfulsifier
					mg/kg in CODEX STAN	
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000		7	152-1985	
					Discontinue, adopt in	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP		4	06.2.1 with new note 186	

Food Category No. 06.2.1 (Flours)

Corresponding commodity standards: 301R-2011: references FC 06.2.1 Tables 1 & 2; 176-1989, 154-1985, 173-1989, 170-1989, 178-1991, 155-1985: do not discuss food additives; 152-1985: only lists enzymes and flour treatment agents

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with Note 186 "for use in flours with additives"

Justification for proposal: Comments from Brazil

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: Supports proposal, Emulsifiers and stabilizers are needed for flours in general. **EU, UK:** guestions technological need

Spain: use of additives as flour treatment agents is not an ES&T function

						nodi trodunoni agonto lo not an Eoa i fanotion
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	57 ¹⁰	7		
CALCIUM SULFATE	516	GMP	57	7	Adopt with notes 57 and 186	USA: calcium sulfate is allowed in flour as a bleaching agent up to 60000 mg/kg EU: bleaching agent is not a ES&T function
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000			Adopt at 2000 mg/kg with note 186 - allowed in wheat flour at 2000 mg/kg in CODEX STAN	ICGMA: soy flour requires lecithin as emulsifier, add note "for use in soy flour"

⁹ **Note 186:** For use in flours with additives only.

¹⁰ **Note 57:** GMP is 1 part benzoyl peroxide and not more than 6 parts of the subject additive by weight.

				152-1985	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP		Adopt with note 186	

Food Category No. 06.2.2 (Starches)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

<u>eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category</u>: Not Justified <u>Justification for proposal</u>: No provisions for ES&T listed in GSFA

<u>Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal</u>:

<u>Brazil, EU, Spain</u>: Supports proposal

Food Category No. 06.4.1 (Fresh pastas and noodles and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified **Justification for proposal**: comments by eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add 2. - Emulsifiers, thickeners, and stabilizers are commonly used in fresh pasta to improve binding and reduce cooking loss

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, Costa Rica, IFAC, ICGMA: supports proposal, emulsifiers and stabilizers are used for binding

EU: Case-by-Case; does not object to the use in noodles, however, for pastas the EU supports only INS 322(i) Lecithin and INS 471 'MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES OF FATTY ACIDS **Spain**: Case-by-Case: some EST are justified for fresh pastas, such as INS 322 or 471 but it should not be assumed that the use of all ESTs is justified. INS 415, 466, 472a, 472b, 472c were requested only in noodles and INS 1414, 1420 and 1422 are used only as T. Only a few uses for a few products have been requested. In EU legislation only INS 322 and 471 are allowed in "fresh pasta".

Consider use of Note 211¹¹ "for use in noodles only"

						,
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
						EU: restrict to noodles
						Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 12000 mg/kg to improve
AGAR	406	GMP		4		elasticity
						EU: restrict to noodles
						Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 10000 mg/kg to improve
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		4		elasticity
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58	4		EU: restrict to noodles
					Adopt	EU: restrict to noodles
						Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 10000 mg/kg to improve
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		4		elasticity
						EU: restrict to noodles
						Japan : used in noodles as stabilizer up to 30000 mg/kg to improve
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		4		elasticity
						EU: restrict to noodles
CURDLAN	424	GMP		4		Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 10000 mg/kg to improve

¹¹ **Note 211:** For use in noodles only.

_

				elasticity
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	200	4	EU: restrict to noodles
210171110011111111111111111111111111111		200	· ·	EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 16000 mg/kg to improve
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP	4	elasticity
CLLE/ (IV COIV)	710	Olvii	-	EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 10000 mg/kg to improve
GUAR GUM	412	GMP	4	elasticity
GOAR GOM	412	Givii	+	EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 5000 mg/kg to improve
				elasticity
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	4	AIDGUM supports adoption
GUINI ARABIC (ACACIA GUINI)	414	GIVIP	4	EU: restrict to noodles
ICA DANCA OLINA	440	OMB.		Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 8000 mg/kg to improve
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP	4	elasticity
				EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 16000 mg/kg to improve
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP	4	elasticity
				EU: supports adopt
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 8000 mg/kg to improve
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	4	elasticity
MICROCRYSTALLINE				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	4	EU: restrict to noodles
				EU, EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES				Japan: used in noodles as emulsifer up to 2200 mg/kg to avoid
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	4	retrogradation of starch.
PECTINS	440	GMP	4	EU: restrict to noodles
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH				
PHOSPHATE	1413	200	4	EU: restrict to noodles
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	4	EU: restrict to noodles
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA	` '			
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	4	EU: restrict to noodles
		_		EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 20000 mg/kg to improve
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	4	elasticity
0001011171121117112		- C	<u> </u>	EU: restrict to noodles
				Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 20000 mg/kg to improve
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				elasticity
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	50000	4	Bioploymer: adopt at 10,000 mg/kg
CLLLULUSE (CELLULUSE GUIVI)	400	30000	+ +	EU: restrict to noodles
TDACACANTH CUM	440	GMP		Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 5000 mg/kg to improve
TRAGACANTH GUM	413		4	elasticity Eth restrict to peoples
XANTHAN GUM	415	10000	4	EU: restrict to noodles

		Japan: used in noodles as stabilizer up to 10000 mg/kg to improve
		elasticity

Food Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified **Justification for proposal**: comments by eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add 2. by Brazil - stabilizers are necessary to prevent changes on the structure of dried pastas due to heat treatment

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, Costa Rica, IFAC, ICGMA: supports proposal, emulsifiers and stabilizers are used for binding

EU: does not object to the use in noodles, however, for pastas the EU in only gluten free pasta and pasta intended for hypoproteic diets

Spain: add note 122 "for use in noodles only". INS 1414, 1420 and 1422 are used only as T and 1400 as E/S by the industry. We would like to know if in Brazil these additives are used in all kinds of dried pastas since in the EU legislation additives are only allowed in "gluten free and/or pasta intended for hypoproteic diets"

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		7]	
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	GMP		7]	
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	GMP		7]	
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58	4]	
CALCIUM SULFATE	516	5000		7]	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7]	
CARRAGEENAN	407	8330	37 ¹²	7]	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	200		4]	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7		
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7		
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		7	Adopt	AIDGUM: supports adoption
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7		
KONJAC FLOUR	425	10000		7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000		7		
MANNITOL	421	GMP		7		
MICROCRYSTALLINE						
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		7		
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES						EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	30000		7		LI LINA, LLC. accepts proposal
PECTINS	440	GMP		7		
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH						
PHOSPHATE	1413	200		4		

¹² **Note 37:** As weight of nonfat milk solids.

-

POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	GMP		7
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	2600		7
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP		4
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	8330	37	7
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP		7
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP		7
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	50000		4
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP		4
TARA GUM	417	GMP		7
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP		7
XANTHAN GUM	415	10000		4

Food Category No. 08.1 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified move to FC 08.1.1 with Note 16 and FC 08.1.2 without adding Note 16

Justification for proposal: No consensus in comments to eWG; in CX/FA 12/44/9

Add 2. - Brazil: No food additives should be allowed in Food Category 08.1, except colors with Note 4 and 16

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: some are used to manage water holding and for texture-thickening Brazil, EU, Spain, UK: supports proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
						Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to manage water holding and texture-
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7		thickener
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7]	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7	Discontinue - move to FC	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7	08.1.1 with Note 16 and	ICGMA: supports adoption
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4	FC 08.1.2 without adding	ICGMA: supports adoption
PECTINS	440	GMP		7	note	ICGMA: supports adoption
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					1	ICCMA, aupporta adaption
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		4		ICGMA: supports adoption
TARA GUM	417	GMP		7]	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP		7]	

Food Category No. 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with Note 16 "For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish" **Justification for proposal**: most provisions and eWG comments in favor of use involve use of ES&T in glazes (Note 16 "For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish")

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: use not justified

Costa Rica, ICGMA: some are used to manage water holding and for texture-thickening EU: the use of additives in fresh meat should be limited to colours for health marking; the EU opposes to any other uses; it should be discussed at Codex level how to deal with food additives needed in this food category

Spain: use of additives as glazing agents or carriers is not ES&T function

UK: supports proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH]	
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	16	7		
AGAR	406	GMP				
			4 ¹³ &			
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	16	7		
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	15000		7		
]	Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to manage water holding and texture-
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP				thickener
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID]	ICCMA: aupporte adoption
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP				
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	16	7	Adopt as listed with Note	ICGMA, AIDGUM: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	16	7	16	ICGMA: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL						ICCMA cupports adoption
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP				AIDGUM: supports adoption
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP				ICGMA: supports adoption
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	2260		7]	
MANNITOL	421	GMP]	ICGMA: supports adoption
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	16	7]	ICGMA: supports adoption
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption

¹³ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

MICROCRYSTALLINE		1		1		
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	100(1)	- C.V.II	10		1	
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	16	7	1	
PECTINS	440	GMP	1.0		1	ICGMA: supports adoption
					1	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN					1	ICGMA: supports adoption
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA						ICGMA: supports adoption
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP]	ICGMA. Supports adoption
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH						
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,			16 &	_		
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	1	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH						
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7		
SODIUM	470(11)	GIVIP	16	/	-	Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to manage water holding and texture-
						thickener
						USA: sodium alginate is allowed for use in the US as a film forming
						agent in freshly dressed meat carcarses up to 15000 mg/kg of the
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	15000		7		carcass weight (9CFR 424.21(c))
OODIGIN ALCHIVATE	101	10000		,	1	USA: sodium carboxymethyl cellulose is allowed for use in the US
						as a film forming agent in freshly dressed meat carcarses up to
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL						15000 mg/kg of the carcass weight (9CFR 424.21(c)).
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	15000		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
					Adopt at 500 mg/kg with	USA: sodium citrate is allowed for use in the USA on fresh meat
					Note 16 and new note	cuts as a color retention agent up to 500 mg/kg
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					"for use as a color	ICGMA: supports adoption at GMP with note 16
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	16	7	retention agent"	Tooma. Supports adoption at Olim With Hote To
TARA GUM	417	GMP			Adopt as listed with Note	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	7	- 16	AIDGUM supports adoption
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	16	7		ICGMA: supports adoption
					Adopt at 500 mg/kg with	USA: sodium citrate is allowed for use in the USA on fresh meat
					Note 16 and new note	cuts as a color retention agent up to 500 mg/kg
TDISODIUM CITDATE	224/;;;)	F000		7	"for use as a color	ICGMA: supports adoption as listed with Note 16
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	5000		7	retention agent"	·
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP			Adopt as listed with Note 16	
AANTIAN GUW	413	GIVIF		L	10	

Food Category No. 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified **Justification for proposal**: comments by some eWG members indicate that ES&T are used in this food category, CX/FA 12/44/9 Add 1 recommends use of ES&T generally justified in FC 08.1.2, technological justification cited

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: ES&T not justified in fresh products

Costa Rica. ICGMA: some ES&T are used to manage water holding and for texture-thickening **EU**: the use of additives in fresh meat should be limited to colours for health marking; the EU opposes to any other uses; no justification provided for this category

Spain, UK: requests further information on use

ELC: This category according to the FC descriptor, is eligible for certain food additives only: marking/branding (colors) and in glazings; waterbinding etc. is according to our understanding an extended product which would belong to FC 8.2 subcategories.

