



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Fifty-first Session

ALIGNMENT OF THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF COMMODITY STANDARDS

Report of the EWG on Alignment

This electronic working group on the alignment of the food additive provisions of the commodity standards, chaired by Australia and co-chaired by the United States of America and Japan, received submissions on the 1st circular from: Brazil, Canada, Indonesia, New Zealand, Singapore, Comité européen des fabricants de sucre (CEFS), EU Specialty Food Ingredients, International Dairy Federation (IDF), International Special Dietary Foods Industries (ISDI) and on the 2nd circular from Brazil, New Zealand, Singapore, Association of Manufacturers and Formulators of Enzyme Products (AMFEP), CEFS, Enzyme Technical Association (ETA), IDF, ISDI

Alignment work relating to the Codex commodity standards related to milk and milk products (CCMMP), specifically ripened cheese; sugars (CCS); natural mineral waters (CCNMW); cereals, pulses and legumes (CCCPL); and vegetable proteins (CCVP) being:

CCMMP: 13 standards

Cheddar (CXS 263-1966);
Danbo (CXS 264-1966);
Edam (CXS 265-1966);
Gouda (CXS 266-1966);
Havarti (CXS 267-1966);
Samsø (CXS 268-1966);
Emmental (CXS 269-1967);
Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968);
Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968);
Provolone (CXS 272-1968);
Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969);
Camembert (CXS 276-1973); and
Brie (CXS 277-1973).

CCS: 2 standards

Honey (CXS 12-1981); and
Sugars (CXS 212-1999).

CCNMW: 2 standards

Natural mineral waters (CXS 108-1981); and
Bottled/packaged drinking waters (other than natural mineral waters) (CXS 227-2001).

CCCPL: 3 standards

Wheat flour (CXS 152-1985);
Couscous (CXS 202-1995); and
Instant noodles (CXS 249-2006).

CCVP: 3 standards

Wheat protein products including wheat gluten (CXS 163-1987);
Vegetable protein products (VPP) (CXS 174-1989); and
Soy protein products (CXS 175-1989)

Introduction

1. CCFA50 agreed to establish an EWG, chaired by Australia and co-chaired by the United States of America (USA) and Japan, open to all Members and Observers and working in English only to consider (REP 18/FA, para. 49):

(i) the alignment of the following commodity Standards listed in the forward workplan for which there was no active commodity committee: CXS 12-1987, CXS 212-1999 (CCS); CXS 152-1985, CXS 202-1995, CXS 249-2006 (CCCPL); CXS 108-1981, CXS 227-2001 (CCNMW); CXS 163-1987, CXS 174-1989, CXS 175-1989 (CCVP);

(ii) the alignment, with the assistance of IDF, of the following ripened-cheese commodity Standards: CXS 263-1966, CXS 264-1966, CXS 265-1966, CXS 266-1966, CXS 267-1966, CXS 268-1966, CXS 269-1967, CXS 270-1968, CXS 271-1968, CXS 272-1968, CXS 274-1969, CXS 276-1973 and CXS 277-1973;

(iii) the addition of a footnote to the Table entitled "References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives" to read: "This Section only lists Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is not listed in the Annex to Table 3. Provisions for the use of specific Table 3 additives in Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is listed in the Annex to Table 3 can be found in the corresponding Food Categories in Tables 1 and 2."; and

(iv) the proposed revisions to the adopted provisions contained in CRD 2 Annex 4 Part C i.e. the deletion of Note 15 in Food Categories 13.1.1, 13.1.2 and 13.1.3 for ascorbyl palmitate (INS 304) and ascorbyl stearate (INS 305).

Progress since the 50th Session of the CCFA

2. This Second circular to the EWG has addressed the alignment as follows:

(i) Considered the application of the decision tree to these Codex commodity Standards for amendments to these Standards and to the GSFA: CXS 12-1987, CXS 212-1999 (CCS); CXS 152-1985, CXS 202-1995, CXS 249-2006 (CCCPL); CXS 108-1981, CXS 227-2001 (CCNMW); CXS 163-1987, CXS 174-1989, CXS 175-1989 (CCVP); CXS 263-1966, CXS 264-1966, CXS 265-1966, CXS 266-1966, CXS 267-1966, CXS 268-1966, CXS 269-1967, CXS 270-1968, CXS 271-1968, CXS 272-1968, CXS 274-1969, CXS 276-1973 and CXS 277-1973 (CCMMP).

(ii) Considered the addition of a footnote to the Table entitled "References to Commodity Standard for GSFA Table 3 Additives".

(iii) Considered the proposed revisions to the adopted provisions contained in CRD 2 Annex 4 Part C.

(iv) Checked comments in submissions made to the First circular and made amendments in Appendices 2-6. within Appendix 1.

3. The EWG is again asked to provide comments and edits to Appendices 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6.

4. Appendix 1 provides a summary of issues and questions arising from the alignment work for the EWG consideration and comments. Issues and comments in submissions to the First circular have been summarised and additional questions for the EWG noted, while some proposed responses have been explained. It also provides an explanation for the Chair's proposed approach, to assist in understanding the rationale behind some decisions made.

5. Appendices 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 address the requests of the EWG as listed below.

List of Appendices

1. Explanatory Document: Questions, comments and summaries of submissions received and chair's proposals for the EWG

2. Proposed amendments to the food additive provisions of the Codex commodity Standards for milk and milk products (ripened cheese) and Table 1 and 2 of the GSFA relating to ripened cheeses

3. Proposed amendments to the food additive provisions of the Codex commodity Standards for sugars and natural mineral waters and Table 1 and 2 of the GSFA relating to sugars and natural mineral waters

4. Proposed amendments to the food additive provisions of the Codex commodity Standards for cereals, pulses and legumes; and vegetable proteins and to the GSFA relating to cereals, pulses and legumes; and vegetable proteins

5. Consideration of the addition of a footnote in Table 3 of the GSFA

6. Proposed revisions to the adopted provisions contained in CRD 2 Annex 4 Part C

Appendix 1

EXPLANATORY DOCUMENT – QUESTIONS, COMMENTS AND CHAIR’S PROPOSALS FOR THE EWGIntroduction

This document provides issues and questions arising from the alignment work conducted to date. Summary of issues raised in submissions to the First circular and additional questions for the EWG are also noted. The proposed approach as outlined by the chair for consideration by the EWG is also provided for some issues.

Some initial comments are provided addressing the alignment of the thirteen ripened cheeses (provided in Appendix 2). It is noted that the specific 13 Codex commodity standards all relate to the food category 01.6.2.1 (ripened cheese, includes rind) of the GSFA. It is possible that there are other additional types of ripened cheese than these 13 cheese types. However it is understood that any other ripened cheeses would still need to be captured by other more general Codex commodity standards for cheese, such as CXS 283-1978 (Cheese (ripened, including mould ripened)) and CXS 208-1999 (Cheeses in brine). The food category for these commodity standards is also 01.6.2.1. Therefore, it is understood that there will be no non-standardised ripened cheeses that need to be considered as part of this alignment work, so there is no need to make mention of non-standardised cheeses in the proposed notes written for the GSFA as part of this work.

Comments from the EWG are appreciated on this point, especially if there is disagreement.

Comments:

Agree: New Zealand, IDF

Additional New Zealand comments: It is helpful to know that any additional ripened cheeses would fall within the more general Codex cheese standards (CXS 283-1978 and CXS 208-1999), meaning that there are no non-standardised cheeses within Food Category 01.6.2.1.

We note that there are a number of green coloured draft and proposed draft provisions, i.e. these are provisions that are additional to those covered by the CCMMP cheese standards. As there are no non-standardised ripened cheeses, it is our understanding that these draft/proposed draft provisions will remain at their current step in the GSFA, to be considered at some future date.

1. Codex commodity standards usually contain a specific section dealing with food additives, which is usually section 4. It is proposed to add in new sections 4 – Food additives for CXS 12-1981 (Honey), CXS 108-1981 (Natural mineral waters) and CXS 227-2001 (Bottled/packageged drinking water (other than natural mineral waters)) to make it clear that no food additives are permitted to be added to products sold as honey, natural mineral waters, and other bottled/packageged drinking waters. For CXS 12-1981 this removes the current exclusion (which is hidden away) from section 3 – Essential composition and quality factors. Making these changes would require consequential numbering changes to the subsequent sections in the three Codex standards.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand, Indonesia

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand

Chair’s proposal: Make the changes as proposed, noting subsequent re-numbering will be required.

2. CXS 212-1999 (Sugars) has a provision for magnesium trisilicate (553(ii)) as an anticaking agent. The relevant food category for this provision in Table 2 of the GSFA is 11.1.2 and it has the provision listed as magnesium silicate, synthetic (553(i)). The GSFA entry was adopted in 2006, after the latest amendment of CXS 212-1999 of 2001 so it is assumed the GSFA is the most current and therefore the most appropriate magnesium silicate entry.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand (notes there is a JECFA evaluation for 553(i) but not 553(ii)), CEFS

Comments on the 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, CEFS

Chair’s proposal: Leave the GSFA entry of magnesium silicate, synthetic (553(i)) since it is the most recent and so assumed to be the most appropriate entry.

3. It is noted there is an entry in CXS 212-1999 for calcium phosphate, tribasic (tricalcium phosphate (341(iii))) as an anticaking agent. For alignment work, CCFA has taken the decision where there is provision for one or more substances of a food additive group to have provisions for all of the substances in that group, provided they have the appropriate technological purpose and are captured by a group ADI. In this case all the phosphates (listed in the GSFA) are listed in Table 2 of the GSFA for the appropriate food category being 11.1.2. However only seven of the phosphates have the technological purpose or functional class of anticaking agent, so only these food additives are appropriate to have the provision. Therefore the alignment is achieved by use of a note (NN) added to entries in both Table 1 and 2 of the GSFA. This note also combines the CXS 212-1999 qualification that the phosphates and four other food additives can act as anticaking agents, singly or in combination. The provisions for the two aluminosilicates (being sodium aluminosilicate (INS 554) and calcium aluminosilicate (INS 556)) have not been added to the GSFA due to a decision taken at the CCFA44 meeting to revoke the provisions for these food additives.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand (supports the principle taken that only silicates and phosphates with the anticaking function are permitted but has questions regarding the ML for phosphates and silicates and note NN, see below), CEFS

Disagree: Indonesia, proposes to maintain only calcium phosphate, tribasic (tricalcium phosphate (341(iii))) as an anticaking agent for sugars; not add the other phosphates as proposed.

New Zealand additional comment regarding note NN.

It questions whether it is clear for the alignment to the GSFA which ML should be used for silicates and separately phosphates when the note NN states they can be used 'singly or in combination'. CXS 212-1999 has a single maximum level of 15,000 mg/kg and makes no distinction between silicates and phosphates.

A quick check of other such provisions in the GSFA shows different approaches to the same issue, and that if the note has arisen from alignment work, it appears to reflect the commodity standard. Therefore, to reflect the commodity standard, the maximum level (when used singly or in combination) could be the value in section 2.2 of CXS 212-1999, i.e. 15000 mg/kg. An alternative view would be to take account of the new maximum level for phosphates, of 6600 mg/kg (as per note 4 below).

Canada also provided similar comments to New Zealand, and proposed amendments to note NN.

Response:

The proposed response taken was New Zealand's alternative view, also expressed by Canada, as further outlined and explained in note 4 below. Since the GSFA ML for phosphates was adopted in 2006, after the latest amendment to CXS 212-1999 it was decided to stay with the GSFA ML. This is a similar approach taken for other alignment work, unless other factors prevail.

Comments on the 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, Singapore, CEFS

CEFS additional comments

It does not agree with the Indonesian suggestion to only permit calcium phosphate, tribasic (tricalcium phosphate (341(iii))) and not the other phosphates as proposed. The reason for this is that in the EU, sugar producers which CEFS represents, are allowed to use other phosphates as anticaking agents, and their use is technologically justified. It agrees with the proposed amended wording for note NN.

IDF comments

The comment is not directly related to this current alignment work but it notes that the issue of 'phosphates' as a group of additives will arise in the future alignment of some dairy standards where some but not all phosphates are allowed in the commodity standard.

New Zealand comments

The revised note NN is improved, however we think it needs to be clearer on the ML applying when a combination of phosphates and silicates are used.

In our view, if the ML for phosphates is revised from 15000 to 6,600 mg/kg (to which we agree), then the new note NN should reflect this value for phosphates, rather than allowing up to 15000 when used in combination with silicates.

We understand that this is what the new note NN is intending to achieve. That is, when silicates and phosphates are used together, the portion of the blend containing phosphates cannot exceed 6600 mg/kg.

One option is to remove the numerical value of 15000 mg/kg from the Note, and state in the Note that the individual limits apply on a proportionate basis, when mixtures of food additives are used.

A suggestion is shown below, or something along these lines:

Note NN: For products conforming to the *Standard for Sugars* (CXS 212-1999) as anticaking agents only: calcium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 341(i)), calcium hydrogen phosphate (INS 341(ii)), tricalcium phosphate (INS 341(iii)), magnesium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 343(i)), magnesium hydrogen phosphate (INS 343(ii)), trimagnesium phosphate (INS 343(iii)), magnesium carbonate (INS 504(i)), bone phosphate (INS 542), silicon dioxide, amorphous (INS 551), Calcium silicate (INS 552), and magnesium silicate, synthetic (INS 553(i)) ~~at 15,000 mg/kg singly (except for the phosphates) or in combination.~~ **singly (within their limits) or in combination (within the separate limits that apply for phosphates and silicates).**

Response:

The New Zealand suggestion is appreciated and the issue is understood. A slightly different last part of the sentence is proposed to still try and achieve the same outcome. It is:

singly or in combination but still within prescribed separate individual maximum levels.

Singapore's comments

Although agreeing with the chair's proposal it wonders if this means that note NN only applies to products conforming to CXS 212-1999. What about other non-standardised products that belong to food category 11.1.2; are the seven phosphates and four silicates allowed to be added to them.

Response:

If there are any non-standardised products (which may be unlikely) these already have the current provisions for phosphates and silicates listed in the GSFA. Therefore it is not proposed to make any changes to the note.

Chair's proposal: To add provisions for seven other phosphates as anticaking agents for food category 11.1.2 in the GSFA along with four other food additives via a new note NN as part of the alignment of CXS 212-1999 with the GSFA (see Appendix 3 for the proposed amendments). Note NN has been further amended picking up New Zealand's comments to the 2nd circular.

4. It is noted that CXS 212-1999 has provisions for the anticaking agents, including calcium phosphate, tribasic (tricalcium phosphate, 341(iii)) (see note 3 above) at a maximum level of 1.5% m/m which is equivalent to 15,000 mg/kg. However, the relevant phosphate provisions in food category 11.1.2 of Table 2 of the GSFA for phosphates list the maximum level as 6,600 mg/kg as phosphorus (due to note 33). The question arises as to what is 15,000 mg/kg of tricalcium phosphate equivalent to as phosphorus and how does it compare to 6,600 mg/kg. The JECFA specification for tricalcium phosphate lists the assay to be greater than 90% of $\text{Ca}_3(\text{PO}_4)_2$. The percentage of phosphorus for such a molecular formula is approximately 20%, so 15,000 mg/kg of tricalcium phosphate is approximately 3,000 mg/kg as phosphorus, which is less than half the GSFA maximum level.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand, Indonesia, CEFS

Comments on the 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, CEFS

Chair's proposal: Since the GSFA maximum level (ML) (2006) is more recent than the CXS 212-1999 (latest amendment 2001) it is proposed to stay with it and not make any changes as part of alignment.

5. The Codex commodity standards for ripened cheeses contain a summary table under section 4 (Food Additives) detailing the food additive function class and provisions for their use, for both the cheese mass, and surface and rind treatment. These tables are separate to the individual food additive provisions. The IDF have requested that once the alignment work has been completed that these tables remain within the food additive section of these Codex commodity standards. The justification for this request is that these tables were developed by the CCMMP as valuable information and they may be even more valuable after the alignment work has been completed.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, Indonesia, though it suggests that only the food additive functional classes that are permitted, in either the cheese mass or surface/rind treatment. Therefore it proposes to remove the entries in the tables to functional classes that are not allowed.

New Zealand: Agree that the summary tables in the Codex commodity standards provides a valuable resource. However, the GSFA is intended to be the single reference for food additive provisions, so all the important and relevant information contained in the tables needs to be captured in the GSFA, as notes if appropriate.

Specific issues on notes are:

Colours: the note is “only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2” [specific characteristic colours for each cheese type are listed], and only for the cheese mass, not the surface or rind. Is a note needed in the GSFA? Or if it is redundant then should it not be noted in the working group documents for future reference.

Acidity regulators: they are limited only to the cheese mass, not the surface or rind (at GMP). Therefore should a note be added to their entry into Table 3, similar to what has been proposed for anticaking agents (as per note 7 below)? If the distinction has no practical effect in cheese making, then it would be helpful to state this in the working group documents for future reference.

Canada also suggested use of notes to ensure the qualification requirements in the commodity standards are captured in the GSFA, for both colours and acidity regulators which are only listed as justified in these tables for cheese mass and not for surface/rind treatment. It proposed a new note should be written “For use in cheese mass (only)”.

Comments were sought on Indonesia’s suggestion that food additive functional classes that are not allowed in the cheese mass or surface/rind treatment should be removed from these tables. The current view is not to do this since doing so would allow for potential future ambiguity, and also to ensure consistency with the use of the tables in the standards.

Comments were sought on whether there is a need, and whether it is appropriate, to add qualification notes for both colours and acidity regulators into the GSFA as part of the alignment work. It is proposed to do so.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, Singapore, IDF

IDF additional comment

It addresses the question raised by New Zealand about whether having a distinction for permissions for acidity regulators for the cheese mass and not the rind is important or whether it has no practical effect in cheese making. The IDF notes the case for cheeses where the rind is formed from the cheese mass by natural dehydration at the cheese surface during maturation. In this case the distinction between the rind and the cheese mass has no practical effect, especially for anti-caking agents. However, it agrees that the inclusion of note GG does provide additional clarity and avoids the risk of any ambiguity.

Chair’s proposal: Support the IDF request to keep the food additive functional class table in the Codex commodity standards after the alignment work has been completed. It is not proposed to remove the entries for functional classes that are not allowed to ensure there is no room for ambiguity. A new note has been added to provisions for colours and acidity regulators in Tables 1 and 2 for ripened cheese alignment in Appendix 2, picking up Canada’s suggestion being:

“GG For use in cheese mass only.”

6. There is a current CCFA EWG investigating and evaluating the use of nitrates (and nitrites) as preservative food additives (para 103 of REP 18/FA). There currently are provisions for the use of nitrates in a number of Codex commodity standards, and of particular relevance to this alignment work are their provisions in a number of ripened cheese standards (e.g. CXS 263-1966 – Cheddar). They contain provisions for both sodium nitrate (251) and potassium nitrate (252) used singly or in combination. However there is no entry for nitrates in Table 1 of the GSFA since they are only draft provisions in the step process in Table 2 (i.e. step 7 for food category 01.6.2 – Ripened cheese). However the draft ML is listed as 40 mg/kg which differs to that in CXS 263 (and other ripened cheeses) which is 35 mg/kg.

IDF indicates that the current nitrate provisions in the ripened cheese standards needs to remain since they are required and used in these products.

A question for the alignment EWG is how should the current alignment work for the ripened cheese standards address nitrate provisions in the GSFA noting that their use is currently being considered by a another CCFA EWG? Should the commodity standard provisions be added into the GSFA?

A similar issue applies to annatto extracts – norbixin-based (160b(ii)) which has provisions in ripened cheese commodity standards (e.g. CXS 263 – Cheddar) but is also in the step process for the GSFA which is unlikely to be completed soon since this relates to colours. The MLs are the same for CXS 263 (and other ripened cheeses) and the draft provision.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore (but seeks clarification on Note CC), Indonesia,

New Zealand For nitrates: include the provisions in the GSFA as it would seem too early to remove existing provisions. Discussion is needed, and noting that current provisions will form part of the current CCFA nitrates review work.

For annatto extracts: use the same approach for alignment as per the 2018 meeting (i.e. CX/FA 18/50/6). That is, include the proposed draft provision as a separate entry (green text) to the recommendation to adopt.

Response:

After further consideration of the alignment for nitrates and note CC it was considered that such a note is not required at all. Therefore, it is proposed to remove note CC (this will be indicated by strikethrough) and seeking EWG views on this.

For annatto extracts – norbixin-based, it was decided not to add a separate entry in green text for draft provisions in the 1st circular in Appendix 2, like the 2017 documents for the 2018 meeting. The reasoning was that since these entries are ultimately removed from the final report which only includes entries that recommend changes to the GSFA, such entries are superfluous and makes a large report even larger. This was a different approach, which was not communicated in the 1st circular. However, it is also noted that entries in green were provided in Appendix 4.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, Singapore, IDF

Chair's proposal: Make the changes to the GSFA reflecting the provisions in the commodity standards for nitrates (at 35 mg/kg in the commodity standards and not 40 mg/kg which is the draft provision) and annatto extracts – norbixin-based in the first circular as per the decision tree. It is also proposed to remove the earlier note CC since it is believed not to be required.

7. IDF noted that some of the food additive provisions for ripened cheeses are Table 3 additives. However, the anticaking agents provisions are only for surface treatment of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese. It is therefore proposed that a qualification note should be applied to the provisions added to Table 3. Preservatives can be used to treat both the cheese mass and surface treatment so it is not thought there is a requirement to add a note to these Table 3 provisions for preservatives.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore

New Zealand, agrees, but questions whether it is clear that the new proposed note linked to anticaking agents in Table 3 applies to all the relevant commodity standards listed and not just CXS 272-1986.

Canada made the same response as New Zealand.

Response:

This point is noted and accepted.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, Singapore, IDF

Additional Singapore comments

It seeks clarification on the need for Notes XS274, XS276, XS277. It understand note DD would limit the use of anticaking agents [INS 551, INS 552, INS 553(i) and INS 553(iii)] in products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966) Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968) and Provolone (CXS 272-1968). In addition, note FF further limits the use of the anti-caking agents for the surface treatment of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese only. It questions if there is a need to exclude certain cheeses by way of notes XS274, XS276 and XS277, as notes DD and FF would appear to be sufficient.

Response:

The issue is noted but it is still thought appropriate to include both the exclusion notes (XS274, XS276 and XS277) as well as DD and FF to ensure certainty and prevent any possible confusion. Canada in their comments to the 1st circular suggested the inclusion of these exclusion notes which we made in the 2nd circular. No further changes are proposed.

Chair's proposal: Add a qualification note that the anticaking agents with provisions at GMP that are added to Table 3 for ripened cheeses are used for surface treatment only for sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese. Amendments have been made to make it explicit that the note in Table 3 applies to all the listed ripened cheese standards.

8. In the 2016 revision to the *Standard for Instant Noodles* (CXS 249-2006), a group of 8 phosphates (INS 339(i), 339(ii), 339(iii), 340(i), 340(ii), 340(iii), 341(iii) and 450(i)) are listed for use as humectants at a use level of 2000 mg/kg, singly or in combination, as phosphorous. The 2016 revision also lists 8 other phosphates (INS 450(iii), 450(v), 450(vi), 451(i), 452(i), 452(ii), 452(iv), and 452(v)) as having a use level of GMP. As phosphates (as food additives) are part of the JECFA group Maximum Tolerable Daily Intake (MTDI) of 70 mg/kg bw/day, expressed as phosphorus from all food sources, it does not make sense that they would have a GMP use level. In looking back at the 2006 version of CXS 249-2006, all 16 of the phosphates were listed as having a use level of 2000 mg/kg, singly or in combination, as phosphorous. Thus, it looks like a typographical error may have been introduced into the 2016 revision to CXS 249-2006. Unless there is reason to do otherwise, it is proposed to use the maximum levels from the 2006 version of the standard for phosphates.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, Indonesia

New Zealand: No comment on this specific note.

However, it has specific comments on the alignment of Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006). These relate to earlier comments on note 6 above, relating to aligning provisions that have draft/proposed provisions in the GSFA, but already have provisions in the Codex commodity standard. The alignment process requires that new entries be added, in bold and underlined for colours, e.g. amaranth, caramel II, tartrazine and curcumin.

Separately, since sodium sorbate (INS 201) was proposed to be discontinued at CCFA50 (2018) (REP18/FA Para. 134(iv)) and accepted at the CAC41 meeting (REP18/CAC Appendix V) (Sodium sorbate has already been removed from CXS 249-2006), the entries for sorbates need to be amended throughout the alignment work to only refer to INS 200, 202 and 203.

Canada: It also made a similar comment to New Zealand relating to adding in alignment entries for the four colours, amaranth, caramel II, curcumin and tartrazine.

Response:

Sodium sorbate had already been removed from some of the provisions in the 1st circular. However, further checking was done and additional amendments made to ensure complete removal from proposed amendments.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, Singapore

Chair's proposal: All 16 phosphates should be associated with the maximum level of 2000 mg/kg, singly or in combination, as phosphorous. The issue regarding the four colours (amaranth, caramel II, curcumin and tartrazine) for the alignment of Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006) has been addressed by adding new entries. Sodium sorbate has been removed from additional entries.

9. A group ADI of 0 - 30 mg/kg bw was established by JECFA that includes sucroglycerides (INS 474), sucrose oligoesters Type I and Type II (INS 473a), and sucrose esters of fatty acids (INS 473). For the past several sessions of the physical working group of the GSFA, the CCFA has consistently adopted provisions for all three additives together for a particular food category, and attached Note 348 (Singly or in combination: Sucrose esters of fatty acids (INS 473), sucrose oligoesters, type I and type II (INS 473a) and sucroglycerides (INS 474). Currently, the 2016 revision of CXS 249-2006 (Instant Noodles) only lists sucrose esters of fatty acids (INS 473) with a use level of 2000 mg/kg. When provisions for food category 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) were considered at the 48th CCFA, the Committee determined that it was appropriate to adopt provisions for INS 473, INS 473a and INS 474 at a maximum level of 2000 mg/kg with Note 348 and Note 194 (For use in instant noodles conforming to the Standard for Instant Noodles (CODEX STAN 249-2006) only). As a result, it seems that the CCFA has already considered this issue, and it is therefore appropriate that all three additives (INS 473, 473a and 474) should be permitted for use in products conforming to CXS 249-2006.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, Indonesia

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand

Chair's proposal: Sucrose esters of fatty acids (INS 473), sucrose oligoesters, type I and type II (INS 473a) and sucroglycerides (INS 474) should be permitted for use in products conforming to the Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006), singly or in combination at a level of 2000 mg/kg.

10. The *Standard for Wheat Flour* (CXS 152-1985) currently includes a list of enzymes (Section 4.1) and a list of flour treatment agents (Section 4.2). Flour treatment agents are considered to be a food additive functional class in the GSFA (as per the *Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives* (CAC/GL 36-1989)). Enzymes, unless they are associated with a food additive functional class, are typically considered to be processing aids. In order to clarify this, it is recommended that Section 4.1 of the Standard be renamed "Processing Aids (Enzymes)", and Section 4.2 of the standard be renamed "Food Additives" with a corresponding reference to the GSFA.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand, Indonesia,

New Zealand: additional comments on the Wheat Flour standard (CXS 152-1985).