ICGMA: modified food starch is used as a thickener in injected and tumbled poultry and in sausage-type products

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
AGAR	406	GMP				
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	1500	4 & 16	7		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7		
010010551111	407	0110				Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to manage water holding and texture-
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP				thickener
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID	470	0145		_		
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP				
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7	adopt as listed	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		7	adopt as listed	AIDGUM, ICGMA: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL						
CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP		7		
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP				
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP				ICGMA: supports adoption
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP		7		
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption
MANNITOL	421	GMP				ICGMA: supports adoption
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP		7		ICGMA: supports adoption

METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
MICROCRYSTALLINE					
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES					
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP		7	
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
PECTINS	440	GMP			ICGMA: supports adoption
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN					
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP		7	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					ICCMA: aumorto adantian
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP			ICGMA: supports adoption
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC					
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH					
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,					
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH					
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND					
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP		7	
					Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to manage water holding and texture
					thickener
					USA : sodium alginate is allowed in ground and formed raw poult
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	8000		7	pieces in the US as a binder and extender up to 12400 mg/kg
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL					
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
TARA GUM	417	GMP			
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP		7	
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP		7	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP		7	ICGMA: supports adoption
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP			

Food Category No. 09.1 (Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; 292-2008 corresponds to subcategory 09.1.2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal:** No information supporting use provided in eWG

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU: not appropriate at this parental food category. Moreover, additives are generally not permitted in CS 292-2008. The glazing therein refers to applying a protective coating of ice (ice glaze) to frozen seafood products. If additives were used in this process they would have been mentioned in the standard.

Spain: glazing agents or carriers are not an ES&T function

UK: provisions in parent category should be discontinued as may conflict with subcategories **ELC**: humectants are technologically justified in frozen and deep-frozen fish only to avoid thawing losses. Labeling of non-prepackaged food is subject to national legislation. However this document is restricted to deal with emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners only.

A al alligione	INIC	Max Level	Matax	Step /		Comments by WO mark and mark and all
Additive	INS	(mg/kg)	Notes	Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	16	7		
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		4		
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7		
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7		
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	16	7		AIDGUM supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL						
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	16	7		
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		4	Discontinue	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	16	7		
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	16	7		
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4		
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	16	7		
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	16	7		
MICROCRYSTALLINE						
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	16	7		
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES						
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	16	7		
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	16	7		
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN	332(i)	GMP		7		

CITRATE						
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7	7	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA						
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		4		
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH						
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,			16 &			
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	_	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH						
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND						
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7	_	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP		4	_	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL						
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	4466	GMP	16	7		
					Refer to discussion on	
					Appendix 2, possibly	
OOD!!!M D!! IV/DDOOFN!					used as Acidity	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN	004(")	OMB		-	Regulator, if not	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP		7	Discontinue	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP		4	Discontinue	AIDOUNG
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	/		AIDGUM supports adoption
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP		7	Refer to discussion on	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP		7	Appendix 2, possibly	
					used as Acidity	
TD100D11114 01TD 4TE	004("")	0.45		_	Regulator, if not	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP		7	Discontinue	

Food Category No. 09.1.1 (Fresh fish)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified	Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:
<u>Justification for proposal:</u> No information supporting use provided in eWG	EU: does not support
	Spain: use discussed (glazing agents, carriers or water retention agents) are not ES&T
	functions, may mislead consumers
	ELC: humectants are technologically justified in frozen and deep-frozen fish only to avoid
	thawing losses. Labelling of non-prepackaged food is subject to national legislation. However
	this document is restricted to deal with emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners only.

Food Category No. 09.1.2 (Fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: 292-2008: food additives not allowed in live bivalve molluscs, only antioxidants allowed in raw bivalve molluscs (chilled shucked molluscs) as per provisions in FC 09.1.2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal:** No technological justification supporting use provided in eWG

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU: additives are generally not permitted in CS 292-2008. The glazing therein refers to applying a protective coating of ice (ice glaze) to frozen seafood products. If additives were used in this process they would have been mentioned in the standard.

Spain: glazing agents, carriers or water retention agents are not an ES&T function, may mislead consumers

ELC: humectants are technologically justified in frozen and deep-frozen fish only to avoid thawing losses. Labeling of non-prepackaged food is subject to national legislation. However this document is restricted to deal with emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners only.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	4 & 16	7	Discontinue	IFAC: adopt as listed

Food Category No. 09.2 (Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; subcategories have corresponding commodity standards

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified - discontinue provisions and move to subcategories

<u>Justification for proposal:</u> several subcategories require notes specific to those

subcategories or the use of ES&T is not justified

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Spain: supports proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		4		
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58	4		
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58	4		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7		
DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	1400	GMP		4		
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7		
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		4	Discontinue - move to	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7		
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7	appropriate subcategories	
MICROCRYSTALLINE					Subcategories	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	10000		7		
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES						
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	10000		7		
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP		4		
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP		4		
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP		4		

Food Category No. 09.2.1 (Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: Frozen 092-1981, 95-1981, 190-1995: does not allow ES&T; 165-1989: allows INS 401 as water retention agent in all fish products, in minced fish only allows thickeners (INS 412, 410, 440, 466, 415, 407, 407a, 461 @ GMP) and INS 331 & 332 as acidity regulators; 36-1981: allows specific antioxidants; 191-1995: does not allow food additives; 292-2008: food additives not allowed in live bivalve molluscs, only antioxidants allowed in raw bivalve molluscs (raw frozen molluscs) as per provisions in FC 09.2.1. - None of these standards discuss glazing ingredients

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified, when used in fish meat requires note "for use as texturizing agent"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Although the CODEX STANs which correspond to this FC only allow ES&Ts in very limited products (minced fish), comments from the eWG on specific food additive provisions indicate that ES&Ts are used in this FC by several Codex Members

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: does not support the use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners in this food category. The use of such food additives as water retention agents may lead to fraud and misleading of the consumers. The justification provided is for battered products, therefore the corresponding provisions should be discussed under subcategory 09.2.2.

EU: does not support. The textural properties of fish relate to its freshness. The use of "texturizing agents" in whole fish would therefore mislead the consumer. Furthemore, there is a conflict with several CSs

UK: accept all initial proposals

IFAC: Thickeners and stabilizers are used in this FC to protect the product from structure changes during the freeze-thaw cycles during handling and storage, by decreasing the freezing point depression

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7	Adopt with new note "for	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					use as texturizing agent"	
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP		7		
AGAR	406	20000	3 ¹⁴ & 53 ¹⁵	7	Adopt as listed	
					Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with new note ""for use as texturizing agent"	IFAC: 7500 mg/kg needed to protect from structure changes during freeze/thaw Marinalg: GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during
ALGINIC ACID	400	5000		7		handling & storage,
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP			Adopt with new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
					Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with new note ""for use as texturizing agent"	IFAC: 7500 mg/kg needed to protect from structure changes during freeze/thaw Marinalg: GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	5000		7		handling & storage,
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	5000		7	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with new note ""for use as	IFAC: 7500 mg/kg needed to protect from structure changes during freeze/thaw

¹⁴ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

¹⁵ **Note 53**: For use in coatings only.

					texturizing agent"	Marinalg : GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during handling & storage,
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	95 ¹⁶	7	Adopt as listed - note 95 excludes use from products covered by commodity standards which do not allow ES&T	
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58		Adopt as listed with new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP			Adopt with note 61 - corresponds to Codex STAN 165-1989	
CARRAGEENAN	407	5000	61 ¹⁷	7	Adopt at GMP with new note "for use as texturizing agent" (no Note 61) - GMP & Note 61 Corresponds to CODE STAN 165-1989, but Note 61 would restrict note to minced fish only which does not cover use from Marinalg comment	IFAC: GMP with Note 61 corresponds to codex stan 165-1989 Marinalg: GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during handling & storage,
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7	Adopt with new note "for	
DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	1400	20000	3 & 53	7	use as texturizing agent" Adopt as listed	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP	0 4 00	•	Adopt with new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
GUAR GUM	412	GMP	61 & 73 ¹⁸	7	Adopt with Note 61 and new note "as glaze thickener for frozen crab" - see comments from Japan, Note 61 Corresponds to CODE STAN 165-1989, Note 73 not necessary	Japan: supports proposal - added to improve adhesion of glaze to crab, CODEX STAN 165-1989 does not cover frozen crab.
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	13	7	Adopt with new note "for	AIDGUM supports adoption

Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.
 Note 61: For use in minced fish only.
 Note 73: Except whole fish.

HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	1	7	use as texturizing agent"	
	403	GIVIP		1	use as texturizing agent"	
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	464 1440	GMP		7	-	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		/	-	AIDGUM supports adoption
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP			-	AIDGOM Supports adoption
	425	GWP			-	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID	4701	OMB.		-		
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP		7	-	
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP		7	-	
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP		7	_	
MANNITOL	421	GMP		7		
					Adopt as listed -	
1457111/4 0511111 005	404	0.45		_	Corresponds to CODE	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	61	7	STAN 165-1989	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP		/	-	
MICROCRYSTALLINE	400(:)	40000				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	10000			Adopt with new note "for	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	4-4	40000			use as texturizing agent"	
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	10000			4	
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP		7		
					Adopt at GMP with note	
					61 - GMP and note 61	
DE OTIVIO	4.40	00000	4.0	_	corresponds to CODEX	1510 0115 iii
PECTINS	440	20000	16	7	STAN 165-1989	IFAC: GMP with note 61 corresponds to Codex Stan 165-1989
DOLLYDEY/TDOOFO	4000	0.45		_	Adopt with new note "for	
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP		7	use as texturizing agent"	M. 1.1 1540 OMD 7500 // 1 1 1 1 / 1
					Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with	Marinalg, IFAC: GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing
BOTA COULINA AL CINIA TE	400	5000		-	new note ""for use as	point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles
POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	5000		7	texturizing agent"	during handling & storage,
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP			Adopt with new note "for	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	30000		7	use as texturizing agent"	
DOTAGOU HA BUNGBOOFN					Adopt with note 61 -	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN	000(1)	0.45		_	corresponds to Codex	
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	61	7	STAN 165-1989	
DOWNERS OF LUI OOF	400(**)	0145		_	Adopt with new note "for	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP		7	use as texturizing agent"	
					Adopt at GMP with new	
					note "for use as	
					texturizing agent" - GMP	IEAO OMB W. COA
					with note 61 corresponds	IFAC: GMP with note 61 corresponds to Codex Stan 165-1989
DD 005005D 51:0::5::::					to CODEX STAN 165-	Marinalg: GMP needed; decreases freezing point depression,
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA	407	5000		_	1989 but Note 61 does	protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during handling &
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	5000		7	not address Marinalg's	storage,

					use in all fish	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH AMMONIA, CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	Adopt with note 71 & new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP		7	Adopt with new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	5000		7	Adopt at GMP - corresponds to CODEX STAN 165-1989	IFAC: GMP corresponds to Codex Stan 165-1989 Marinalg: GMP or 7500 mg/kg needed; decreases freezing point depression, protects structure during freeze-thaw cycles during handling & storage,
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP		7	Adopt with note 61 - corresponds to Codex STAN 165-1989	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN CITRATE	331(i)	GMP		7	Adopt with note 61 - corresponds to Codex STAN 165-1989	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP			Adopt with new note "for use as texturizing agent"	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	73	7	Adopt as listed	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP		7	Adopt with new note "for	AIDGUM supports adoption
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP		7	use as texturizing agent"	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP		7	Adopt with note 61 - corresponds to Codex STAN 165-1989	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP		7		
					Adopt at GMP with Note 61 and new note "as glaze thickener for frozen crab" - see comments from Japan, Note 61 Corresponds to CODE	Japan: supports proposal - added to improve adhesion of glaze to crab, CODEX STAN 165-1989 does not cover frozen crab. Biopolymer, IFAC: adopt at GMP with note 61 to align with Codex
XANTHAN GUM	415	160		7	STAN 165-1989	Stan 165-1989

Food Category No. 09.2.2 (Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: 166-1989: allows specific additives in coatings: (Thickeners: INS 401, 412, 410, 440, 466, 415, 407, 407a, 461, 463, 464, 465 @ GMP), INS 471 & 322 as emulsifiers, INS 501 as leavening agent, and modified starches (INS 1401, 1402, 1404, 1410, 1412, 1414, 1413, 1420, 1421, 1422, 1440, 1442) 166-1989: allows INS 401 as water retention agent in fish fillets and minced fish, in minced fish only allows thickeners (INS 412, 410, 440, 466, 415, 407, 407a, 461 @ GMP) and INS 331 & 332 as acidity regulators

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified with Note 41¹⁹ "Use in breading or batter coatings only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: CODEX STAN 166 allow use of specific thickeners in batter.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

comments in CX/FA 12/44/9 add 2 for FC 09.2 - Thickeners and stabilizers are used in batters to improve adhesion, reduce fat uptake during frying and improve the crispiness of the batter. They also protect the product from structure changes during the freeze-thaw cycles during handling and storage, by decreasing the freezing point depression.

EU: supports use only in batter coatings

UK: accepts all initial proposals

ICGMA: modified food starches are used in breadings and batters as stabilizers

IFAC: supports proposal

		Max Level		Step /		
Additive	INS	(mg/kg)	Notes	Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Adopt as listed (also	
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					Adopt as listed -	
ADIPATE	1422	GMP	41	7	corresponds to CODEX	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					STAN 166-1989	
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	41	7		
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
ACID TREATED STARCH	1401	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
					Adopt with note 53	
					(limited in 9.2.1 to	
AGAR	406	GMP		7	coatings only)	
					Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP			all fish meat)	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
ALKALINE TREATED STARCH	1402	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	16	7	Adopt as listed (also	

¹⁹ **Note 41:** Use in breading or batter coatings only.

					listed in 09.2.1 with Note	
					95)	
					Adopt as listed (also	
		40000			listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58		all fish meat)	
					Adopt with notes 41 & 61	
					- in CODEX STAN 166-	
					1981 allowed in batter for	
					all fish products & in	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP			minced fish meat	
					Adopt with notes 41 & 61	
					- in CODEX STAN 166-	
					1981 allowed in batter for	
					all fish products & in	
					minced fish meat (also in	
0.000.0000000	407	0.45	41 &	_	09.2.1 for use in all fish	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP	61	7	meat)	
					Adopt as listed (also	
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID				_	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
					Adopt as listed (also	
DEVERNO DOLOTED OTABOLI	4.400	0.45		_	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	1400	GMP	41	7	coatings only)	
					Adopt as listed -	
DIOTA DOLL DI IOODI IA TE	4.440	0145		-	corresponds to CODEX	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1981	
					Adopt as listed (also	
OFILIANI OUM	440	OMB			listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP			coatings only)	
					Adopt at GMP with notes	
					41 & 61 - in CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 allowed	IFAC: GMP with note 61 corresponds to codex stan 166-1989
					in batter for all fish	'
	110	0000		_	products & in minced fish	
GUAR GUM	412	2000		7	meat	
					Adopt as listed (also	AIDOUM
CUM A DADIO (A CACIA CUM)	1,,,	0.45		-	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	AIDGUM: supports adoption
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
LIVEROVVEROENT OF LUI COS	400	OME		-	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	

					Adopt as listed -	
HYDROXYPROPYL DISTARCH					corresponds to CODEX	
PHOSPHATE	1442	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1981	
	1442	GIVIP	41	/		
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL	404	0145		_	Adopt as listed -	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	41	7	corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP			Adopt as listed (also	AIDGUM: supports adoption
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP			listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
	11 = 0				Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	16	7	Adopt as listed (also	
WAGNESIOW CHLORIDE	311	GIVIF	10	,	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4		
MANNITOL	421	GIVIP		4	all fish meat)	
			44.0		Adopt as listed -	
			41 &	_	corresponds to CODEX	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	61	7	STAN 166-1981	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
					Adopt as listed (listed in	
MICROCRYSTALLINE					09.2.1 for use in all fish	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	10000			meat)	
,	1				Adopt at GMP with note	
					41 - Corresponds to	
					CODEX STAN 166-1981	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES					(also listed in 09.2.1 for	
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	10000			use in all fish meat)	
C. T. T. T. No.DO					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
MONOSTARCH PHOSPHATE	1410	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1989	
WONOSTANGITETIOSFITATE	1410	GIVIF	41	'	Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
OVIDIZED OTABOLI	4404	OMB	144	7	STAN 166-1989 (also	
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	41	7	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	

		1			all fish meat)	
	1					
			44.0		Adopt as listed -	
			41 &	_	corresponds to CODEX	
PECTINS	440	GMP	61	7	STAN 166-1981	
					Adopt as listed -	
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH					corresponds to CODEX	
PHOSPHATE	1413	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1989	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	
					STAN 166-1989 (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	41	7	all fish meat)	
TOTAGGIONI GARBOTATE	001(1)	O IVII	- ''	•	Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP			fish all meat)	
FOTASSIUW CHLORIDE	300	GIVIF				
DOTA COLLIMA DILLIVODO COENT					Adopt as listed -	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN	000(1)	0.45		_	corresponds to CODEX	
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	61	7	STAN 166-1989	
					Adopt as listed -	
POTASSIUM HYDROGEN					corresponds to CODEX	
CARBONATE	501(ii)	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1989	
					Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
					Adopt at GMP with notes	
					41 & 61 - in CODEX	
					STAN 166-1981 allowed	
					in batter for all fish	
					products & in minced fish	IFAC: GMP with note 61 corresponds to codex stan 166-1989
					meat (also listed in	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					09.2.1 for use in all fish	
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	5000		7	meat)	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC	+01a	3000	+	,	meat)	
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH		1				
		1	16.9		Adopt so listed (-1	
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,	470(:)	OMB	16 &	_	Adopt as listed (also	
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH					all fish meat)	
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND			1	_		
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7		
					Adopt as listed -	
			41 &		complies with CODEX	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	99	7	STAN 166-1981	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL	466	GMP	41 &	7	Adopt as listed -	

CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)			61		complies with CODEX	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					STAN 166-1981	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	61	7		
					Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP			all fish meat)	
					Adopt as listed -	
					complies with CODEX	
STARCH ACETATE	1420	GMP	41	7	STAN 166-1981	
					Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 with note	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	73	7	73)	
					Adopt as listed (also	
					listed in 09.2.1 for use in	AIDGUM: supports adoption
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	7	all fish meat)	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	61	7	Adopt as listed -	
					complies with CODEX	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	61	7	STAN 166-1981	
					Adopt as listed -	
			41 &		complies with CODEX	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	61	7	STAN 166-1981	

Food Category No. 09.2.3 (Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal C Justification for proposal: no c				ied	UK: unclear how glazes are u	zontal classification proposal: used on minced fish products (note 16) used in creamed products as stabilizers
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP	16	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP	16	7	Adopt as listed	
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP				
	470(0)	0.45	1.0	_	Refer to discussion in Appendix 2 – possibly	
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	16	7	used as AR	
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58			
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	Adopt as listed	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP				

CITRIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	16	7		
DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	1400	GMP	1.0	•		
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP			1	
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7	1	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	16	7	1	AIDGUM: supports adoption
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP	16	7	1	
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL					1	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	16	7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	16	7	1	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP]	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP]	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID]	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP	16	7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	16	7		
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	16	7		
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4		
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	16	7		
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	16	7		
MICROCRYSTALLINE						
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	10000				
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES						
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	10000				
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	16	7		
PECTINS	440	GMP		7		
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN					Refer to discussion in	
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	16	7	Appendix 2 – possibly	
					used as AR (adopt with	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP			note 16)	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP	4.0			
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	16	7		
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA	407	ONE		-		
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		7	4	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH			16 &			
AMMONIA, CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7	Adopt as listed	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH	470(1)	GIVIF	7 1		-	
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND						
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	16	7		
SODIUM ALGINATE			10	4	1	
	1 401	I CIMP				
	401	GMP			1	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)		GMP	16	7		

					Refer to discussion in	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					Appendix 2 – possibly	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	16	7	used as AR	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP				
TARA GUM	417	GMP		7	Adopt as listed	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	16	7	Ι ΄	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	16	7	Refer to discussion in	
					Appendix 2 – possibly	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	16	7	used as AR	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP		7	Adopt as listed	

Food Category No. 09.2.4 (Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with notes 41 "Use in breading or batter coatings only." and 16 "For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish."