It notes that two food additives, listed as flour treatment agents in CXS 152-1985 have not been added to the GSFA provisions as part of the alignment work. These are L-cysteine hydrochloride (INS 920) and potassium ascorbate (INS 303). It agrees that both cannot be added to the GSFA since they do not have a JECFA specification.

It further notes that L-cysteine hydrochloride may potentially function as a processing aid (it is permitted in Australia and New Zealand as a processing aid with the function as a dough conditioner at 75 mg/kg). This raises the question; is it considered a food additive or a processing aid for the GSFA? If it is a processing aid then it could be added under the processing aid subsection in the post alignment CXS 152-1985.

Azodicarbonamide has already been aligned since there is an existing provision in the GSFA. New Zealand questions whether the alignment working group should request JECFA to reconsider the safety of using the food additive since a number of countries have discontinued its use due to safety concerns.

Canada: wondered if the entries for the enzymes should be revised to reflect the name and INS number that are written in the GSFA. That is, alpha amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* Var. (INS 1100(i)) instead of "Fungal amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae*". This comment is also linked to item 11 below.

Like New Zealand it also noted that potassium ascorbate and L-cysteine hydrochloride are listed as flour treatment agents in CXS 152-1985, but they have not been added to the GSFA as part of the alignment process. It suggests new entries be added to Tables 1 and 2.

Response:

Advice sought from the EWG:

Is L-cysteine hydrochloride's primary technological purpose as a food additive (flour treatment agent) or a processing aid when it is used to treat wheat flour? If it is as a processing aid; is it appropriate to include it in the list of processing aids in the post alignment version of CXS 152-1985? If it is as a food additive it is unable to be aligned in the GSFA since it has not been reviewed for safety by JECFA. Potassium ascorbate is also not proposed to be added to the GSFA since it does not have a JECFA specification.

Should the enzyme names now indicated in the standard as processing aids be amended to reflect current GSFA nomenclature?

Should the alignment WG request JECFA to consider the safety of azodicarbonamide (INS 927a) as a food additive with the technological purpose of flour treatment agent, due to safety concerns in countries which have removed permission for its use? JECFA's assessment was conducted in 1965.

It is proposed that lecithin and sodium ascorbate would need to be referred to the INS EWG to assess whether they have the functional class of a flour treatment agent. Alignment should be deferred until this has occurred.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, Singapore

New Zealand

Under Australia and New Zealand regulation, L-cysteine hydrochloride is permitted only as a processing aid, and not as a food additive for wheat flour production. We are not aware of it functioning as a food additive.

Enzyme nomenclature - agree that where the enzyme is the same as one in the GSFA, the names should be consistent, and therefore updated.

Azodicarbonamide (927a) – support further consideration of the safety. JECFA could be approached to provide guidance on this point, before the publication of the meeting paper for CCFA51.

ETA (Enzyme Technical Association)

It does not support the approach proposed for aligning the enzymes for CXS 152-1985 as it is worried that this would limit the enzymes used as processing aids in the production of wheat flour to just the four listed. In its view, all enzymes listed in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission should be able to be used. Therefore, it recommends that section 4.1 remain unchanged, and if there is a desire to identify processing aids within the Standard then a new section be added, which would be similar to that proposed for the Standards dealing with Vegetable Protein Products and Soy Protein Products (items 12 and 13 below):

4.3 Processing aids

During the course of manufacturing wheat flour, the following classes of processing aids, compiled in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, may be used. The processing aids used in products conforming to this standard should be consistent with the *Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids* (CAC/GL 75-2010).

- Enzyme preparations

AMFEP (Association of Manufacturers and Formulators of Enzyme Products)

Its submission was similar to that of the ETA, with a similar suggested amendment. It notes that the enzymes used during production of wheat flour or use of wheat flour are not used as food additives but should be considered processing aids as they have function during the phase of the baking process but are essentially inactivated by the baking process and have no function in the final food. This is the situation for any enzymes used in the production of wheat flour or the use of wheat flour. The enzymes listed as food additives with the functional class and technological purpose of flour treatment agents in FC 06.2 and 06.2.1 in the GSFA are not in alignment with CXS 152-1985.

Its suggestion is that the specific enzymes listed in CXS152-1985 be replaced by a more general description similar to/in alignment with what has been suggested for Vegetable Protein Products and Soy Protein Products via items 12 and 13 in Appendix 1 and E and F of Appendix 4.

Response

The suggestion to add an additional section dealing with processing aids (enzymes) seems appropriate to be more consistent with how other Standards are aligned that refer to enzymes used as processing aids. However, reference will not be made to the Inventory of Processing Aids (IPA) since it is not an official Codex standard but is an inventory list. Amendments also are required in Appendix 4, items E and F (see item 23 below) to also remove reference to the IPA.

It also seems reasonable to make the entry more general to refer to enzyme preparations rather than just the specific enzymes as currently listed, as this list is likely out of date and is very restricted.

Chair's proposal: Section 4.1 and 4.2 of the standard should be renamed as recommended by the ETA and AMFEP above. However, no mention will be made of the IPA since it is not a Codex Standard but is an inventory list. The entry is made more general by referring to enzyme preparations rather than just the couple of currently listed enzymes since this is likely to be out of date and too restrictive.

No new entries for L-cysteine hydrochloride and potassium ascorbate will be added as L-cysteine hydrochloride has not been reviewed by JECFA, and potassium ascorbate does not have a JECFA specification.

The alignment of lecithin and sodium ascorbate should be deferred until the INS EWG has considered whether they have the functional class of flour treatment agent. Therefore, replacement words for section 4.2 (Flour treatment agents) of CXS 152-1985 would need to be deferred to finalise the alignment.

It was separately proposed by one EWG member to request that JECFA be asked to provide guidance on the safety of azodicarbonamide.

11. There are several enzymes that are currently adopted in Food Category 06.2 (Flours and starches (including soybean powder)) and 06.2.1 (Flours) of the GSFA based on their functional class of flour treatment agent. Enzymes are currently listed in the *Standard for Wheat Flour* (CXS 152-1985) as enzymes, likely meaning that they were intended for use as processing aids. The EWG should consider whether or not the enzymes included in Food Category 06.2 (Alpha amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* var., Alpha-amylase from *Bacillus subtilis*, Carbohydrase from *Bacillus licheniformis*) and Food Category 06.2.1 (Protease from *Aspergillus oryzae* var.) as food additives with the functional class of flour treatment agent should be permitted for use as food additives in products conforming to CXS 152-1985. It is likely that most of these enzymes were included in the GSFA as a result of their listing in CXS 152-1985 (as enzymes).

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand

Response: Seek EWG (especially enzyme manufacturers) comments on this suggestion.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand (advice from enzyme suppliers/manufacturers will be helpful).

Response:

Further consideration of the ETA and AMFEP submissions to item 10 above has suggested a changed approach where reference to enzymes as processing aids is made more general and not limited to just those listed in CXS 152-1985 as these are likely to be out of date. There seems no good reason to limit which enzymes are used as processing aids in the production of wheat flour since Codex does not assess them, unlike if they are used as food additives.

Chair's proposal: Make the provisions of enzymes used as processing aids general to enzyme preparations rather than limit it to the current list which is not likely to represent current practice for CXS 152-1985.

12. Section 4 "Food Additives" of the *General Standard for Vegetable Protein Products* (CXS 174-1989) contains the statement:

"During the course of manufacturing VPP the following classes of processing aids, as compiled in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, may be used: Acidity Regulators, Antifoam Agents, Firming Agents, Enzyme Preparations, Extraction Solvents, Antidusting Agents, Flour Treatment Agents, and Viscosity Control Agents."

Based on this statement, it appears that only processing aids (and not food additives) were intended for use in the manufacture of products conforming to CXS 174-1989. As a result, it is proposed that a "Section 4.1 Processing Aids" be added to the standard with the text noted above retained with minor editing. Likewise, a new section "Section 4.2 Food Additives" is proposed along with the following statement: "Food additives are not permitted in products conforming to this standard." A similar statement will be included in the section at the end of Table 3 "References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives".

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore,

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand

Additional New Zealand comments

It notes that if in the future, food additives are requested in these products, the commodity standard may need revising. CXS 174 describes these products as raw materials only; they are not foods sold as such. This means that food additives can be used when the 'vegetable protein product' is mixed with other ingredients to make other foods.

Chair's proposal: Amendments to the GSFA as part of the alignment work relating to CXS 174-1989 will remain as proposed. Amendments to CXS 174 have been made to remove reference to the IPA.

13. The same issue for item 12 above also applies to the *General Standard for Soy Protein Products* (CXS 175-1989).

Section 4 "Food Additives" of the *General Standard for Soy Protein Products* (CXS 175-1989) contains the statement:

“During the course of manufacturing SPP the following classes of processing aids, as compiled in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, may be used: Acidity Regulators, Antifoam Agents, Firming Agents, Enzyme Preparations, Extraction Solvents, Antidusting Agents, Flour Treatment Agents, and Viscosity Control Agents.”

Based on this statement, it appears that only processing aids (and not food additives) were intended for use in the manufacture of products conforming to CXS 175-1989. As a result, it is proposed that a “Section 4.1 Processing Aids” be added to the standard with the text noted above retained. Likewise, a new section “Section 4.2 Food Additives” is proposed along with the following statement: “Food additives are not permitted in products conforming to this standard.” A similar statement will be included in the section at the end of Table 3 “References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives”

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand

Additional New Zealand comments

Same comment as for question 12 above.

Chair’s proposal: Amendments to the GSFA as part of the alignment work relating to CXS 175-1989 will remain as proposed. Amendments to CXS 175 have been made to remove reference to the IPA.

14. Relates to Appendix 5 (Consideration of the addition of a footnote in Table 3 of the GSFA).

A request was made that the EWG on Alignment consider adding a footnote to make it clear to users of this portion of Table 3 that only commodity standards that fall under GSFA food categories that are not in the Annex to Table 3 will be listed. The proposed text for the footnote is as follows:

“This Section only lists Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is not listed in the Annex to Table 3. Provisions for the use of specific Table 3 additives in Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is listed in the Annex to Table 3 can be found in the corresponding Food Categories in Tables 1 and 2.”

The EWG on Alignment was requested to consider whether this footnote (or a revised version) should be added to the section of Table 3 “References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives” at the bottom of Appendix 5 in the 1st circular.

Comments on 1st circular

Agree: Singapore, New Zealand

New Zealand indicates that further clarity could be provided that the section only includes commodity standards that have been aligned with the GSFA, and that once the alignment process has been completed that part of the footnote could be removed.

Response:

It may not be obvious to users who are not involved with CCFA that the Committee has only aligned a fraction of all commodity standards. There is some merit to adding a statement that the alignment process is a work in progress, and that not all commodity standards are listed.

EWG comments were sought on the additional suggestion.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, IDF

IDF additional comment

As this work may take several years, additional clarity that the section only includes notation of those standards that have been aligned should be included by inserting appropriate text.

Chair’s proposal: Add to the original amendment as proposed by providing additional clarity that the section only includes commodity standards that have been aligned with the GSFA as below, or amended as appropriate.

“This Section only lists Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is not listed in the Annex to Table 3. Provisions for the use of specific Table 3 additives in Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is listed in the Annex to Table 3 can be found in the corresponding Food Categories in Tables 1 and 2. Be aware that the process to align food additive permissions in commodity standards with the GSFA is a work in progress, and as a result not all commodity standards are yet listed in this Section.”

15. Appendix 6 (Proposed revisions relating to ASCORBYL ESTERS in food categories 13.1.1, 13.1.2 and 13.1.3 of the GSFA)

Comments on the 1st circular

Supports: Indonesia

Both New Zealand and ISDI supports the removal of note 15 for the reasons explained in Appendix 6.

However, they also suggests that the permissions and notes should be consistent between food category 13.1.1 (infant formulae) and 13.1.3 (formulae for special medical purposes for infants) since they are consistent in the commodity standard (CXS 72-1981) to more fully align. They propose that note 10 should also be removed and note 187 added to food category 13.1.3. They suggest that these amendments are within the scope of the alignment work since they relate to ASCORBYL ESTERS. These amendments would need to be made in both Tables 1 & 2.

Canada also questioned whether note 10 should be associated with FC 13.1.3 (same suggestion as New Zealand and ISDI).

Response:

Seek EWG views on the suggestion: to also remove note 10 and add note 187 to food category 13.1.3 to be consistent with food category 13.1.1 and aligned with the relevant commodity standard, being CXS 72-1981. These amendments would need to be made in both Tables 1 & 2.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: New Zealand (as per comments to 1st circular), Singapore, ISDI (as per comments to the 1st circular)

ISDI pointed out that the proposed amendments detailed in the chair’s proposal to Table 1 in Appendix 6 relating to food category 13.1.3 to remove note 10 had not been made.

Response

This has been corrected; note 10 has been removed from food category 13.1.3 in Table 1 of the GSFA in Appendix 6.

Chair’s proposal: In addition to making the proposed amendments in Appendix 6, to also remove note 10 and add note 187 to food category 13.1.3.

16 Brazil provided comments proposing additional entries to Table 1 and 2 for three food additives (carotenes, beta-, vegetable (160(a)(ii)); natamycin (pimaricin) (235); and nisin (234)) related to aligning the *Standard for Samsø* (CXS 268-1966). The proposed amendments were to add new entries for the food category 1.6.2 (ripened cheese).