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: no corresponding commodity standard, technological justification provided in comments by eWG (general to FC and for specific

provisions) address use in coatings/glaze only

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: no technological justification provided

Costa Rica: modified starch in batters and breadings are used as stabilizers.

Spain: use as glazing agent or carrier not an ES&T function. No tech justification provided.

ICGMA: modified food starch are used as thickeners in this food category

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only"	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to blend fish paste with seasonings entirely for keeping the quality uniform. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in fish paste since fish paste is mixed with seasoning during processing of surimi products.
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						Japan: supports proposal, use improves viscosity for adhesion of
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP with notes	seasoning to fish
AGAR	406	GMP		7	16 & 41	
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP				
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58		Adopt as listed - used as AR- see Appendix 2	
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58		Adopt at GMP with notes	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP			16 & 41	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only"	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to maintain texture by retnetion of air in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with carrageenan during processing of surimi products.
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID	472c	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP with notes	

DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to maintain texture by retention of air in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with guar gum during processing of surimi products. Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to make texture smooth by keeping moisture in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with gum arabic during processing of surimi products. AIDGUM supports adoption Costa Rica: modified starch is used as a stabilizer in batters and breadings AIDGUM supports adoption
GUAR GUM 412 GMP 7 Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM) HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE 463 GMP 7 HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL CELLULOSE 464 GMP 7 Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41 16 & 41 KARAYA GUM KONJAC FLOUR Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41 Adopt at GMP with notes 16 only " Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only"	used to maintain texture by retention of air in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with guar gum during processing of surimi products. Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to make texture smooth by keeping moisture in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with gum arabic during processing of surimi products. AIDGUM supports adoption Costa Rica: modified starch is used as a stabilizer in batters and breadings
GUAR GUM	used to maintain texture by retention of air in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with guar gum during processing of surimi products. Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to make texture smooth by keeping moisture in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with gum arabic during processing of surimi products. AIDGUM supports adoption Costa Rica: modified starch is used as a stabilizer in batters and breadings
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM) HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL CELLULOSE HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH KARAYA GUM KONJAC FLOUR Adopt at GMP Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41 Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL 472b GMP 7	used to make texture smooth by keeping moisture in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with gum arabic during processing of surimi products. AIDGUM supports adoption Costa Rica: modified starch is used as a stabilizer in batters and breadings
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL CELLULOSE 464 GMP 7 Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41 KARAYA GUM KONJAC FLOUR Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL LECITHIN 464 GMP 7 Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" 7 Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only"	breadings
CELLULOSE 464 GMP 7 Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41 HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH 1440 GMP 7 KARAYA GUM 416 GMP KONJAC FLOUR 425 GMP LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL 472b GMP LECITHIN 322(i) GMP 7	breadings
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	breadings
KONJAC FLOUR 425 GMP Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL 472b GMP 7 LECITHIN 322(i) GMP 7	AIDGUM supports adoption
Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL 472b GMP 7 LECITHIN 322(i) GMP 7	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL LECITHIN Comparison of the for use in summination products only in the formula of	
- ()	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to blend fish paste with seasonings entirely for keeping the quality uniform. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in fish paste since fish paste is mixed with seasoning during processing of surimi products.
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE 511 GMP 7	·
MANNITOL 421 GMP 4	
METHYL CELLULOSE 461 GMP 7	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE 465 GMP 7	
MICROCRYSTALLINE CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL) 460(i) 10000 Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	
OF FATTY ACIDS 471 10000	
OXIDIZED STARCH 1404 GMP 7	Costa Rica: modified starch is used as a stabilizer in batters and breadings
PECTINS Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only" 7	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to maintain texture by retnetion of air in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with pectin during processing of surimi

DOLVDEYTBOSES	1200	GMP	7	Adopt at GMP with notes	
POLYDEXTROSES POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN	1200	GIVIP	/	16 & 41	
CITRATE	222(:)	GMP	7	Adopt as listed - used as	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	332(i) 501(i)	GMP		AR - see Appendix 2	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP	-		
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	7	1	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA	460(11)	GIVIF		1	
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP			
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC	1014	<u> </u>			
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				Adopt at GMP with notes	
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				16 & 41	
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	7		
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH					
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND					
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	7		
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	4		
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				Adopt at GMP with new note "for use in summi products only"	Japan: add new note "for use in surimi products only" - additive is used to make texture smooth by keeping moisture in surimi products. Neither Note 16 nor Note 41 covers the use in surimi products since fish paste is mixed with additive during processing of surimi
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	7		products.
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				Adopt - used as AR, see	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7	Appendix 2	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP		Adopt at GMP with notes	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	7	16 & 41	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	7		AIDGUM: supports adoption
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP	7	Adopt - used as AR, see	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	7	Appendix 2	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7	• •	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7	Adopt at GMP with notes 16 & 41	Japan: supports proposal, additive improves viscosity for adhesion of seasoning sauce to fish

Food Category No. 09.2.4.1 (Cooked fish and fish products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with notes 41 and 16

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: no corresponding commodity standard, technological justification provided in comments in parent category address use in coatings/glaze only.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: no technological justification provided

Costa Rica, ICGMA: modified starch is used as a thickener.

Spain: use as glazing agent or carrier not an ES&T function. No tech justification provided.

UK: accept proposal

oy.						
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP		7	Discontinue, adopt in	
					parent FC 09.2.4 at GMP	
					with Notes 41, 16 -	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					similar provision in all	
SEAWEED (PES)	4 07a	5000		7	subcategories	

Food Category No. 09.2.4.2 (Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with notes 41 and 16

Justification for proposal: no corresponding commodity standard, technological justification provided in comments in parent category address use in coatings/glaze only.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: no technological justification provided

Costa Rica, ICGMA: modified starch is used as a thickener.

Spain: use as glazing agent or carrier not an ES&T function. No tech justification provided.

UK: accept proposal

5 <i>y</i> .						
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP		7	Discontinue, adopt in	
					parent FC 09.2.4 at GMP	
					with Notes 41, 16 -	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					similar provision in all	
SEAWEED (PES)	4 07a	GMP		4	subcategories	

Food Category No. 09.2.4.3 (Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with notes 41 and 16

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: no corresponding commodity standard, technological justification provided in comments in parent category address use in coatings/glaze only.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: no technological justification provided

Spain: use as glazing agent or carrier not an ES&T function. No tech justification provided.

UK: accept proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	16	7	Discontinue, adopt in	
					parent FC 09.2.4 at GMP	
					with Notes 41, 16 -	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA					similar provision in all	
SEAWEED (PES)	4 07a	GMP GMP		4	subcategories	

Food Category No. 09.2.5 (Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: 244-2004, 167-1989, 222-2001: do not list ES&T; 189-1993, 236-2003: food additives are not permitted

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified discontinue all provisions for ES&Ts in this food category

Justification for proposal: No information provided supporting use with exception of comment by Japan for Xantham gum - water retention would not appear to be necessary for foods covered by this FC

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil: no technological justification provided for use of ES&T in this food category

Spain: supports proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP		7	Discontinue	
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP		7	used as AR, refer to discussion in Appendix 2 - adopt with new note "except for use in foods covered by the following standards: 189-1993, 236-2003, 167-1989, 222-2001" and "not for use in salted atlantic herring and sprat"	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	Discontinue	

CITRIC AND FATTY ACID					1	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7		
GUAR GUM	412	GMP			-	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	+		-	
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP			-	
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL	463	GIVIP			-	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP		7	-	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID	1440	GIVIF	+		-	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP		7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	 	7	1	
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP			-	
MANNITOL MANNITOL	421	GMP		4	-	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP		7	-	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP			-	
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	+	7	-	
PECTINS	440	GMP	+	7	-	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	+		used as AR - refer to	
FOTASSIOWI CARBONATE	301(1)	GIVIF	+		discussion in Appendix 2	
					- adopt with new note	
					"except for use in foods	
					covered by the following	
					standards: 189-1993,	
					236-2003, 167-1989,	
					222-2001" and "not for	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN					use in salted atlantic	
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP		7	herring and sprat"	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP		7		
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA]	
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		4		
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH						
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,						
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP		7	Discontinue	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH						
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND						
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP		7		
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP		4	_	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				_		
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP		7		
					used as AR - refer to	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN	004(1)	0.45		_	discussion in Appendix 2	
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP		7	- adopt with new note	

TARA GUM TRAGACANTH GUM	417 413	GMP GMP	7	"except for use in foods covered by the following standards: 189-1993, 236-2003, 167-1989, 222-2001" and "not for use in salted atlantic herring and sprat" Discontinue	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE TRISODIUM CITRATE	332(ii) 331(iii)	GMP	7	used as AR, refer to discussion in Appendix 2 - adopt with new note "except for use in foods covered by the following standards: 189-1993, 236-2003, 167-1989, 222-2001" and "not for use in salted atlantic herring and sprat"	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7	Discontinue	Japan: add new note as "for use as stabilizer or texturizing agent". Xanthan gum is used to prevent separation of seasoning sauce and food by increasing adhesivness of the sauce, or to maintain texture by retaining water of the fish. Therefore, the term "stabilizer" should be added to new note.

Food Category No. 10.1 (Fresh eggs)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified Justification for proposal: No information provided supporting use of ES&T in this category

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Spain: supports proposal

Food Category No. 10.2.1 (Liquid egg products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified Justification for proposal: comments by eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 add 2: Thickeners and stabilizers are used to restore the viscosity that is typically lost

EU, UK, ICGMA, IFAC: supports proposal

through pasteurisation of liquid egg products

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
AGAR	406	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP	

				USA : calcium alginate is allowed for use in egg products as a
				stabilizer/thickener up to 6000 mg/kg
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	6000	7	Marlinga, IFAC: GMP for EU alignment
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP	7	<u> </u>
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP	7	ICGMA:used to control viscosity
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP	7	,
				Japan: agree, prevents coagulation of protein during pasteurization
GUAR GUM	412	GMP	7	ICGMA: used to control viscosity
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	7	AIDGUM: supports adoption
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP	7	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP	7	
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	7	
MICROCRYSTALLINE	`,			El Cuassanta proposal
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	7	ELC: accepts proposal
PECTINS	440	GMP	7	Japan: agree, prevents coagulation of protein during pasteurization
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP	7	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	4	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	7	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	4	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	4	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	7	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7	
				Japan: agree, prevents coagulation of protein during pasteurization
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7	ICGMA: used to control viscosity

Food Category No. 10.2.2 (Frozen egg products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified Justification for proposal: comments by eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 add 2: Thickeners and stabilizers are needed to provide freeze-thaw stability and restore lost viscosity that is typically lost through pasteurisation.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal: EU, UK, ICGMA, IFAC: supports proposal

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
AGAR	406	GMP		7	Adopt at GMP	

				USA: calcium alginate is allowed for use in egg products as a
				stabilizer/thickener up to 6000 mg/kg
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	6000	7	IFAC, Marlinga: GMP for EU alignment
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP	7	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP	7	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP	7	
				Japan: agree, prevents protein denatuation caused by freezir
GUAR GUM	412	GMP	7	ICGMA: to control viscosity
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	7	AIDGUM: supports adoption
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP	7	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP	7	
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	7	
MANNITOL	421	GMP	4	
MICROCRYSTALLINE				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	7	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	\			FFFILA I I I OND
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	7	EFEMA: adopt at GMP
PECTINS	440	GMP	7	Japan: agree, prevents protein denatuation caused by freezing
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP	7	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	4	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	7	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	4	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	4	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	7	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7	
				Japan: agree, prevents protein denaturation caused by freezi
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7	ICGMA: to control viscosity

Food Category No. 11.1 (Refined and raw sugars)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners; commodity standards for subcategories do not allow ES&T

<u>eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category</u>: Not Justified <u>Justification for proposal</u>: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.1 (White sugar, dextrose anhydrous, dextrose monohydrate, fructose)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.2 (Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified Justification for proposal: ODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, **EU**, **Iran**, **Spain**, **CEFS**: supports proposal **ICGMA**: modified food starch is used in this category

Food Category No. 11.1.3 (Soft white sugar, soft brown sugar, glucose syrup, dried glucose syrup, raw cane sugar)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.3.1 (Dried glucose syrup used to manufacture sugar confectionery)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified <u>Justification for proposal</u>: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.3.2 (Glucose syrup used to manufacture sugar confectionery)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

<u>eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category</u>: Not Justified <u>Justification for proposal</u>: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.4 (Lactose)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.1.5 (Plantation or mill white sugar)

Corresponding commodity standards: 212-1999: does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: CODEX STAN 212-1999 does not permit emulsifiers, stabilizers or thickeners.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Iran, Spain, CEFS: supports proposal

Food Category No. 11.2 (Brown sugar, excluding products of food category 11.1.3 (soft white sugar, soft brown sugar, glucose syrup, dried glucose syrup, raw cane sugar))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: comments to eWG that ES&T are not needed in this food category.

<u>Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:</u>

EU, Spain, UK, CEFS: supports proposal

food category.						
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
MICROCRYSTALLINE CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		4	Discontinue	UK, CEFS: discontinue - technological need questioned
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP		7		UK, CEFS: discontinue - technological need questioned

Food Category No. 11.3 (Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3 (soft white sugar, soft brown sugar, glucose syrup, dried glucose syrup, raw cane sugar))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

<u>eWG Proposal for Horizontal Class</u> <u>Justification for proposal</u> : comme food category.					Comments by eWG on EU, Spain, UK, CEFS: s	norizontal classification proposal: upports proposal
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
GELLAN GUM	418	500		7		UK, CEFS: discontinue - technological need questioned
MICROCRYSTALLINE CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		4	Discontinue	UK, CEFS: discontinue - technological need questioned
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP		7]	UK, CEFS: discontinue - technological need questioned

Food Category No. 11.4 (Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Cla Justification for proposal: comm CX/FA 12/44/9 Add 1					Comments by eWG on EU, UK: Supports propo	horizontal classification proposal: osal
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7		LI LINA, LLO. accepts proposar
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						
ADIPATE	1422	10000		7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						
PHOSPHATE	1414	10000		7		
ACID TREATED STARCH	1401	10000		7		
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
ALGINIC ACID	400	10000		7		
ALKALINE TREATED STARCH	1402	10000		7	A -1 4 1: -41	
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	10000		7	Adopt as listed	
BLEACHED STARCH	1403	10000		7		
						USA: calcium acetate is allowed in the USA for use in toppings and
CALCIUM ACETATE	263	1500		7		syrups as a thickener at levels up to 0.15% (1500 mg/kg)
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	10000		7	1	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	5000		7	1	
CARRAGEENAN	407	5000		7	1	
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID					1	FFFMA FLO:
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7		EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	10000		7	1	

GELLAN GUM	418	500		7
GUAR GUM	412	10000		7
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULÓSE	463	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL DISTARCH				
PHOSPHATE	1442	10000		7
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL				
CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	10000		7
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID	_			
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP		7
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP		7
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP		7
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP		7
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP		7
MICROCRYSTALLINE	100	O.V.II		,
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		7
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES		<u> </u>		
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	6000		7
MONOSTARCH PHOSPHATE	1410	10000		7
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	10000		7
PECTINS	440	GMP	1	7
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH	170	Olvii		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
PHOSPHATE	1413	10000		7
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP		7
POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	10000		7
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN	TUL	10000		<u>'</u>
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP		7
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP		7
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA	1 00(II)	Olvii		<u>'</u>
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP		4
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC	1 010	Givii		
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	7
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH	170(1)	Olvii	1''	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND				
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP		7
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	10000		7
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL	466	5000		7
SODIOWI CARDOX TWE TITL	+00	3000		

CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)				
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7	
STARCHES, ENZYME TREATED	1405	10000	7	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	7	AIDGUM: supports adoption
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	7	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7	
XANTHAN GUM	415	5000	7	

Food Category No. 11.5 (Honey)

Corresponding commodity standards: 012-1981: does not discuss food additives

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal:** Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. 2 that emulsifiers, stabilizers & thickeners are not justified in FC 11.5

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Spain: supports proposal

Food Category No. 12.1 (Salt and salt substitutes)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; subcategories have corresponding commodity standards which do not exclude ES&Ts

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal:** Comments to eWG that Technical function of ES&T not needed in salt; adopted provisions for food additives with ES&T function in subcategory 12.1.1 (Salt) are for their use as anticaking agents, not as ES&T

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Spain, UK: supports proposal

Food Category No. 12.1.1 (Salt)

Corresponding commodity standards: 150-1985: allows food additives as per FC 12.1.1 Tables 1 & 2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: Comments to eWG that Technical function of ES&T not needed in salt; adopted provisions for food additives with ES&T function in this food are for their use as anticaking agents, not as ES&T

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Spain, UK: supports proposal

are for their acc ac anticarting agent	o, not ao E	<u> </u>				
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP		Adopted		UK: retain adopted - used as anti-caking agents not as ES&T
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC						
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH					Retain Adopted	
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,						
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	71	Adopted		UK: retain adopted - used as anti-caking agents not as ES&T

Food Category No. 12.1.2 (Salt substitutes)

Corresponding commodity standards: 053-1981: does not discuss food additives

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified Justification for proposal: Comments by eWG members and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add 2. - stabilizers used to cause different salt substitute ingredients to adhere to each other so that when they reach the tongue the synergistic effect of the compounds in creating a salty taste remains intact.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

UK: accepts proposal

ICGMA - Modified Food Starches would be used as stabilizers to cause different salt substitute ingredients to adhere to each other so that when they reach the tongue the synergistic effect of the compounds in creating a salty taste remains intact. Without something to hold the ingredients together they would separate and the perceived salty taste could be lost.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	5000		7		LI LIMA, LLC. accepts proposal
ACETYLATED DISTARCH						
PHOSPHATE	1414	GMP		7		
AGAR	406	GMP		7		
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		4		
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58	4		
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58	4		
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	1	
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID					1	EEEMA ELC. accento proposal
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7		EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7	1	
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7	1	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		7	Adopt as listed	USA: accept proposal AIDGUM: supports adoption CCC, Tate & Lyle: adopt at GMP, used to stabilize smaller salt crystals to allow same salt taste on tongue in reduced sodium products
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP		7	†	producto
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL	700	Civii		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	†	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP		7	1	
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7	1	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7	1	
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID				•	1	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	5000		7		EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP		7	1	
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP		7	1	
MANNITOL	421	60000		4	1	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP		7	1	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP		7	1	

MICROCRYSTALLINE				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	22000	7	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	, ,			EFEMA ELC: accento prepagal
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	5000	7	EFEMA, ELC: accepts proposal
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	7	
PECTINS	440	GMP	7	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP	4	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	7	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	7	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	7	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH				
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND				
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	7	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	7	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7	
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP	4	
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	 7	
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	7	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7	
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7	

Food Category No. 12.2.1 (Herbs and spices)

406

GMP

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Cl Justification for proposal: Comm Add 2 ES&T not needed in this	ments by eW				Comments by eWG on ho Brazil, EU, Spain, UK, ICC	orizontal classification proposal: GMA: supports proposal
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	5000	51 ²⁰	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH	1414	GMP	51	7	Discontinue	

²⁰ **Note 51:** For use in herbs only.

AGAR

ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP	51	4
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	51& 58	4
5.125.5111 57 1125111 112			51 &	•
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58	4
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP	51	7
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP	51	7
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID				
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP	51	7
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP	51	7
GUAR GUM	412	GMP	51	7
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP	51	7
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULÓSE	463	GMP	51	7
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL			_	
CELLULOSE	464	GMP	51	7
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	GMP	51	7
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP	51	7
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP	51	7
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID			_	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	5000	51	7
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP	51	7
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	51	7
MANNITOL	421	60000	51	4
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	51	7
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	51	7
MICROCRYSTALLINE			_	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	51	7
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES	()			
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	5000	51	7
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	GMP	51	7
PECTINS	440	GMP	51	7
POLYDEXTROSES	1200	GMP	51	7
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP	51	4
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	51	7
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	51	7
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	51	7
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	51	7
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH	470(ii)	GMP	51	7

CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND				
SODIUM				
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	51	7
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	51	7
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP	51	4
TARA GUM	417	GMP	51	7
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	51	7
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP	51	7

Food Category No. 13.1 (Infant formulae, follow-up formulae, and formulae for special medical purposes for infants)

Corresponding commodity standards: 150-1985: allows food additives as per FC 12.1.1 Tables 1 & 2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Case-by-Case <u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG that the use of all additives in subcategories should be specifically evaluated for use in that food category.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Brazil, EU, Spain, UK: supports proposal

ICGMA: Thickeners help suspend nutrients, particularly insoluble minerals, preserving the nutritional quality of the food (specifically nutrient delivery to the infant). Emulsifiers provide aid in the manufacture of formulas to prevent separation of the macronutrient entities, which enhances the keeping quality or stability of the formula and helps ensure even distribution of nutrients

	nutiens								
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal			
					Discontinue and move to	UK: accept proposal to adopt in FC 13.1			
					FC 13.1.1 & 13.1.3 -				
					although not included in				
					adopted 072-1981,				
					CCNFSDU has proposed				
					it for adoption in that				
					standard (see Alinorm				
					07/30/26 Appendix III).				
					It has not been proposed				
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		4	for addition to 156-1987				