Response:

No changes were viewed as being required since all three proposed amendments are already aligned in the GSFA, with entries for natamycin and nisin already in food category 1.6.2, and an entry for carotenes, beta-, vegetable already in food category 1.6.2.1. The current provisions are as suggested by Brazil and consistent with the GSFA.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, IDF

Chair’s proposal: Not make the changes as suggested since the amendments are already aligned.

17 Brazil made the comment that there is a provision in CXS 268-1966 for potassium propionate with INS 282. This is incorrect since INS 282 relates to calcium propionate, while 283 corresponds to potassium propionate. It therefore questions whether the alignment provision should be for potassium propionate or calcium propionate.

Response:

Assistance was sought and obtained from the IDF as part of the alignment work for ripened cheeses. The IDF checked with its members and confirmed that the appropriate food additive is calcium propionate (with INS 282) not potassium propionate (INS 283). Calcium propionate has a provision in the Standard for whey cheeses (CXS 284-1971) for whey protein cheese which is already aligned in the GSFA (food category 01.6.6). Also the *Codex General Standard for Cheese* (CXS 283-1976), the umbrella standard for the individual ripened cheese standards, also lists calcium propionate (INS 282), but does not mention potassium propionate (INS 283).

Any additional information on this issue from the EWG would be appreciated.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand, IDF

Chair's proposal: Stay with the proposed entry for calcium propionate (INS 282) for the alignment work for specific ripened cheese standards.

18 Both New Zealand and Brazil suggested an amendment to the proposed amendments for food additives due to alignment for the *Standard for Sugars* (CXS 212-1999). This is section C in Appendix 3. Both submissions note that the sentence 'Powdered sugar and powdered dextrose may have up to 5% starch added if no anticaking agent is used' should not be deleted as it is important to maintain this statement. Currently it is not explicitly addressed in aligning the food additive provisions into the GSFA.

Response:

The suggestion is supported, as it is important for alignment that this provision be maintained.

'Powdered sugar and powdered dextrose' is food category 11.1.2 in the GSFA. There is an existing note, being note 56 (excluding products where starch is present) which is linked to the CXS 212-1999 condition.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: Brazil, New Zealand (plus supports revised drafting in the document), Singapore

Chair's proposal: Retain the sentence in CXS 212-1999 as suggested to ensure clarity.

19 EU Specialty Food Ingredients provided a suggestion relating to the provisions for lutein from *Tagetes erecta* (161b(i)) in Appendix 2. It notes that the recent 2018 86th session of JECFA re-evaluated the safety of lutein and zeaxanthin and concluded an ADI of "not specified" was appropriate. It suggests that lutein (from *Tagetes erecta*) could be included in Table 3, as the provision for lutein in ripened cheeses would be captured.

Response:

The provision for lutein from *Tagetes erecta* in Appendix 2 is a draft provision with the recommendation to maintain this at step 4. Also there are exclusion notes proposed for all the 13 ripened cheese as part of the alignment work since this colour is not listed for use in the individual commodity standards. Therefore, it is inappropriate to add lutein from *Tagetes erecta* (161b(i)) to Table 3 as part of the alignment work. Even if the food additive was added to Table 3 as part of any other GSFA process it would still be inappropriate to add provisions to ripened cheese food categories in the GSFA as part of the alignment work since there are no provisions for the additive in the ripened cheese standards.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: New Zealand, Singapore, IDF

Chair's proposal: Not make the suggested change for the reasons above.

20 Canada suggested seeking the EWG view on whether it is appropriate to consider the propionates (propionic acid (280), sodium propionate (281) and calcium propionate (282)) as Table 3 food additives for the provisions of ripened cheeses, rather than the straight alignment as proposed in Appendix 2, which it agrees is consistent with the alignment process. Its suggestion is to add a note to the entries ("for surface treatment only" or "for the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese only").

The justification for this suggestion is the current entries for these food additives in Table 3. As well, JECFA has since revised the ADI for propionates to "not limited" and so changing the maximum level of use from 3000 mg/kg to GMP may be appropriate.

This same suggestion was also made for other food additives, being anticaking agents, calcium silicate (552), magnesium silicate, synthetic (553(ii), silicon dioxide, amorphous (551) and talc (553(iii)).

If this suggestion is not supported then exclusion notes are required: XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277 for the propionates, and XS274, XS276, XS277 for the anticaking agents.

Response:

The alignment process has required the entries to be made to Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA due to the numerical maximum levels in the standards for these food additives. However, it is also noted that food category number 01.6.2.1 is not listed in the annex to Table 3 and these food additives are listed in Table 3. So there could well be confusion with users of the GSFA: whether these food additives can be used at GMP (since they are listed in Table 3 and 01.6.2.1 is not listed to the annex to table 3); or they have numerical provisions as listed in entries in Tables 1 and 2.

Comments sought from EWG on Canada's suggestion to align the entries for:

Propionates ((propionic acid (280), sodium propionate (281) and calcium propionate (282))

Anticaking agents (calcium silicate (552), magnesium silicate, synthetic (553(ii), silicon dioxide, amorphous (551) and talc (553(iii))) in Table 3, at GMP with additional note for the propionates, rather than aligning into Tables 1 and 2 with the ML as listed in the commodity standards.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree (to stay with the current numerical values, not GMP or entry into Table 3): New Zealand, Singapore, IDF

New Zealand and IDF additional comments

Agree with the chair's proposal, especially as this is consistent with the alignment process utilizing the Decision Tree.

A possible, later mechanism for change could be to channel a proposal through the GSFA EWG if governments could demonstrate an acceptable justification for making such changes.

Chair's proposal: Stay with the current alignment process as reflected by the current decision tree approach which has been supported by EWG comments received. This is, to stay with numerical MLs in Tables 1 and 2 including adding the appropriate exclusions notes.

The further justification for this approach is that the principle of making any substantial changes to the GSFA (e.g. 3000 mg/kg to GMP) should be considered by the GSFA WG and not by the alignment WG.

Issue for the PWG

Does the PWG agree that the issue raised by Canada (amending the MLs of specific food additives when JECFA has re-evaluated the ADI to "not limited" and so an argument can be made for the ML to be GMP and so added to Table 3) is best addressed by the GSFA WG compared to the alignment WG?

21 Canada suggested that in aligning propylene glycol alginate (405) and stearoyl lactylates (481(i), 482(i)), from CXS 249-2006 that the current notes (194 and 371) in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA were contradictory (within Appendix 4). This is because note 194 is for use in instant noodles conforming to CXS 249 only, while note 371 deals with boiled noodles only (whether standardised or not), which are not addressed within CXS249. Canada recommends that note 194 should be removed.

Note 194: For use in instant noodles conforming to the Standard for Instant Noodles (CODEX STAN 249-2006) only.

Note 371: For use at 10,000 mg/kg in boiled noodles only.

Response:

Food category 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) is broader than just noodles so it is not agreed that the two notes are in conflict, as they appear to deal with separate issues and separate different provisions and MLs.

Comments on 2nd circular

Singapore

It notes that food category 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) is broader than just noodles. However, by virtue of the 2 Notes (194 and 371), the provisions for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) and stearoyl lactylates (INS 481(i), 482(i)) seemingly apply only to two groups of products within these categories: (1) instant noodles conforming to the Standard for Instant Noodles (CODEX STAN 249-2006) and (2) boiled noodles. If the intention is to allow the use of INS 405 and INS 481(i) & (ii) in the broader category of FC 06.4.3, the Notes should be rephrased so as to accurately reflect the intentions.

Response:

It is noted that the entries for both additives were made to the GSFA in 2016, and CXS 249 was also recently amended in 2016 and 2018. Without any additional information or explicit concern with the provisions it is not viewed appropriate to make any changes to the GSFA as part of the alignment work.

Chair's proposal: No change is proposed.

22 Canada suggested additional notes (became D-CXS249, E-CXS249 and F-CXS249) within Appendix 4 dealing with the alignment of CXS249-2006 and the GSFA to make it explicit for which technological purpose (anticaking agent, flour treatment agent and acidity regulator respectively) various food additives had provisions for.

Response:

These suggestions are not wrong, or incorrect but the decision has been taken earlier not to add them as it is argued that they are not necessary, unless specific clarity is needed.

Chair's proposal: The proposed new notes D-CXS-249 and F-CXS249 have not been added as they are believed to not be necessary. Note E-CXS249 has been added since it clarifies that only some of the sulphites have provisions as flour treatment agents.

23 In Appendix 4, parts E and F it is proposed to make amendments to the commodity standards dealing with provisions of processing aids. These amendments are to update the reference to "advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission" relating to processing aids to the Inventory of Processing Aids (IPA) database¹. This is because the 42nd CCFA meeting agreed to establish a database on processing aids. As well the sentence used in the 2016 alignment work dealing with processing aids, that such processing aids need to be consistent with the *Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids* (CAC/GL 75-2010) should also be included.

Comments sought from EWG on these suggestions, made in parts E and F of Appendix 4.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: New Zealand, Singapore

Additional New Zealand comments

It supports a reference to the *Guidelines on Substances Used as Processing Aids*, but do not support a reference to the IPA database. The IPA database is for information only, and sits outside Codex.

Response

New Zealand's comment is noted and supported. The EWG alignment chair had made a decision in the 2015 alignment report that it was inappropriate to refer to the IPA in the GSFA since it is not an official Codex Standard but is an inventory list. But reference to the *Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids* (CAC/GL 75-2010) has been included in Codex standards as part of the alignment work and is supported.

Chair's proposal: To make amendments to the General Standards for Vegetable Protein Products (VPP) CXS 174-1989 and Soy Protein Products (CXS 175-1989) in relation to processing aids. These amendments are to refer to the Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids (CAC/GL 75-2010) and remove reference to the IPA Database.

24 Canada proposed to remove the two tables for food categories 06.8.8 and 12.10 proposed to be added to the References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives after the annex to Table 3. The reason for removal is that it is proposed to say that food additives are not permitted in products conforming to these standards and therefore are not required.

Response:

The view is that it is still valuable to add these tables to ensure clarity and certainty. The two relevant food categories (06.8.8 and 12.10) are not listed in the annex to Table 3 so some stakeholders may incorrectly conclude that Table 3 food additives can be used in products included in these food categories.

Comments on 2nd circular

Agree: New Zealand, Singapore

Chair's proposal: Keep the two tables as proposed to be added to the References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives.

¹ IPA Database by CCFA, http://ipa.cfsa.net.cn/login?task=index_pro

25. Brazil proposed in comments to the 2nd circular to add note 178 (as carminic acid) to the entry for carmines (INS 120) and note 62 (as copper) for the entry for CHLOROPHYLLS AND CHLOROPHYLLINS, COPPER COMPLEXES (INS 141(i),(ii)) in the entries to Tables 1 and 2 in Appendix 2. The justification for both suggested additional entries is that these are used for other entries for the food additives for some but not all food categories.

Chair's proposal: Add the additional notes as suggested, being note 178 for carmines (INS 120) and note 62 for CHLOROPHYLLS AND CHLOROPHYLLINS, COPPER COMPLEXES (INS 141(i),(ii)).

26. Brazil proposed in comments to the 2nd circular an amendment to Note A-CXS152 within Appendix 4. The suggestion was to add the words "at 45 mg/kg" so that the note would read:

Note A-CXS152: For flours for leavened bread only in products conforming to the Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985) at 45 mg/kg.

This suggestion is not supported since the maximum level for the entry is already 45 mg/kg, so there is no need to add this to the note. If the ML was different then the appropriate ML for the alignment would be added.

Chair's proposal: not make the change for the above reason.

Appendix 2

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE CODEX COMMODITY STANDARDS FOR MILK AND MILK PRODUCTS (RIPENED CHESES) AND TABLES 1, 2 AND 3 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO RIPENED CHESES**General background for GSFA alignment work**

The work to align food additive provisions of Codex commodity Standards with the GSFA has been conducted using the Information Document “Guidance to Commodity Committees on the Alignment of Food Additive Provisions”. In particular it used the Decision Tree approach, provided as Attachment 2 to the Information Document.

Working Principles

The general reference to the GSFA that is to be included in the commodity standard (Appendix 2) needs to take into account the fact that there are limitations due to the listing of specific additives in the commodity standard. Therefore, when applying the provisions in the commodity standard to the GSFA for alignment:

- A new provision for an additive is added to the GSFA only if there is a provision for that additive in the commodity standard, but currently no provision for that additive in the GSFA in the relevant food category. According to Box G of the Decision Tree a provision is added by use of a Note to limit the use of products conforming to the commodity standard unless evidence of a technical reason otherwise (i.e. evidence justifying the need for non-standardised products).
- Only adopted GSFA additive provisions are considered for alignment with the commodity standards at this time. However, draft and proposed draft GSFA additive provisions are considered if:
 - The commodity standard is revised to include only a general reference to the GSFA, and the use of these additives listed in the standardized food would not be recorded elsewhere.²
 - The GSFA food additive provision needs to be revised to include appropriate note(s) to describe the use of the additive in the relevant commodity standard(s) (e.g., to exclude food products subject to the relevant commodity standard, to indicate a different use level in food products subject to the relevant commodity standard). The rationale for this is the following: Some GSFA food categories that include the relevant commodity standard(s) also include non-standardized food products. Therefore, CCFA still needs to discuss the use of these food additives in non-standardized foods. As such, these draft and proposed draft food additive provisions are maintained at their current step. The new note(s) associated with these draft and proposed draft food additive provisions address the alignment with the relevant commodity standard(s), and will be retained when CCFA discusses the food additive provisions in the future.
- An appropriate note is associated with the relevant GSFA additive provision to include a limitation from the commodity standard. For example, the “XS###” Notes are used to denote the exclusion of the commodity standard from the GSFA provision (i.e., there is a provision in the GSFA for the additive, but the additive is not listed in the commodity standard).