Food Category No. 13.1.1 (Infant formulae)

Corresponding commodity standards: 072-1981: allows thickeners (INS 412. 410. 1412, 1414, 1413, 1440, 407) and emulsifiers (INS 322, 471); also allows INS 501, 332 and 331 as acidity regulators

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Case-By-Case <u>Justification for proposal:</u> Comments to eWG that the use of additives in this FC should be specifically evaluated for use in that food category

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Spain: supports proposal

UK: accept proposals only in accordance with Codex Standards in this sentitive food category **ICGMA**: Thickeners help suspend nutrients, particularly insoluble minerals, preserving the nutritional quality of the food (specifically nutrient delivery to the infant). Emulsifiers provide aid in the manufacture of formulas to prevent separation of the macronutrient entities, which enhances the keeping quality or stability of the formula and helps ensure even distribution of nutrients

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETYLATED DISTARCH			72 ²¹ &			
PHOSPHATE	1414	5000	150 ²²	7		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	1000	72	7	Adopt as listed -	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	5000	72 & 150	7	corresponds to CODEX STAN 072-1981	
			14 ²³ &			
GUAR GUM	412	1000	72	7		
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP			Adopt - corresponds to proposal by CCNFSDU (see Alinorm 07/30/26 Appendix III)	AIDGUM supports adoption
COM ARABIC (ACACIA COM)	717	Oitii	72 &		Appendix III)	
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	5000	150	7		
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000	72	7		Japan: agree, used for uniform emulsion
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES OF FATTY ACIDS	471	4000	72	7		EFEMA, ELC: accepts the proposal
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1413	5000	72 & 150	7	Adopt as listed - corresponds to CODEX	
			55 ²⁴ &		STAN 072-1981	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	2000	72	7		
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	72	7		
POTASSIUM HYDROGEN			55 &			
CARBONATE	501(ii)	2000	72	7		

²¹ **Note 72:** Ready-to-eat basis.

Note 150: Use level for soy-based formula; 25 000 mg/kg for hydrolyzed protein and/or amino acid-based formula.

Note 14: For use in hydrolyzed protein liquid formula only.

²⁴ Note 55: Singly or in combination, within the limits for sodium, calcium, and potassium specified in the commodity standard.

SODIUM DIHYDROGEN					
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	72	4	
					Japan: chelating effect of citrate prevents sedimentation
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	72	7	minerals such as calcium
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	72	7	

Food Category No. 13.1.2 (Follow-up formulae)

Corresponding commodity standards: 156-1987: allows thickeners (INS 412, 410, 1412, 1414, 1413, 1422, 407, 440) and emulsifiers (INS 322i, 471), and INS 332i-ii, 501i-ii, 331ii, & 331ii as acidity regulators

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Case-By-Case <u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG that the use of additives in this FC should be specifically evaluated for use in that food category

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Spain: supports proposal

UK: accept proposals only in accordance with Codex Standards in this sentitive food category **ICGMA**: Thickeners help suspend nutrients, particularly insoluble minerals, preserving the nutritional quality of the food (specifically nutrient delivery to the infant). Emulsifiers provide aid in the manufacture of formulas to prevent separation of the macronutrient entities, which enhances the keeping quality or stability of the formula and helps ensure even distribution of nutrients

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETYLATED DISTARCH			72 &			
ADIPATE	1422	5000	150	7		
ACETYLATED DISTARCH			72 &			
PHOSPHATE	1414	5000	150	7		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	1000	72	7	1	
CARRAGEENAN	407	300	72 & 151 ²⁵	7		
			72 &		1	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	5000	150	7	Adams as Bassal	
GUAR GUM	412	1000	72	7	Adopt as listed -	
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000	72	7	corresponds to CODEX	Japan: agree, used for uniform emulsion
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES OF FATTY ACIDS	471	4000	72	7	- STAN 072-1981	EFEMA, ELC: accepts the proposal
PECTINS	440	10000	72	7	1	
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH			72 &		1	
PHOSPHATE	1413	5000	150	7		
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	72	7	1	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN					1	
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	72	4		
POTASSIUM HYDROGEN	501(ii)	GMP	72	7	7	

²⁵ **Note 151:** Use level for soy-based formula; 1 000 mg/kg for hydrolyzed protein and/or amino acid-based formula.

C/	ARBONATE				
SC	DDIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CI	TRATE	331(i)	GMP	72	4
TF	RIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	72	7
TF	RISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	72	7

Food Category No. 13.1.3 (Formulae for special medical purposes for infants)

Corresponding commodity standards: 072-1981: allows thickeners (INS 412. 410. 1412, 1414, 1413, 1440, 407) and emulsifiers (INS 322, 471); also allows INS 501, 332 and 331 as acidity regulators

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Case-By-Case <u>Justification for proposal:</u> Comments to eWG that the use of additives in this FC should be specifically evaluated for use in that food category

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Spain: supports proposal

UK: accept proposals only in accordance with Codex Standards in this sentitive food category **ICGMA**: Thickeners help suspend nutrients, particularly insoluble minerals, preserving the nutritional quality of the food (specifically nutrient delivery to the infant). Emulsifiers provide aid in the manufacture of formulas to prevent separation of the macronutrient entities, which enhances the keeping quality or stability of the formula and helps ensure even distribution of nutrients

		Max Level		Step /		
Additive	INS	(mg/kg)	Notes	Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETYLATED DISTARCH			72 &			
PHOSPHATE	1414	5000	150	7		
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	1000	72	7	Adopt as listed -	
			72 &		corresponds to CODEX	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	5000	150	7	STAN 072-1981	
			14 &			
GUAR GUM	412	1000	72	7		
					Adopt - corresponds to proposal by CCNFSDU (see Alinorm 07/30/26	AIDGUM supports adoption
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP			Appendix III)	
			72 &	_		
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	5000	150	7	1	
LECITHIN	322(i)	5000	72	7		Japan: agree, prevents fat separation
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES						Japan: agree, prevents fat separation
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	4000	72	7	Adopt as listed -	EFEMA, ELC: accepts the proposal
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH			72 &		corresponds to CODEX	
PHOSPHATE	1413	5000	150	7	STAN 072-1981	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	2000	55 & 72	7		
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	72	7		

POTASSIUM HYDROGEN			55 &	
CARBONATE	501(ii)	2000	72	7
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	72	4
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	72	7
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	72	7

Food Category No. 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children)

Corresponding commodity standards: 073-1981: allows thickeners (INS 412, 410, 1412, 1422, 1413, 1440, 1414, 440) and emulsifiers (INS 322, 471), also allows INS 501i-ii, 333iii, 331i & 170i as acidity regulators; 074-1981: allows thickener (INS 410, 412,414, 415, 440, 1404, 1410, 1412, 1413, 1414, 1420, 1450, 1451) and emulsifiers (INS 322, 471, 472a, 472b, 472c), also allows INS 501i-ii, 263, 331i-ii, 332i, iii, 333 (only 333iii in GSFA) as acidity regulators

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Case-By-Case <u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG that the use of additives in this FC should be specifically evaluated for use in that food category

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Spain: supports proposal

UK: accept proposals only in accordance with Codex Standards in this sensitive food category **ELC**: 074-1981 (CODEX STANDARD FOR PROCESSED CEREAL-BASED FOODS FOR INFANTS AND YOUNG CHILDREN) includes several provisions for PHOSPHATES (@440mg/kg as P, for pH-adjustment only). These provisions should be taken up **ICGMA**: modified food starch is used as a general thickener and stabilizer in this category

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Adopt as listed with new	
					note "singly or in	
					combination with INS	UK: accept proposal
					471, 472a, 472b, & 472c"	Cit. decept proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID					- corresponds to CODEX	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	5000		7	STAN 74-1981	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					Adopt at 50000 mg/kg	UK: accept proposal
ADIPATE	1422	60000		7	with new note "singly or	on. accept proposal
ACETYLATED DISTARCH					in combination with other	UK: accept proposal
PHOSPHATE	1414	60000		7	starch thickeners" (as	OK. accept proposal
					per CODEX STAN 74-	
					1981) & "60000 mg/kg in	
					canned baby food only"	UK: accept proposal
ACETYLATED OXIDIZED				_	(as per CODEX STAN	
STARCH	1451	5000	72	4	73-1981)	
AGAR	406	GMP		7	Adopt - corresponding	
ALGINIC ACID	400	5000		7	commodity standards	
AMMONIUM ALGINATE	403	5000		7	allow some ES&T	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	UK: accept proposal
CALCIUM ACETATE	263	GMP		7	STAN 74-1981	

					Adopt - corresponding	
	404	=000		_	commodity standards	
CALCIUM ALGINATE	404	5000		7	allow ES&T	
					Adopt as listed -	
					corresponds to CODEX	UK: accept proposal
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP		7	STAN 74-1981; 73-1981	
	` ` `				Adopt at 10000 mg/kg	
					with notes "singly or in	
					combination with INS	
					410, 412, 414, 415, and	
					440" & "20000 mg/kg in	UK: accept proposal
					gluten-free cereal-based	
					foods only" (both notes	
					as per CODEX STAN 74-	
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	20000		7	1981)	
					Adopt - corresponding	
					commodity standards	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7	allow some ES&T	
CARRAGEENAN	407	GIVIF				
					Adopt at 5000 mg/kg with	
					new note "singly or in	
					combination with INS	UK, EFEMA, ELC: accept proposal
					471, 472a, 472b, & 472c"	ori, El Ellini, EEO. docopt proposal
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID					(as per CODEX STAN	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	5000		7	74-1981)	
					Adopt at 50000 mg/kg	
					with new note "singly or	
					in combination with other	
					starch thickeners" (as	
					per CODEX STAN 74-	UK: accept proposal
						UK: accept proposar
					1981), "60000 mg/kg in	
					canned baby foods only"	
					(as per CODEX STAN	
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	60000		7	73-1981)	
					Adopt - corresponding	
					commodity standards	
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7	allow some ES&T	
	1		1	•	Adopt at 10000 mg/kg	
					with notes "singly or in	
					combination with INS	
					410, 412, 414, 415, and	UK: accept proposal
					440" (as per CODEX	
					STAN 74-1981), "20000	
					mg/kg in gluten-free	
GUAR GUM	412	20000		7	cereal-based foods only"	
_			•		•	

	ı	1	1		0 110000 # :	
					& "2000 mg/kg in canned	
					baby foods only" (as per	
					CODEX STAN 73-1981)	
					Adopt at 10000 mg/kg	
					with notes "singly or in	
					combination with INS	
					410, 412, 414, 415, and	1112
					440" & "20000 mg/kg in	UK: accept proposal
					gluten-free cereal-based	AIDGUM: supports adoption
					foods only" (both notes	
					as per CODEX STAN 74-	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	20000		7	1981)	
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		4	Discontinue	UK: accept proposal
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	60000		7		OK. accept proposal
KARAYA GUM		GMP			Adopt - corresponding	
	416			7	commodity standards	
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7	allow some ES&T	
					Adopt with new note	
					singly or in combination	
					with INS 471, 472a,	UK: accept proposal
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID					472b, & 472c" (as per	
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	5000		7	CODEX STAN 74-1981)	
					Adopt at 5000 mg/kg (as	
					per CODEX STAN 73-	
					1981) with note "15000	
					mg/kg in processed	
					cereal-based foods for	UK: accept proposal
					infants and young	
					children" (as per CODEX	
LECITHIN	322(i)	15000		7	STAN 74-1981)	
MANNITOL	421	GMP		7	Adopt - corresponding	
MICROCRYSTALLINE	421	Givii			commodity standards	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP		7	allow some ES&T	
CELLULUSE (CELLULUSE GEL)	460(1)	GIVIP				
					Adopt with new note	
					"singly or in combination	
					with INS 471, 472a,	
					472b, & 472c" (as per	UK, EFEMA, ELC: accept proposal
					CODEX STAN 74-1981)	5.1, 1. 1.1.1, 110. doopt proposal
					and "1500 mg/kg for use	
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES					in canned baby foods"	
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	5000	<u> </u>	7	(as per 73-1981)	
MONOSTARCH PHOSPHATE	1410	50000		7	Adopt with new note	
					"singly or in combination	IIV. cocept proposal
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	50000		7	with other starch	UK: accept proposal
	•	· -				

		1	T	1	
				thickeners" (as per 74-	
				1981)	
				Adopt at 10000 mg/kg	
				with notes "singly or in	
				combination with INS	
				410, 412, 414, 415, and	
				440" & "20000 mg/kg in	
				gluten-free cereal-based	UK: accept proposal
				foods only" (as per 74-	
				1981) & "in canned fruit-	
				based baby foods only"	
PECTINS	440	20000	7	(as per 73-1981)	
1 2011110	770	20000	+ ' '	Adopt at 50000 mg/kg	
				with new note "singly or	
				in combination with other	
				starch thickeners" (as	
				per 74-1981) & "60000	UK: accept proposal
				mg/kg in caned baby	
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH				food only" (as per 73-	
PHOSPHATE DISTARCH	1413	60000	7	1981)	
PHOSPHATE	1413	60000	/		
				Discontinue - not allowed	
DOTA COULINA AL CINIATE	400	5000		in corresponding	
POTASSIUM ALGINATE	402	5000	7	commodity standards	
				Adopt - potassium	
				hydrogen carbonate and	
				acidity regulators allowed	
				in both corresponding	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	7	commodity standards	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN				Adopt as listed -	UK: accept proposal
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	7	corresponds to CODEX	Ort. accopt proposal
POTASSIUM HYDROGEN				STAN 74-1981	UK: accept proposal
CARBONATE	501(ii)	GMP	7	51AN 14-1901	OK. accept proposar
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	7		
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				Adamt	
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	4	Adopt - corresponding	
SODIUM ALGINÁTE	401	5000	7	commodity standards	
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				allow some ES&T	
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	4		
TELEVISION (CELEUROL SOM)	1.00	1	1 '	Adopt at GMP with new	
SODIUM DIHYDROGEN				note "5000 mg/kg in	5000 mg/kg Corresponds to CODEX STAN 073-1981, GMP to 74-
CITRATE	331(i)	5000	4	canned baby foods"	1981
OHIMIL	331(1)	3000	+ + +	Adopt at 50000 mg/kg	
STARCH ACETATE	1420	50000	7		UK: accept proposal
STARUT AUETATE	1420	50000	/	with new note "singly or	

	1	1		1	
				in combination with other	
				starch thickeners" (as	
				per CODEX STAN 74-	
				1981)	
				Adopt at 50000 mg/kg	
				with new note "singly or	
				in combination with other	
				starch thickeners" (as	UK: accept proposal
STARCH SODIUM OCTENYL				per CODEX STAN 74-	
SUCCINATE	1450	50000	7	1981)	
SOCCINATE	1430	30000	,	/	
				Adopt - corresponding	
	1		_	commodity standards	
TARA GUM	417	GMP	7	allow some ES&T	
TRICALCIUM CITRATE	333(iii)	GMP	7	Adopt as listed -	UK: accept proposal
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	7	corresponds to CODEX	UK: accept proposal
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	5000	7	STAN 74-1981	UK: accept proposal
				Adopt at 10000 mg/kg	
				with notes "singly or in	
				combination with INS	
				410, 412, 414, 415, and	
				440" & "20000 mg/kg in	UK: accept proposal
				gluten-free cereal-based	
VANITUANI OUM	445	00000	-	foods only" (as per	
XANTHAN GUM	415	20000	/	CODEX STAN 74-1981)	

Food Category No. 14.1.1 (Waters)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, 108-1981 corresponds to subcategory 14.1.1.1 & 227-2001 corresponds to 14.1.1.2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of additives in this food category is not justified

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Iran, Spain, UK: supports proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.1.1 (Natural mineral waters and source waters)

Corresponding commodity standards: 108-1981: does not discuss food additives

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal:** Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of additives in this food category is not justified

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Iran, Spain, UK: supports proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.1.2 (Table waters and soda waters)

Corresponding commodity standards: 227-2001: does not discuss food additives

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Not Justified **Justification for proposal**: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of additives in this food category is not justified

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU, Spain, UK: supports proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.2 (Fruit and vegetable juices)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, 247-2005 corresponds to most subcategories and allows food additives as per Tables 1 & 2

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 35 "for use in cloudy juices only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

UK: does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are components of foods e.g. Pectins.

Food Category No. 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice)

Corresponding commodity standards: 247-2005: allows food additives listed in Tables 1 & 2 in FCs 14.1.2.1, 14.1.2.3, 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 35²⁶ "for use in cloudy juices only"

Justification for proposal: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match **UK:** does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are components of foods e.g. Pectins.

IFU: use pectin in cloudy juices

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
PECTINS	440	GMP	35	Adopted	Retain Adopted as listed	Japan, IFU: agree, prevents nectar precipitation

²⁶ **Note 35:** For use in cloudy juices only.

Food Category No. 14.1.2.2 (Vegetable juice)

Corresponding commodity standards: none

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 35 "for use in cloudy juices only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match **UK:** does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are

components of foods e.g. Pectins.

IFU: use pectin in cloudy juices

Food Category No. 14.1.2.3 (Concentrates for fruit juice)

Corresponding commodity standards: 247-2005: allows food additives listed in Tables 1 & 2 in FCs 14.1.2.1, 14.1.2.3, 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 35 "for use in cloudy juices only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match **UK:** does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are components of foods e.g. Pectins.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
PECTINS	440	GMP	35 & 127 ²⁷	Adopted	Retain Adopted as listed	IFU: agree

Food Category No. 14.1.2.4 (Concentrates for vegetable juice)

Corresponding commodity standards: none

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note 35 "for use in cloudy juices only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match **UK:** does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are components of foods e.g. Pectins.

IFU: use pectin in cloudy juices

²⁷ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Food Category No. 14.1.3 (Fruit and vegetable nectars)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, 247-2005: allows food additives listed in Tables 1 & 2 in subcategories 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note "for use in cloudy nectars only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match

 $\mbox{\bf UK:}$ does not support since CX standard 247-2005 restricts ESTs to only those that are

components of foods e.g. Pectins. **IFU:** use pectin in cloudy juices

Food Category No. 14.1.3.1 (Fruit nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, 247-2005: allows food additives listed in Tables 1 & 2 in 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note "for use in cloudy nectars only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Retain Adopted at GMP but with new note "for	
					use in cloudy nectars	Japan: agree, prevents nectar separation
PECTINS	440	GMP		Adopted	only"	UK, IFU: accepts proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.3.2 (Vegetable nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note "for use in cloudy nectars only"

<u>Justification for proposal</u>: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

Iran: supports proposal, but the standard CX standard 247-2005 must be amended to match

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Adopt as listed with note "for use in cloudy nectars	UK, IFU: accepts proposal
PECTINS	440	3000		4	only"	

Food Category No. 14.1.3.3 (Concentrates for fruit nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, 247-2005: allows food additives listed in Tables 1 & 2 in FCs 14.1.2.1, 14.1.2.3, 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note "for use in cloudy nectars only"

Justification for proposal: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

EU: use should be restricted as outlined in CTS 247-2005

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Retain Adopted but with new note "for use in	
PECTINS	440	GMP	127	Adopted	cloudy nectars only"	Iran, UK, IDF: accepts proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified only with note "for use in cloudy nectars only"

Justification for proposal: Comments to eWG and in CX/FA 12/44/9 Add. that the use of stabilizers are necessary in pulpy juices and nectars. Highly pulpy products may present decantation of insoluble solids during shelf life. The use of stabilizers is justified to keep the products uniform

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

Costa Rica, ICGMA: Gums and thickeners are used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize e.g., pectin, xanthum, maltodextrin, other hydrocolloids.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
					Adopt with note "for use	
PECTINS	440	3000		4	in cloudy nectars only"	UK, IFU: accepts proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.5 (Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

eWG Proposal for Horizontal Classification of Food Category: Justified Justification for proposal: No corresponding Commodity Standard, Comments to 1st Circular by Codex Members that ES&T are used in all products in this category.

Comments by eWG on horizontal classification proposal:

EU: not justified in coffee and unflavoured tea

UK: add footnote 142 "Excluding coffee and tea" to all proposed provisions

ICGMA: multiple emulsifiers and thickeners utilized in this category

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	eWG proposal	Comments by eWG members on proposal
ACETIC AND FATTY ACID						
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472a	GMP		7	Adopt as listed	
ACETYLATED DISTARCH	1422	10000		7		

ADIPATE				
ACETYLATED DISTARCH		-		
PHOSPHATE	1414	10000		7
ACID TREATED STARCH	1401	10000		7
AGAR	406	GMP		7
ALGINIC ACID	400	GMP		4
ALKALINE TREATED STARCH	1402	10000		7
BLEACHED STARCH	1402	10000		7
BLEACHED STARCH	1403	10000	50.0	/
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	10000	58 & 160 ²⁸	4
CALCIUM CHLORIDE	509	10000	58	4
CAROB BEAN GUM	410	GMP		7
CARRAGEENAN	407	GMP		7
CITRIC AND FATTY ACID				
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472c	GMP		7
DEXTRINS, ROASTED STARCH	1400	GMP	90 ²⁹	7
DISTARCH PHOSPHATE	1412	10000		7
GELLAN GUM	418	GMP		7
GUAR GUM	412	GMP		7
GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM)	414	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL CELLULOSE	463	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL DISTARCH				
PHOSPHATE	1442	10000		7
HYDROXYPROPYL METHYL				
CELLULOSE	464	GMP		7
HYDROXYPROPYL STARCH	1440	10000		7
KARAYA GUM	416	GMP		7
KONJAC FLOUR	425	GMP		7
LACTIC AND FATTY ACID				
ESTERS OF GLYCEROL	472b	GMP		7
LECITHIN	322(i)	GMP		7

Note 160: For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only.
Note 90: For use in milk-sucrose mixtures used in the finished product.