² This approach was taken in the alignment of the food additive provisions in the *Standard for Bouillons and Consommés* (CODEX STAN 117-1981; see CX/FA 15/47/6). CCFA47 agreed to align several draft food additive provisions in the GSFA with the food additive provisions in the commodity standard because the commodity standard was revised to include only a general reference to the GSFA, and the use of these additives in the standardized food would not be recorded elsewhere (i.e., azorubine, curcumin, quinoline yellow, sucrose esters of fatty acids, tartrazine, and tocopherols). These aligned draft GSFA provisions were put forward for adoption (REP 15/FA, Appendix VII, Part F) and were adopted by the 38th Codex Alimentarius Commission (CAC38) at Step 8 (REP 15/CAC, Appendix III).

- If a commodity standard lists an individual additive that is included under a “group” additive in the GSFA (e.g., SULFITES, ASCORBYL ESTERS in the current work), and the individual additives in the group that have the same functional class(es) as the additive listed in the relevant commodity standard are expected to be appropriate for the use specified in the relevant commodity standard, then the alignment should include all the individual additives with the appropriate functional class(es) in the group.³

The recommendations for alignment should be to amend the GSFA provisions in Tables 1 and 2, rather than *add* provisions (the latter applies only to the situation described in the first bullet point). There can only be one provision in the GSFA for a given food category for an additive. Therefore, the recommendations are to amend (revise) existing GSFA provisions to take into account the provisions in the commodity standard. As such, the recommendations with the proposed revisions to the GSFA are presented in a single table, with the same data each in Table 1 and Table 2 format. This presentation would eliminate any confusion or misinterpretation as to the final provision in the GSFA.

1. Proposed amendments to the Codex commodity Standards for ripened cheeses

The following amendments to the Food Additive Provisions are proposed.

New text is indicated in **bold/underline**. Text to be removed is indicated in ~~strikethrough~~.

A. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR CHEDDAR (CXS 263-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. ~~Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified.~~ **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators, anticaking agents and colours in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
101(i)	Riboflavin, syntentic	300 mg/kg
140	Chlorophylls	Limited by GMP
160a(i)	Carotene, beta , synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, beta , <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	35 mg/kg
160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8'	singly or in combination

³ This approach was taken in the alignment of POLYSORBATES in the *Standard for Chocolate and Chocolate Products* (CODEX STAN 87-1981) with GSFA food category 05.1.4 (Cocoa and chocolate products). The commodity standard specified a single polysorbate (INS 435) for use as an emulsifier. CCFA48 discussed inclusion of the other polysorbates with the functional class emulsifier, and revised the relevant GSFA note associated with POLYSORBATES in food category 05.1.4 accordingly (CX/FA 16/48/6). The aligned provision for polysorbates was put forward for adoption (REP 16/FA, Appendix VII, Part G) and was adopted by CAC39 (REP 16/CAC, Appendix III).

160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, beta-, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

B. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR DANBO (CXS 264-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators, anticaking agents and colours in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	—
Bleaching agents:	—	—
Acidity regulators:	X	—
Stabilizers:	—	—
Thickeners:	—	—
Emulsifiers:	—	—
Antioxidants:	—	—
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	—	—
Anti-caking agents:	—	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

- X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.
 – The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
101(i)	Riboflavin, syntenthic	300 mg/kg
140	Chlorophylls	Limited by GMP
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	
201	Sodium sorbate	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, — silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

C. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR EDAM (CXS 265-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	—
Bleaching agents:	—	—
Acidity regulators:	X	—
Stabilizers:	—	—
Thickeners:	—	—

Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	12.5 mg/kg
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

D. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR GOUDA (CXS 266-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

E. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR HAVARTI (CXS 267-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995)* in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono-delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, — silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

F. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR SAMSØ (CXS 268-1966)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		

460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

G. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR EMMENTAL (CXS 269-1967)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, beta , synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, beta , <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, beta , vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	12.5 mg/kg
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP

504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

H. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR TILSITER (CXS 270-1968)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	12.5 mg/kg
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg
252	Potassium nitrate	singly or in combination

		(expressed as nitrate ion)
280	Propionic acid	
281	Sodium propionate	3 000 mg/kg
282	Potassium propionate	surface treatment only *
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg
552	Calcium silicate	singly or in combination, silicates
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	calculated as silicon dioxide
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

I. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR SAINT-PAULIN (CXS 271-1968)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators and anticaking agents in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts – norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	

203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	12.5 mg/kg
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg
252	Potassium nitrate	singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg
281	Sodium propionate	surface treatment only *
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg
552	Calcium silicate	singly or in combination, silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

J. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR PROVOLONE (CXS 272-1968)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Anticaking agents, colours and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators, anticaking agents and colours in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	X	X
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	X ^(b)

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

(b) For the surface of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese, only.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg

160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
171	Titanium dioxide	Limited by GMP
Preservatives		
1105	Lysozyme	Limited by GMP
200	Sorbic acid	1 000 mg/kg based on sorbic acid. Surface treatment only *
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
234	Nisin	
235	Natamycin (pimaricin)	2 mg/dm ² Not present at a depth of 5 mm. Surface treatment only *
239	Hexamethylene tetramine	25 mg/kg Expressed as formaldehyde
251	Sodium nitrate	35 mg/kg singly or in combination (expressed as nitrate ion)
252	Potassium nitrate	
280	Propionic acid	3 000 mg/kg surface treatment only *
281	Sodium propionate	
282	Potassium propionate	
Acidity regulators		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Limited by GMP
504 (i)	Magnesium carbonate	Limited by GMP
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP
Anticaking agents		
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Limited by GMP
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Limited by GMP
551	Silicon dioxide, amorphous	10 000 mg/kg singly or in combination, — silicates calculated as silicon dioxide
552	Calcium silicate	
553(i)	Magnesium silicate, synthetic	
553(iii)	Talc	

* For the definition of cheese surface and rind see Appendix to the *General Standard for Cheese* (CODEX STAN 283-1978).

K. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR COULOMMIERS (CXS 274-1969)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Colours used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	—
Bleaching agents:	—	—
Acids	—	—
Acidity regulators:	X	—
Stabilizers:	—	—
Thickeners:	—	—
Emulsifiers:	—	—
Antioxidants:	—	—
Preservatives:	—	—
Foaming agents:	—	—
Anti-caking agents:	—	—

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

— The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Acidity regulators		
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP

L. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR CAMEMBERT (CXS 276-1973)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Colours used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acids	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	–	–
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	–

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, <i>beta</i> -apo-8'	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Acidity regulators		
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP

M. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR BRIE (CXS 277-1973)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Only those additives classes indicated as justified in the table below may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. **Colours used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 01.6.2.1 (Ripened cheese, includes rind) and only certain acidity regulators in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

Additive functional class:	Justified use	
	Cheese mass	Surface/rind treatment
Colours:	X ^(a)	–
Bleaching agents:	–	–
Acids	–	–
Acidity regulators:	X	–
Stabilizers:	–	–
Thickeners:	–	–
Emulsifiers:	–	–
Antioxidants:	–	–
Preservatives:	–	–
Foaming agents:	–	–
Anti-caking agents:	–	–

(a) Only to obtain the colour characteristics, as described in Section 2.

X The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

– The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

INS no.	Name of additive	Maximum level
Colours		
160a(i)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, synthetic	35 mg/kg singly or in combination
160a(iii)	Carotene, <i>beta</i> -, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i>	
160e	Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-	
160f	Carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'-	
160a(ii)	Carotenes, <i>beta</i> -, vegetable	600 mg/kg
160b(ii)	Annatto extracts — norbixin-based	25 mg/kg
Acidity regulators		
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Limited by GMP

2. Proposed amendments to Table 1, 2 and 3 of the GSFA for ripened cheeses

Provisions shown in green text are provided for information only, and will be maintained at their current step.

Cheddar (CXS 263-1966)
 Danbo (CXS 264-1966)
 Edam (CXS 265-1966)
 Gouda (CXS 266-1966)
 Havarti (CXS 267-1966)
 Samsø (CXS 268-1966)
 Emmental (CXS 269-1967)
 Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968)
 Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968)
 Provolone (CXS 272-1968)
 Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969)
 Camembert (CXS 276-1973)
 Brie (CXS 277-1973)

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 1

FOOD CATEGORY 01.6.2

Canthaxanthin INS 161g: Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2	Ripened Cheese	15 mg/kg	201, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Caramel II, sulphite caramel INS 150b: Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese</u>	<u>50 000 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264,</u> <u>XS265, XS266,</u> <u>XS267, XS268,</u> <u>XS269, XS270,</u> <u>XS271, XS272,</u> <u>XS274, XS276,</u> <u>XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>

Curcumin INS 100(i): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese</u>	<u>500 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264,</u> <u>XS265, XS266,</u> <u>XS267, XS268,</u> <u>XS269, XS270,</u> <u>XS271, XS272,</u> <u>XS274, XS276,</u> <u>XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>

Lutein from <i>Tagetes erecta</i> INS 161b(j): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese</u>	<u>GMP</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>

Lysozyme INS 1105: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2	Ripened Cheese	GMP	<u>XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt

Natamycin (Pimaricin) INS 235: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2	Ripened Cheese	40 mg/kg	3, 80, <u>XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u>

Nisin INS 234: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2	Ripened Cheese	12.5 mg/kg	<u>233, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt

<u>Nitrates (Sodium nitrate, Potassium nitrate)</u> <u>INS 251, 252: Functional class: Colour retention agent, Preservative</u>				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese</u>	<u>35 mg/kg</u>	<u>30, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u> <u>Make this as part of the alignment work, noting there is also DRAFT provisions at Step 7 (with ML of 40 mg/kg).</u> Plus CCFA EWG is separately investigating nitrates and nitrites.

Sorbates INS 200, 202, 203: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2	Ripened Cheese	3000 mg/kg	42, <u>AA, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt

Zeaxanthin, synthetic INS 161h(j): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese</u>	<u>100 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>

FOOD CATEGORY 01.6.2.1

Annatto extracts – norbixin-based INS 160b(ii): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>25 mg/kg</u>	<u>185, GG</u>	<u>Adopt</u> <u>Make this as part of the alignment work, noting there is also DRAFT provisions at Step 4</u>

Ascorbyl esters, ascorbyl palmitate, ascorbyl stearate INS 304, 305: Functional class: Antioxidant				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	500 mg/kg	10, &-112, <u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt

Calcium propionate INS 282: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	<u>3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Calcium silicate INS 552: Functional class: Anticaking agent				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	<u>DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Caramel IV – sulfite ammonia caramel INS 150d: Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	50000 mg/kg	201, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Carmines INS 120: Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	125 mg/kg	178, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Carotenoids INS 160a(i),a(iii),e,f: Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	100 mg/kg	<u>BB, GG</u>	Adopt

Chlorophylls and chlorophyllins, copper complexes INS 141(i),(ii): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	15 mg/kg	62, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol INS 472e: Functional class: Emulsifier, Sequestrant, Stabilizer				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	10000 mg/kg	XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Hexamethylene tetramine INS 239: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	25 mg/kg	66, & 298, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Lauric arginate ethyl ester INS 243: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	200 mg/kg	XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Magnesium silicates, synthetic INS 553(j): Functional class: Anticaking agent				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	<u>DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Paprika extract INS 160c(ii): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>30 mg/kg</u>	<u>39, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 2</u> <u>Maintain at step 2</u>

Propionic acid INS 280: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	<u>3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Riboflavins INS 101(i), (ii), (iii): Functional class: Colour				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind	300 mg/kg	GG, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt

Silicon dioxide, amorphous INS 551: Functional class: Anticaking agent, Antifoaming agent, Carrier				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	<u>DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Sodium propionate INS 281: Functional class: Preservative				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	<u>3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

Talc INS 553(iii): Functional class: Anticaking agent, Glazing agent, Thickener				
Food Category No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>01.6.2.1</u>	<u>Ripened Cheese, includes rind</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	<u>DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	Adopt EWG comments sought

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 2 OF THE GSFA

Food category 01.6.2 Ripened cheese				
Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
Canthaxanthin	161g	15 mg/kg	201, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
<u>Caramel II, sulfite caramel</u>	<u>150b</u>	<u>50000 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>
<u>Curcumin</u>	<u>100(i)</u>	<u>500 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272,</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4</u> <u>Maintain at step 4</u>

			<u>XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	
<u>Lutein from Tagetes erecta</u>	<u>160b(i)</u>	<u>GMP</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4 Maintain at step 4</u>
<u>Lysozyme</u>	<u>1105</u>	<u>GMP</u>	<u>XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u>
<u>Natamycin (Pimaricin)</u>	<u>235</u>	<u>40 mg.kg</u>	<u>3, 80, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u>
<u>Nisin</u>	<u>234</u>	<u>12.5 mg/kg</u>	<u>233, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u>
<u>Nitrates</u>	<u>251, 252</u>	<u>35 mg/kg</u>	<u>30, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u> <u>Make this as part of the alignment work, noting there is also DRAFT provisions at Step 7 (with ML of 40 mg/kg).</u> Plus CCFA EWG is separately investigating nitrates and nitrites.
<u>Sorbates</u>	<u>200, 202, 203</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	<u>42, AA, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	
<u>Zeaxanthin, synthetic</u>	<u>161h(i)</u>	<u>100 mg/kg</u>	<u>XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>DRAFT, Step 4 Maintain at step 4</u>

Food category 01.6.2.1 Ripened cheese, includes rind				
Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Recommendations
<u>Annatto extracts – norbixin-based</u>	<u>160b(ii)</u>	<u>25 mg/kg</u>	<u>185, GG</u>	<u>Adopt</u> <u>Make this as part of the alignment work, noting there is also DRAFT provisions at Step 4</u>
<u>Ascorbyl esters</u>	<u>304, 305</u>	<u>500 mg/kg</u>	<u>10, &-112, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u>
<u>Calcium propionate</u>	<u>282</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	<u>3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u> EWG comments sought
<u>Calcium silicate</u>	<u>552</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	<u>DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277</u>	<u>Adopt</u> EWG comments sought
<u>Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia caramel</u>	<u>150d</u>	<u>50000 mg/kg</u>	<u>201, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269,</u>	<u>Adopt</u>

			XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	
Carmines	120	125 mg/kg	178, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
Carotenoids	160a(i),a(iii),e,f	100 mg/kg	BB, GG	Adopt
Chlorophylls and chlorophyllins, copper complexes	141(i),(ii)	15 mg/kg	62, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	472e	10000 mg/kg	XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
Hexamethylene tetramine	239	25 mg/kg	66, & 298, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
Lauric arginate ethyl ester	243	200 mg/kg	XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
<u>Magnesium silicates, synthetic</u>	<u>553(i)</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt EWG comments sought
<u>Paprika extract</u>	<u>160c(ii)</u>	<u>30 mg/kg</u>	39, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	<u>DRAFT, Step 2 Maintain at step 2</u>
<u>Propionic acid</u>	<u>280</u>	<u>3000 mg/kg</u>	3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt EWG comments sought
Riboflavins	101 (i), (ii), (iii)	300 mg/kg	GG, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt
<u>Silicon dioxide, amorphous</u>	<u>551</u>	<u>10000 mg/kg</u>	DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt EWG comments sought

Sodium propionate	281	3000 mg/kg	3, EE, XS269, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt EWG sought	comments
Talc	553(iii)	10000 mg/kg	DD, FF, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopt EWG sought	comments

NOTES

XS263: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966)

XS264: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Danbo (CXS 264-1966)

XS265: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Edam (CXS 265-1966)

XS266: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Gouda (CXS 266-1966)

XS267: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Havarti (CXS 267-1966)

XS268: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Samsø (CXS 268-1966)

XS269: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Emmental (CXS 269-1967)

XS270: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968)

XS271: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968)

XS272: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Provolone (CXS 272-1968)

XS274: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969)

XS276: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Camembert (CXS 276-1973)

XS277: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Brie (CXS 277-1973)

AA: Except for use in products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968) and Provolone (CXS 272-1968): at a maximum level of 1000 mg/kg for surface treatment only.

BB: Except for use in products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973); singly or in combination at 35 mg/kg.

DD Singly or in combination: silicon dioxide, amorphous (INS 551), calcium silicate (INS 552), magnesium silicate, synthetic (INS 553(i)) and talc (INS 553(iii)) in products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966) Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968) and Provolone (CXS 272-1968): silicates calculated as silicon dioxide.

EE Singly or in combination: propionic acid (INS 280), sodium propionate (INS 281) and calcium propionate (INS 282) in products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966) Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968) and Provolone (CXS 272-1968).

FF For the surface treatment of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese only.

GG For use in cheeses mass only.

298 For use only in products conforming to the Standard for Pprovolone (CXS 272-1968). ~~cheese only~~

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 3 OF THE GSFA

Section 2 of Table 3

In the case of the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973) the intention of the commodity committee has been to allow only certain Table 3 additives.

Therefore it is proposed to add the following to Section 2 of the Annex to Table 3 of the GSFA

01.6.2.1	Ripened Cheese, includes rind
	Only certain Table 3 additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to these standards. Acidity regulators are only acceptable for use in the cheese mass. Colours are only for use in the cheese mass to obtain the colour characteristics as described in Section 2 of the commodity standard. Anticaking agents are only justified for the surface treatment of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese.
Codex standards	Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967) Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973)

AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 3

This table identifies certain Table 3 food additive permissions for the Codex standards for certain ripened cheeses.

INS No.	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Colour, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Stabilizer	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966, CS 265-1966, CS 266-1966, CS 267-1966, CS 268-1966, CS 269-1967, CS 270-1968, CS 271-1968, CS 272-1968,</u>
140	Chlorophylls	Colour	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966,</u>
575	Glucono delta-lactone	Acidity regulator, Raising agent, Sequestrant	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966, CS 265-1966, CS 266-1966, CS 267-1966, CS 268-1966, CS 269-1967, CS 270-1968, CS 271-1968, CS 272-1968, CS 274-1969, CS276-1973, CS277-1973</u>
504(i)	Magnesium carbonate	Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Colour retention agent	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966, CS 265-1966, CS 266-1966, CS 267-1966, CS 268-1966, CS 269-1967, CS 270-1968, CS 271-</u>

				<u>1968, CS 272-1968,</u>
460(i)	Microcrystalline cellulose (Cellulose gel)	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966, CS 265-1966, CS 266-1966, CS 267-1966, CS 268-1966, CS 269-1967, CS 270-1968, CS 271-1968, CS 272-1968, (for surface treatment only, of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese for all these cheese standards)</u>
460(ii)	Powdered cellulose	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Glazing agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	<u>CS 263-1966, CS 264-1966, CS 265-1966, CS 266-1966, CS 267-1966, CS 268-1966, CS 269-1967, CS 270-1968, CS 271-1968, CS 272-1968, (for surface treatment only, of sliced, cut, shredded or grated cheese for all these cheese standards)</u>
171	Titanium dioxide	Colour	1999	<u>CS 272-1968</u>

Appendix 3

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE CODEX COMMODITY STANDARDS FOR SUGARS (CCS) AND NATURAL MINERAL WATERS (CCNMW) AND TABLES 1, 2 AND 3 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO CCS AND CCNMW

The Codex Standards for sugars and natural mineral waters are included in the following food categories in the GSFA:

CXS Number	Codex Standard Name	GSFA food category
<u>CCS</u>		
12-1981	<i>Honey</i>	11.5
212-1999	<i>Sugars</i>	11.1.1, 11.1.2, 11.1.3, 11.1.5
<u>CCNMW</u>		
108-1981	<i>Natural mineral waters</i>	14.1.1.1
227-2001	<i>Bottled/packageged drinking waters (other than natural mineral waters)</i>	14.1.1.2

Food categories 11.1.1, 11.1.2, 11.1.3 and 11.1.5, and 11.5 do not have any food additive provisions in higher food categories so the alignment work only needs to deal with provisions in the specific food categories.

Likewise, food categories 14.1.1.1 and 14.1.1.2 do not have any food additive provisions in higher food categories so the alignment work only needs to deal with provisions in the specific food categories.

New text is indicated in **bold/underline**. Text to be removed is indicated in ~~strikethrough~~.

A. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR HONEY (CXS 12-1981)

The following amendments to section 3 and addition of a new section 4 of the *Standard for Honey* (CXS 12-1981) are proposed.

3. ESSENTIAL COMPOSITION AND QUALITY FACTORS

3.1 Honey sold as such shall not have added to it any food ingredient, ~~including food additives~~, nor shall any other additions be made other than honey. Honey shall not have any objectionable matter, flavour, aroma, or taint absorbed from foreign matter during its processing and storage. The honey shall not have begun to ferment or effervesce. No pollen or constituent particular to honey may be removed except where this is unavoidable in the removal of foreign inorganic or organic matter.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

No additives are permitted in this product.

Adding the new section 4 (Food additives), will require consequential re-numbering for subsequent sections in CXS 12-1981.

B. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 1 AND 2 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO THE STANDARD FOR HONEY (CXS 12-1981)

There are no food additive provisions for CXS 12-1981 and no provisions for food additives in the relevant food category of the GSFA, being 11.5, so no changes are required for Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA.

C. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR SUGARS (CXS 212-1999)

2. FOOD ADDITIVES

Antioxidants and anticaking agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 11.1.1 (White sugar, dextrose anhydrous, dextrose monohydrate, fructose) , food category 11.1.2 (Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose), food category 11.1.3 (Soft white sugar, soft brown sugar, glucose syrup, dried glucose syrup, raw cane sugar) and food category 11.1.5 (Plantation or mill white sugar) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

Only those food additives listed below may be present. Wherever possible levels should be as low as technologically achievable.

2.1. SULPHUR DIOXIDE

The maximum permitted sulphur dioxide levels in the final product are set out below.

<u>Sugar</u>	<u>Maximum permitted level (mg/kg)</u>
White sugar	15
Powdered sugar	15
Dextrose anhydrous	15
Dextrose monohydrate	15
Powdered dextrose	15
Fructose	15
Soft white sugar	20
Soft brown sugar	20
Glucose syrup	20
Dried glucose syrup	20
Dried glucose syrup used to manufacture sugar confectionery	150
Glucose syrup used to manufacture sugar confectionery	400
Lactose	None
Plantation or mill white sugar	70
Raw cane sugar	20

2.2. ANTICAKING AGENTS

The following anticaking agents are permitted for use in powdered sugar and powdered dextrose to a maximum level of 1.5% m/m singly or in combination, provided that starch is not present:

Calcium phosphate, tribasic

Magnesium carbonate

Silicon dioxide, amorphous (dehydrated silica gel)

Calcium silicate

Magnesium trisilicate

Sodium aluminosilicate

Calcium aluminosilicate

Powdered sugar and powdered dextrose may have up to 5% starch added if no anticaking agent is used.

D. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 1 AND 2 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO THE STANDARD FOR SUGARS (CXs 212-1999)

1 It is proposed to amend Table 1 of the GSFA as follows:

Calcium silicate: Functional class: Anticaking agent INS 552					
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max level	Notes	Step/Year Adopted	Recommendation
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	15000 mg/kg	56 & NN	2006	Adopt

Magnesium carbonate: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Colour retention agent INS 504(i)					
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max level	Notes	Step/Year Adopted	Recommendation
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	15000 mg/kg	56 & NN	2006	Adopt

Magnesium silicate, synthetic: Functional class: Anticaking agent INS 553(i)					
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max level	Notes	Step/Year Adopted	Recommendation
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	15000 mg/kg	56 & NN	2006	Adopt

Phosphates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Antioxidant, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Humectant, Raising agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener INS 338, 339(i)-(iii), 340(i)-(iii), 341(i)-(iii), 342(i)-(ii), 343(i)-(iii), 450(i)-(iii), (v)-(vii), (ix), 451 (i),(ii), 452(i)-(v), 542					
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max level	Notes	Step/Year Adopted	Recommendation
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	6600 mg/kg	33,-& 56 & NN	2006	Adopt

Silicon dioxide, amorphous: Functional class: Anticaking agent, Antifoaming agent, Carrier INS 551					
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max level	Notes	Step/Year Adopted	Recommendation
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	15000 mg/kg	56 & NN	2006	Adopt

2 It is proposed to amend Table 2 of the GSFA as follows:

Food category 11.1.2 Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Calcium silicate	552	15000 mg/kg	2006	56 & NN	Adopt
Magnesium carbonate	504(i)	15000 mg/kg	2006	56 & NN	Adopt
Magnesium silicate, synthetic	553(i)	15000 mg/kg	2006	56 & NN	Adopt
Phosphates	338, 339(i)-(iii), 340(i)-(iii), 341(i)-(iii), 342(i)-(ii), 343(i)-(iii), 450(i)-(iii), (v)-(vii), (ix), 451 (i),(ii), 452(i)-(v), 542	6600 mg/kg	2006	33,-& 56 & NN	Adopt
Silicon dioxide, amorphous	551	15000 mg/kg	2006	56 & NN	Adopt

Note 33: As phosphorus.

Note 56: Excluding products where starch is present.

Note NN: For products conforming to the *Standard for Sugars (CXS 212-1999)* as anticaking agents only: Calcium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 341(i)), calcium hydrogen phosphate (INS 341(ii)), tricalcium phosphate (INS 341(iii)), magnesium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 343(i)), magnesium hydrogen phosphate (INS 343(ii)), trimagnesium phosphate (INS 343(iii)), magnesium carbonate (INS 504(i)), bone phosphate (INS 542), silicon dioxide, amorphous (INS 551), calcium silicate (INS 552), and magnesium silicate, synthetic (INS 553(i)) singly or in combination but still within prescribed separate individual maximum levels.

E. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE *STANDARD FOR NATURAL MINERAL WATERS (CXS 108-1981)*

The addition of a new section 4 of the *Standard for Natural Mineral Waters (CXS 108-1981)* is proposed.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

No additives are permitted in this product.

Adding the new section 4 (Food additives), will require consequential re-numbering for subsequent sections in CXS 108-1981.

F. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 1 AND 2 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO THE *STANDARD FOR NATURAL MINERAL WATERS (CXS 108-1981)*

There are no food additive provisions for CXS 108-1981 and no provisions for food additives in the relevant food category of the GSFA, being 14.1.1.1, so no changes are required for Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA.

G. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE *STANDARD FOR BOTTLED/PACKAGED DRINKING WATERS (OTHER THAN NATURAL MINERAL WATERS) (CXS 227-2001)*

The following amendments to section 3.2.2 and addition of a new section 4 of the *Standard for Bottled/packaged Drinking Waters (other than Natural Mineral Waters) (CXS 227-2001)* are proposed.

3.2 Chemical and radiological quality of packaged waters

3.2.2 Addition of minerals

Any addition of minerals to water before packaging must comply with the provisions outlined in the present standard and, where applicable, with the provisions in the ~~Codex General Standard for Food Additives (CODEX STAN 192-1995)~~ and/or the *Codex General Principles for the Addition of Essential Nutrients to Foods (CAC/GL 9-1987)*.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

No additives are permitted in this product.

Adding the new section 4 (Food additives), will require consequential re-numbering for subsequent sections in CXS 227-2001.

H. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO TABLE 1 AND 2 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO THE *STANDARD FOR BOTTLED/PACKAGED DRINKING WATERS (OTHER THAN NATURAL MINERAL WATERS) (CXS 227-2001)*

There are no food additive provisions for CXS 227-2001 and no provisions for food additives in the relevant food category of the GSFA, being 14.1.1.2, so no changes are required for Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA.

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE CODEX COMMODITY STANDARDS FOR CEREALS, PULSES AND LEGUMES (CCCPL); AND VEGETABLE PROTEINS (CCVP) AND TABLES 1, 2 AND 3 OF THE GSFA RELATING TO CCCPL AND CCVP

1. Proposed amendments to the Codex commodity Standards for cereals, pulses and legumes, and vegetable proteins

New text is indicated in **bold/underline**. Text to be removed is indicated in ~~strikethrough~~.

A. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR WHEAT FLOUR (CXS 152-1985)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 ~~Processing Aids (Enzymes)~~ Maximum level in finished product

Fungal amylase from *Aspergillus niger* GMP

Fungal amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* GMP

(alpha-Amylase from *Aspergillus oryzae* var. (INS 1100 (i))

Proteolytic enzyme from *Bacillus subtilis*

(Proteases from *Bacillus subtilis* (INS 1101(vi)) GMP

Proteolytic enzyme from *Aspergillus oryzae* GMP

(Protease from *Aspergillus oryzae* var. (INS 1101(i))

4.1 Food Additives

Flour treatment agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 06.2.1 (Flours) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

4.2 Processing Aids

Enzyme preparations

The enzyme preparations used as processing aids in products conforming to this standard should be consistent with the *Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids* (CAC/GL 75-2010).

Flour Treatment Agents	Maximum level in finished product
L-ascorbic acid and its sodium and potassium salts	300 mg/kg
L-cysteine hydrochloride	90 mg/kg
Sulphur dioxide (in flours for biscuit and pastry manufacture only)	200 mg/kg
Mono-calcium phosphate	2-500 mg/kg
Lecithin	2-000 mg/kg
Chlorine in high-ratio cakes	2-500 mg/kg
Benzoyl peroxide	60 mg/kg
Azodicarbonamide for leavened bread	45 mg/kg

B. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR COUSCOUS (CXS 202-1995)

No amendments to Section 4 of the *Standard for Couscous* (CXS 202-1995) are proposed, since no food additives are permitted in products covered by this standard.

C. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR INSTANT NOODLES (CXS 249-2006)

The following amendments to Section 4 of the *Standard for Instant Noodles* (CXS 249-2006) are proposed.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

Acidity regulators, anticaking agents, antioxidants, colours, emulsifiers, flour treatment agents, humectants, preservatives, stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) in food category 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) and only certain Table 3 acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, emulsifiers, flavour enhancers, humectants, stabilizers, and thickeners as indicated in Table 3 of the *General Standard for Food Additives* (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

The use of food additive(s) as well as food additive(s) carry-over shall comply with the maximum level permitted by the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA), CODEX STAN 192-1995. However, until the food additive provisions for the food category 06.4.3 "Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products" in the GSFA is finalised, the following listed food additives will apply⁴:

⁴This sentence and the food additive list which follows will be removed from the standard once the GSFA on the food category 06.4.3 "Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products" is completed.

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum Level
Acidity regulators		
260	Acetic acid, glacial	GMP
262(i)	Sodium acetate	GMP
270	Lactic acid (L-, D-, and DL-)	GMP
296	Malic acid (DL-)	GMP
327	Calcium lactate	GMP
330	Citric acid	GMP
331(iii)	Trisodium citrate	GMP
334	Tartaric acid (L(+)-)	7500mg/kg
350(ii)	Sodium malate	GMP
365	Sodium fumarates	GMP
500(i)	Sodium carbonate	GMP
500(ii)	Sodium hydrogen carbonate	GMP
501(i)	Potassium carbonate	GMP
516	Calcium sulphate	GMP
529	Calcium oxide	GMP
Antioxidants		
300	Ascorbic acid (L-)	GMP
304	Ascorbyl palmitate	500 mg/kg Singly or in combination as ascorbyl stearate
305	Ascorbyl stearate	
306	Mixed tocopherols concentrate	200 mg/kg Singly or in combination
307	Alpha-tocopherol	
310	Propyl gallate	200 mg/kg Singly or in combination expressed as a fat or oil basis
319	Tertiary butylhydroquinone (TBHQ)	
320	Butylated hydroxyanisole (BHA)	
321	Butylated hydroxytoluene (BHT)	
Colours		
100(i)	Curcumin	500 mg/kg
101(i)	Riboflavin	200 mg/kg Singly or in combination as riboflavin
101(ii)	Riboflavin 5'-phosphate, sodium	
102	Tartrazine	300 mg/kg
110	Sunset yellow FCF	300 mg/kg
120	Carmines	100 mg/kg
123	Amaranth	100 mg/kg
141(i)	Chlorophyll copper complex	100 mg/kg
141(ii)	Chlorophyllin copper complex, sodium and potassium salts	100 mg/kg
143	Fast green FCF	290 mg/kg
150a	Caramel I-plain	GMP
150b	Caramel II-caustic sulphite process	50000 mg/kg
150c	Caramel III-ammonia process	50000 mg/kg
150d	Caramel IV-ammonia sulphite process	50000 mg/kg
160a(i)	Beta-carotene (synthetic)	1200 mg/kg
160a(ii)	Carotenes, Vegetable	1000 mg/kg
160a(iii)	Beta-carotene (Blakeslea trispora)	1000 mg/kg
160e	Beta-apo-carotenol	200 mg/kg
160f	Beta-apo-8'-carotenic acid, methyl or ethyl ester	1000 mg/kg
162	Beet red	GMP
Flavour Enhancers		
620	Glutamic acid (L(+)-)	GMP
621	Monosodium glutamate, L-	GMP
631	Disodium 5'-inosinate,	GMP

627	Disodium 5'-guanylate	GMP
635	Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides	GMP
Stabilizers		
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	GMP
406	Agar	GMP
459	Beta-cyclodextrin	1000 mg/kg
Thickeners		
400	Alginic acid	GMP
401	Sodium Alginate	GMP
410	Carob-Bean Gum	GMP
407	Carrageenan and its Na, K, NH ₄ salts (includes furecellaran)	GMP
407a	Processed Eucheuma Seaweed	GMP
412	Guar gum	GMP
414	Gum Arabic (acacia-gum)	GMP
415	Xanthan gum	GMP
416	Karaya-Gum	GMP
417	Tara-Gum	GMP
418	Gellan	GMP
424	Curdlan	GMP
440	Pectins	GMP
466	Sodium carboxymethyl cellulose	GMP
508	Potassium chloride	GMP
1401	Acid-treated starch	GMP
1402	Alkaline-treated starch	GMP
1403	Bleached starch	GMP
1404	Oxidized Starch	GMP
1405	Starches, enzyme-treated	GMP
1410	Monostarch phosphate	GMP
1412	Distarch phosphate esterified with sodium trimetaphosphate; esterified with phosphorous oxychloride	GMP
1413	Phosphated distarch phosphate	GMP
1414	Acetylated distarch phosphate	GMP
1420	Starch acetate	GMP
1422	Acetylated distarch adipate	GMP
1440	Hydroxypropyl starch	GMP
1442	Hydroxypropyl distarch phosphate	GMP
1450	Starch sodium octenyl succinate	GMP
1451	Acetylated oxidized starch	GMP
Humectants		
325	Sodium lactate	GMP
339(i)	Monosodium orthophosphate	2000 mg/kg Singly or in combination as phosphorus
339(ii)	Disodium orthophosphate	
339(iii)	Trisodium orthophosphate	
340(i)	Monopotassium orthophosphate	
340(ii)	Dipotassium orthophosphate	
340(iii)	Tripotassium orthophosphate	
341(iii)	Tricalcium orthophosphate	
450(i)	Disodium diphosphate	GMP
450(iii)	Tetrasodium diphosphate	
450(v)	Tetrapotassium diphosphate	
450(vi)	Dicalcium diphosphate	
451(i)	Pentasodium triphosphate	
452(i)	Sodium polyphosphate	
452(ii)	Potassium polyphosphate	
452(iv)	Calcium polyphosphates	
452(v)	Ammonium polyphosphates	
420	Sorbitol and sorbitol-syrup	
1520	Propylene glycol	10000 mg/kg

Emulsifiers		
322	Lecithin	GMP
405	Propylene glycol alginate	5000 mg/kg
430	Polyoxyethylene (8)stearate	5000 mg/kg (dry basis) Singly or in combination
431	Polyoxyethylene (40)stearate	
432	Polyoxyethylene (20)sorbitan monolaurate	5000 mg/kg Singly or in combination as total polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan esters
433	Polyoxyethylene (20)sorbitan monooleate	
434	Polyoxyethylene (20)sorbitan monopalmitate	
435	Polyoxyethylene (20)sorbitan monostearate	
436	Polyoxyethylene (20)sorbitan tristearate	
471	Mono and di-glycerides of fatty acids	GMP
472e	Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	10000 mg/kg
473	Sucrose esters of fatty acids	2000 mg/kg
475	Polyglycerol esters of fatty acids	2000 mg/kg
476	Polyglycerol esters of interesterified ricinoleic acids	500 mg/kg
477	Propylene glycol esters of fatty acids	5000 mg/kg (dry basis)
481(i)	Sodium stearoyl lactylate	5000 mg/kg
482(i)	Calcium stearoyl lactylate	5000 mg/kg
491	Sorbitan monostearate	5000 mg/kg (dry basis) Singly or in combination
492	Sorbitan tristearate	
493	Sorbitan monolaurate	
495	Sorbitan monopalmitate	
Flour Treatment Agents		
220	Sulphur dioxide	20 mg/kg Singly or in combination as sulphur dioxide
221	Sodium sulphite	
222	Sodium hydrogen sulphite	
223	Sodium metabisulphite	
224	Potassium metabisulphite	
225	Potassium sulphite	
539	Sodium thiosulphate	
Preservatives		
200	Sorbic acid	2000 mg/kg Singly or in combination as Sorbic acid
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
Anticaking Agent		
900a	Polydimethylsiloxane	50 mg/kg

D. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE STANDARD FOR WHEAT PROTEIN PRODUCTS INCLUDING WHEAT GLUTEN (CXS 163-1987)

No amendments to Section 4 of the *Standard for Wheat Protein Products Including Wheat Gluten* (CXS 163-1987) are proposed, since no food additives are permitted in products covered by this standard.

E. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE GENERAL STANDARD FOR VEGETABLE PROTEIN PRODUCTS (VPP) (CXS 174-1989)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Processing Aids

During the course of manufacturing VPP the following classes of processing aids, as compiled in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, may be used:

The processing aids used in products conforming to this standard should be consistent with the Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids (CAC/GL 75-2010).

- Acidity Regulators
- Antifoam Agents
- Firming Agents
- Enzyme Preparations
- Extraction Solvents
- Antidusting Agents
- Flour Treatment Agents

– Viscosity Control Agents

4.2 Food Additives

No food additives are permitted in vegetable protein products.

F. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE GENERAL STANDARD FOR SOY PROTEIN PRODUCTS (CXs 175-1989)

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

4.1 Processing Aids

During the course of manufacturing SPP the following classes of processing aids, as compiled in the advisory inventory of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, may be used:

The processing aids used in products conforming to this standard should be consistent with the Guidelines on Substances used as Processing Aids (CAC/GL 75-2010).

- Acidity Regulators
- Antifoam Agents
- Firming Agents
- Enzyme Preparations
- Extraction Solvents
- Antidusting Agents
- Flour Treatment Agents
- Viscosity Control Agents.

4.2 Food Additives

No food additives are permitted in soy protein products.

2. Proposed amendments to Table 1, 2 and 3 of the GSFA due to CCCPL and CCVP Standards

Provisions shown in green text are provided for information only, and will be maintained at their current step with any additional new notes.