	I	1	1	
				and part of Asian countries. According to the Food Category
				Descriptors of GSFA, ready-to-drink products (including canned
				products) are included in this food category
				USA: Lecithin is allowed for use in the USA in powdered
				beverages up to 20 mg/"serving"
MAGNESIUM CHLORIDE	511	GMP	7	
METHYL CELLULOSE	461	GMP	7	
METHYL ETHYL CELLULOSE	465	GMP	7	
MICROCRYSTALLINE				
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GEL)	460(i)	GMP	7	
				Japan: supports proposal. additive is used to prevent separation
				milk fat in canned tea with milk and canned coffee with milk.
				Reported from industry, these kind of drinks are produced in Japa
				and part of Asian countries. According to the Food Category
MONO- AND DI-GLYCERIDES				Descriptors of GSFA, ready-to-drink products (including canned
OF FATTY ACIDS	471	GMP	7	products) are included in this food category.
MONOSTARCH PHOSPHATE	1410	10000	7	
OXIDIZED STARCH	1404	10000	7	
PECTINS	440	GMP	7	ICGMA: used in coffee drinks and substitutes
PHOSPHATED DISTARCH				
PHOSPHATE	1413	10000	7	
POTASSIUM CARBONATE	501(i)	GMP	4	
POTASSIUM CHLORIDE	508	GMP	4	
POTASSIUM DIHYDROGEN				
CITRATE	332(i)	GMP	7	
POWDERED CELLULOSE	460(ii)	GMP	7	
PROCESSED EUCHEUMA				
SEAWEED (PES)	407a	GMP	7	
SALTS OF MYRISTIC, PALMITIC				
AND STEARIC ACIDS WITH				
AMMONIA, CALCIUM,				
POTASSIUM AND SODIUM	470(i)	GMP	7	
SALTS OF OLEIC ACID WITH				
CALCIUM, POTASSIUM AND				
SODIUM	470(ii)	GMP	7	
SODIUM ALGINATE	401	GMP	4	
				Japan: supports proposal. Additive is used to prevent separation
				of oil included in coffee bean. In addition, Sodium carboxymethyl
				cellulose is used to prevent separation of milk fat in canned tea
				with milk and anned coffee with milk. Reported from industry, the
				kind of drinks are produced in Japan and part of Asian countries.
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL				According to the Food Category Descriptors of GSFA, ready-to-
CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	GMP	7	drink products (including canned products) are included in this for

SODIUM DIHYDROGEN			
CITRATE	331(i)	GMP	7
SODIUM GLUCONATE	576	GMP	4
STARCHES, ENZYME TREATED	1405	10000	7
TARA GUM	417	GMP	7
TRAGACANTH GUM	413	GMP	7
TRIPOTASSIUM CITRATE	332(ii)	GMP	7
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	GMP	7
XANTHAN GUM	415	GMP	7

Appendix 2

DETERMINATION OF TECHNOLOGICAL JUSTIFICATION FOR THE USE OF EMUSIFIERS STABILIZERS THICKENERS IN FOOD CATEGORIES CONTAINED IN THE ANNEX TO TABLES 1 & 2

Food Category Number	Food Category Description ³⁰	Recommendation of physical working group
01.1.1	Milk and buttermilk (plain)	No decision
01.1.1.1	Milk (plain)	No decision
01.1.1.2	Buttermilk (plain)	No decision
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain),	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
01.2	excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	thickeners is not justified in this food category on a general basis.
01.2.1	Fermented milks (plain)	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food category on a general basis
01.2.1.1	Fermented milks (plain), not heat-treated after fermentation	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis, with notes "For use as stabilizer or thickener only" and "Use restricted to reconstitution and recombination only".
01.2.1.2	Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis.
01.2.2	Renneted milk (plain)	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis.
01.4.1	Pasteurized cream (plain)	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis, with note "Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cream and Prepared Creams (reconstituted creams, prepackaged liquid cream) (CODEX STAN 288-1976)".
01.4.2	Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis.
01.6.3	Whey cheese	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food category on a general basis
01.6.6	Whey protein cheese	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food category on a general basis
01.8.2	Dried whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	Case-by-case basis
02.1	Fats and oils essentially free from water	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food category on a general basis
02.1.1	Butter oil, anhydrous milkfat, ghee	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food category on a general basis

 $^{^{30}}$ Food categories shaded in gray are listed in the Annex to Table 3 in CODEX STAN 192-1995. Food categories that are not shaded are covered by the Annex to Table 3 by means of the hierarchical nature of the GSFA food category system.

Faad		Decomposed of the state of the
Food Category		Recommendation of physical working group
Number	Food Category Description ³⁰	working group
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
02.1.2	vegetable oils and lats	thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
02.1.5	Lard, tailow, fish oil, and other arithariats	thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
02.2.1	Butter	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
02.2.1	Button	thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
04.1.1	Fresh fruit	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
•		thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
04.1.1.1	Untreated fresh fruit	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
		thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
04.1.1.2	Surface treated fresh fruit	The 45 th CCFA agreed to request the
		46 th CCFA pWG on GSFA to
		reconsider the horizontal approach for
		this food category
04.1.1.3	Peeled or cut fresh fruit	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
		thickeners is not justified in this food
		category on a general basis
04.2.1	Fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi,	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
	roots and tubers, pulses and legumes and aloe	thickeners is not justified in this food
	vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seed	category on a general basis
04.2.1.1	Untreated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
	and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes	thickeners is <u>not</u> justified in this food
	(including soybeans), and aloe vera), seaweeds,	category on a general basis
04.0.4.0	and nuts and seed	TI - 45 th COFA II 1
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including	The 45 th CCFA could not come to an
	mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and	agreement (to be discussed by the 46 th
	legumes (including soybeans) and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds	CCFA pWG on GSFA)
4.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
7.2.1.3	mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and	thickeners is not justified in this food
	legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and	category on a general basis
	seeds	Satisfier and a gorioral basis
4.2.2.1	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi,	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
	roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe	thickeners is not justified in this food
	vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds	category on a general basis
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and	The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers and
	fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and	thickeners is justified in this food
	aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding	category on a general basis.
	fermented soybean products of food categories	
	06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)	

Appendix 3

WORKING PRINCIPLES FOR CONSIDERATION OF TABLE 3 FOOD ADDITIVES WITH EMULSIFIER, STABILIZER AND THICKENER FUNCTION

These principles apply only to the work of pWG on the GSFA for the 45th CCFA on its discussion on the Table 3 food additives with emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener function as listed in CX/FA 13/45/7, Appendix 3.

Case 1: When emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener are horizontally justified in a food category

The WG recommendation will be based on the recommendation of the eWG, as proposed in Appendix 3 of document CX/FA 13/45/7. All provisions recommended for adoption by the eWG will be adopted at GMP level except those specifically noted by the pWG.

Case 2: When emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener are not horizontally justified in a food category

The WG recommendation will be to discontinue the provisions for the food additives with only emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener function (as listed Table1 in the working document with the addition of gellan gum (INS 418)) and to hold the other provisions for all other additives at their current step in the GSFA for future consideration and not considered for addition to the subcategories.

Consequential effects on the sub-categories:

<u>Case a:</u> when emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener are not justified in the parent category but are justified in the sub-categories, the provisions for emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener from the parent category will be adopted in the sub-category.

<u>Case b:</u> when emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener are not justified in the parent category and are not justified in the sub-categories, the provisions for the emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener will be discontinued in the parent category and removed/discontinued from the sub-categories.

Case 3: When emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener are not horizontally justified in a food category for food additives with functional class of acidity regulators and emulsifier, and/or stabilizer and/or thickener (as listed Table 2 in working document).

The WG will refer to its decision regarding the provision for the use of this additive as an acidity regulator in this food category.

Table 1 - Table 3 Food additives with functional class: emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener only

Food Additive	INS	Functional class
Acetylated distarch adipate	1422	
Acetylated distarch phosphate	1414	
Acetylated oxidized starch	1451	
Acid treated starch	1401	
Alkaline treated starch	1402	
Bleached starch	1403	
Carob bean gum	410	
Dextrins, roasted starch	1400	Emulaifiar atabilizar thickanar
Distarch phosphate	1412	Emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener
Hydroxypropyl distarch phosphate	1442	
Hydroxypropyl starch	1440	
Karaya gum	416	
Monostarch phosphate	1410	
Oxidized starch	1404	
Phosphated distarch phosphate	1413	
Starch acetate	1420	

Food Additive	INS	Functional class
Starch sodium octenyl succinate	1450	
Starches, enzyme treated	1405	
Tragacanth gum	413	
Gellan gum	418	Stabilizer, Thickener

<u>Table 2 – Table 3 Food additives with functional class: acidity regulator and emulsifier, and/or stabilizer and/or thickener</u>

Food Additive	INS	Functional class
Calcium acetate	263	Acidity regulator, Preservative, Stabilizer
Glucono delta-lactone	575	Acidity regulator, Raising agent, Stabilizer
Potassium acetates	261	Acidity regulator, Raising agent, Stabilizer
Potassium carbonate	501(i)	Acidity regulator, Stabilizer
Potassium dihydrogen citrate	332(ii)	Acidity regulator, Sequestrant, Stabilizer
Potassium gluconate	577	Acidity regulator, Stabilizer
Potassium hydrogen carbonate	501(i)	Acidity regulator, Raising agent, Stabilizer
Sodium dihydrogen citrate	331(i)	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier; Sequestrant, Thickener
Sodium lactate	325	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Bulking agent, Humectant, Thickener
Tricalcium citrate	333(iii)	Acidity regulator, Firming agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer
Tripotassium citrate	332(ii)	Acidity regulator, Sequestrant, Stabilizer
Trisodium citrate	331(iii)	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Sequestrant, Stabilizer