A It is proposed to amend Table 1 of the GSFA as follows:

STANDARD FOR WHEAT FLOUR (CXs 152-1985)

Alpha Amylase From Aspergillus Oryzae Var.: Functional class: Flour treatment agent INS 1100(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	GMP	1999	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Alpha Amylase From Bacillus subtilis: Functional class: Flour treatment agent INS 1100(iii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	GMP	2014	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Ascorbic acid, L-: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Flour treatment agent, Sequestrant INS 300					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	300	2014	<u>Note F-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Azodicarbonamide: Functional class: Flour treatment agent INS 927a					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	45	1999	<u>Note A-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Benzoyl peroxide: Functional class: Bleaching agent, Flour treatment agent, Preservative INS 928					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	75	2007	<u>Note B-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Calcium sulfate: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer INS 516					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	GMP	Step 7	<u>XS152</u>	Maintain at Step 7

Carbohydrase from Bacillus licheniformis: Functional class: Flour treatment agent INS 1100(vi)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	GMP	2014	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Chlorine: Functional class: Flour treatment agent INS 925					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	2500	2001	<u>87 & Note E-CXS 152</u>	Adopt

Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol: Functional class: Emulsifier, Sequestrant, Stabilizer INS 472e					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	GMP	2008	186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Lecithin: Functional class: Antioxidant, Emulsifier INS 322(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	GMP	2014	25 & 28	<u>Delay alignment until INS EWG consider technological purpose as flour treatment agent is appropriate</u>

Magnesium Carbonate: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Colour retention agent INS 504(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	1500	Step 4	<u>XS152</u>	Maintain at Step 4

Phosphates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, antioxidant, emulsifier, firming agent, flour treatment agent, humectant, preservative, raising agent, sequestrant, stabilizer, thickener INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i), (ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii), (v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i), (ii); 452(i)-(v); 542					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	2500	2012	33, 225 & <u>Note C-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Protease From Aspergillus Oryzae Var.: Functional class: Flavour enhancer, Flour treatment agent, Stabiliser INS 1101(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	GMP	1999	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Pullulan: Functional class: Glazing agent, Thickener INS 1204					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	GMP	2014	25 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Sodium aluminium phosphates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Raising agent, Stabilizer, Thickener INS 541(i),(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	1600	2013	6, 252 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Sodium ascorbate: Functional class: Antioxidant INS 301					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	300	2014		<u>Delay alignment until INS EWG consider technological purpose as flour treatment agent is appropriate</u>

Stearoyl lactylates: Functional class: Emulsifier, Flour treatment agent, Foaming agent, Stabilizer INS 481(i), 482(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	5000	2016	186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Sulfites: Functional class: Antioxidant, Bleaching agent, Flour treatment agent, Preservative INS 220-225, 539					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	200	2006	44 & <u>Note D-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Tartrates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Flavour enhancer, Emulsifying salt, Sequestrant, Stabilizer INS 334, 335(ii), 337					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	5000	2016	45, 186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Tocopherols: Functional class: Antioxidant INS 307a, b, c					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	5000	2016	15, 186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Trisodium citrate: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Sequestrant, Stabilizer INS 331(iii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.2.1	Flours	GMP	2015	25 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

STANDARD FOR COUSCOUS (CXs 202-1995)

Annatto extracts, norbixin-based: Functional Class: Colour INS 160b(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	500	4	184, 185 & <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 4

Beet red: Functional class: Colour INS 162					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	GMP	7	184, <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 7

Caramel I – plain caramel: Functional class: Colour INS 150a					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	GMP	7	184, <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 7

Mineral oil, high viscosity: Functional Class: Antifoaming agent, Glazing agent INS 905d					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	800	2004	98 & <u>XS202</u>	Adopt

Propyl gallate: Functional Class: Antioxidant INS 310					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	100	2001	15 & <u>XS202</u>	Adopt

STANDARD FOR INSTANT NOODLES (CXS 249-2006)

Adipates: Functional class: Acidity regulator INS 355					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000 mg/kg	Step 7	1 & <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 7

Amaranth: Functional class: Colour INS 123					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100 mg/kg	Step 7	153	Maintain at Step 7

Amaranth: Functional class: Colour INS 123					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
<u>06.4.3</u>	<u>Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products</u>	<u>100 mg/kg</u>		<u>153, 194</u>	Adopt

Annatto Extracts, Bixin-Based: Functional class: Colour INS 160b(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	20 mg/kg	Step 4	8 & 153, <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 4

Annatto Extracts, Norbixin-Based: Functional class: Colour INS 160b(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100 mg/kg	Step 4	153 & 185, <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 4

Benzoates: Functional class: Preservative INS 210-213					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000 mg/kg	2004	13 & <u>XS249</u>	Adopt

Canthaxanthin: Functional class: Colour INS 161g					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	15 mg/kg	2011	153 & <u>XS249</u>	Adopt

Caramel II- sulfite caramel: Functional class: Colour INS 150b					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000 mg/kg	Step 4	153	Maintain at Step 4

Caramel II- sulfite caramel: Functional class: Colour INS 150b					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year adopted	Notes	Recommendation
<u>06.4.3</u>	<u>Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products</u>	<u>50000 mg/kg</u>		<u>153-194</u>	Adopt

Carotenoids: Functional class: Colour INS 160a(i), a(iii),e,f					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1200 mg/kg	2009	153 & <u>Note B-CXS249</u>	Adopt

Curcumin: Functional class: Colour INS 100(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	500 mg/kg	Step 7	153	Maintain at Step 7

Curcumin: Functional class: Colour INS 100(i)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	<u>Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products</u>	<u>500 mg/kg</u>		153 <u>194</u>	Adopt

Paprika extract: Functional class: Colour INS 160c(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	120	Step 2	<u>39 & XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 2

Phosphates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, antioxidant, emulsifier, firming agent, flour treatment agent, humectant, preservative, raising agent, sequestrant, stabilizer, thickener INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i), (ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii), (v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i), (ii); 452(i)-(v); 542					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2500 mg/kg	2012	33, 211 & <u>Note C-CXS249</u>	Adopt

Polydimethylsiloxane: Functional class: Anticaking agent, Antifoaming agent, Emulsifier INS 900a					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50 mg/kg	2007	153	Adopt

Riboflavins: Functional class: Colour INS 101(i),(ii),(iii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300 mg/kg	2008	153 & <u>Note A-CXS249</u>	Adopt

Sorbates: Functional class: Preservative INS 200-203, 200, 202, 203					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2000 mg/kg	2012	42 & 211	Adopt

Sorbitan Esters of Fatty Acids: Functional class: Emulsifier, Stabilizer INS 491-495					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	5000 mg/kg	2016	44 <u>2</u> & 194	Adopt

Sucroglycerides: Functional class: Emulsifier INS 474					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2000 mg/kg	2016	194 & 348	Maintain, although not listed in the standard, INS 474 and INS 473a are included in a Group ADI with INS 473 which is permitted in the standard.

Sucrose Oligoesters, Type I and Type II: Functional class: Emulsifier, Glazing agent, Stabilizer INS 473a					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2000 mg/kg	2016	194 & 348	Maintain, although not listed in the standard INS 474 and INS 473a are included in a Group ADI with INS 473 which is permitted in the standard.

Sulfites: Functional class: Antioxidant, bleaching agent, flour treatment agent, preservative, sequestrant INS 220-225, 539					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	20 mg/kg	2006	44 & Note E-CXS249	Adopt

Tartrates: Functional class: Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Flavour enhancer, Emulsifying salt, Sequestrant, Stabilizer INS 334, 335(ii), 337					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	7500 mg/kg	2016	45, 128, 194	Adopt

Tartrazine: Functional class: Colour INS 102					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300 mg/kg	Step 7	153	Maintain at Step 7

Tartrazine: Functional class: Colour INS 102					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
<u>06.4.3</u>	<u>Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products</u>	<u>300 mg/kg</u>		153 <u>194</u>	Adopt

STANDARD FOR WHEAT PROTEIN PRODUCTS INCLUDING WHEAT GLUTEN (CXS 163-1987)

There are no amendments to Table 1 of the GSFA as there are no provisions in Food Category 12.10 (Protein products other than from soybeans).

GENERAL STANDARD FOR VEGETABLE PROTEIN PRODUCTS (VPP) (CXS 174-1989)

There are no amendments to Table 1 of the GSFA as there are no provisions in Food Category 12.10 (Protein products other than from soybeans).

GENERAL STANDARD FOR SOY PROTEIN PRODUCTS (CXS 175-1989)

Caramel III- ammonia caramel: Functional class: Colour INS 150c					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.8.8	Other soybean protein products	20000 mg/kg	2010	<u>XS175</u>	Adopt

Caramel IV- sulfite ammonia caramel: Functional class: Colour INS 150d					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.8.8	Other soybean protein products	20000 mg/kg	2010	<u>XS175</u>	Adopt

Lycopene, Tomato: Functional class: Colour INS 160d(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.8.8	Other soybean protein products	20000 mg/kg	Step 3	<u>XS175</u>	Maintain at Step 3

Paprika extract: Functional class: Colour INS 160c(ii)					
Food category No	Food category	Max level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
06.8.8	Other soybean protein products	5 mg/kg	Step 2	39 & <u>XS175</u>	Maintain at Step 2

B It is proposed to amend Table 2 of the GSFA as follows:

STANDARD FOR WHEAT FLOUR (CXs 152-1985)

Food category 06.2 Flours and starches (including soybean powder)					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
alpha-Amylase from <i>Aspergillus oryzae</i> var.	1100(i)	GMP	1999	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt
alpha-Amylase from <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	1100(iii)	GMP	2014	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt
Carbohydrase from <i>Bacillus licheniformis</i>	1100(vi)	GMP	2014	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt
Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	472e	3000	2008	186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

Food category 06.2.1 Flours					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Ascorbic acid, L-	300	300	2014	<u>Note F-CXS152</u>	Adopt
Azodicarbonamide	927a	45	1999	<u>Note A-CXS152</u>	Adopt
Benzoyl peroxide	928	75	2007	<u>Note B-CXS152</u>	Adopt
Calcium sulfate	516	GMP	7	<u>XS152</u>	Maintain at Step 7
Chlorine	925	2500	2001	87 & <u>Note E-CXS152</u>	Adopt

Food category 06.2.1 Flours					
Lecithin	322(i)	GMP	2014	25 & 28	<u>Delay alignment until INS EWG consider technological purpose as flour treatment agent is appropriate</u>
Magnesium carbonate	504(i)	1500	4	<u>XS152</u>	Maintain at Step 4
PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	2500	2012	33, 225 & <u>Note C-CXS152</u>	Adopt
Protease from aspergillus oryzae var.	1101(i)	GMP	1999	<u>XS152</u>	Adopt
Pullulan	1204	GMP	2014	25 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt
SODIUM ALUMINIUM PHOSPHATES	541(i),(ii)	1600	2013	6, 252 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt
Sodium ascorbate	301	300	2014		<u>Delay alignment until INS EWG consider technological purpose as flour treatment agent is appropriate</u>
STEAROYL LACTYLATES	481(i), 482(i)	5000	2016	186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt
SULFITES	220-225, 539	200	2006	44 & <u>Note D-CXS152</u>	Adopt
TARTRATES	334, 335(ii), 337	5000	2016	45, 186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt
TOCOPHEROLS	307a, b, c	5000	2016	15, 186 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt
Trisodium citrate	331(iii)	GMP	2015	25 & <u>XS152</u>	Adopt

STANDARD FOR COUSCOUS (CXS 202-1995)

Food category 06.1 Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Annatto extracts, norbixin-based	160b(ii)	500	4	184, 185 & <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 4
Beet red	162	GMP	7	184 & <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 7
Caramel I - plain caramel	150a	GMP	7	184 & <u>XS202</u>	Maintain at Step 7
Mineral oil, high viscosity	905d	800	2004	98 & <u>XS202</u>	Adopt

Propyl gallate	310	100	2001	15 & <u>XS202</u>	Adopt
----------------	-----	-----	------	--------------------------	-------

STANDARD FOR INSTANT NOODLES (CXS 249-2006)

Food category 06.4.3 Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Adipates	355	1000	7	1 & <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 7
Amaranth	123	100	7	153	Maintain at Step 7
Amaranth	123	100		153 194	Adopt
Annatto extracts, bixin-based	160b(i)	20	4	8, 153 & <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 4
Annatto extracts, norbixin-based	160b(ii)	100	4	153, 185 & <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 4
BENZOATES	210-213	1000	2004	13 & <u>XS249</u>	Adopt
Canthaxanthin	161g	15	2011	153 & <u>XS249</u>	Adopt
Caramel II - sulfite caramel	150b	50000	4	153	Maintain at Step 4
Caramel ii - sulfite caramel	150b	50000		153 194	Adopt
CAROTENOIDS	160a(i),a(iii),e,f	1200	2009	153 & <u>Note B-CXS249</u>	Adopt
Curcumin	100(i)	500	7	153	Maintain at Step 7
Curcumin	100(i)	500		153 194	Adopt
Paprika extract	160c(ii)	120	2	39 & <u>XS249</u>	Maintain at Step 2
PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	2500	2012	33, 211 & <u>Note C-CXS249</u>	Adopt
Polydimethylsiloxane	900a	50	2007	153	Adopt
RIBOFLAVINS	101(i),(ii), (iii)	300	2008	153 & <u>Note A-CXS249</u>	Adopt
SORBATES	200-203 200, 202, 203	2000	2012	42 & 211	Adopt
SORBITAN ESTERS OF FATTY ACIDS	491-495	5000	2016	44 2 & 194	Adopt
Sucroglycerides	474	2000	2016	194 & 348	<i>Maintain, although not listed in the standard INS 474 and INS 473a are included in a Group ADI with INS 473 which is permitted in the standard.</i>

Food category 06.4.3 Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Sucrose oligoesters, type I and type II	473a	2000	2016	194 & 348	Maintain, although not listed in the standard INS 474 and INS 473a are included in a Group ADI with INS 473 which is permitted in the standard.
SULFITES	220-225, 539	20	2006	44 & Note E-CXS249	Adopt
TARTRATES	334, 335(ii), 337	7500	2016	45, 128, 194	Adopt
Tartrazine	102	300	7	153	Maintain at Step 7
<u>Tartrazine</u>	<u>102</u>	<u>300</u>		<u>153-194</u>	Adopt

STANDARD FOR WHEAT PROTEIN PRODUCTS INCLUDING WHEAT GLUTEN (CXS 163-1987)

There are no amendments to Table 2 of the GSFA as there are no provisions in Food Category 12.10 (Protein products other than from soybeans).

GENERAL STANDARD FOR VEGETABLE PROTEIN PRODUCTS (VPP) (CXS 174-1989)

There are no amendments to Table 2 of the GSFA as there are no provisions in Food Category 12.10 (Protein products other than from soybeans).

GENERAL STANDARD FOR SOY PROTEIN PRODUCTS (CXS 175-1989)

Food category 06.8.8 Other soybean protein products					
Food additive	INS	Maximum Level	Step/Year Adopted	Notes	Recommendation
Caramel III - ammonia caramel	150c	20000	2010	<u>XS175</u>	Adopt
Caramel IV - sulfite ammonia caramel	150d	20000	2010	<u>XS175</u>	Adopt
Lycopene, tomato	160d(ii)	10000	3	<u>XS175</u>	Maintain at Step 3
Paprika extract	160c(ii)	5	2	39 & <u>XS175</u>	Maintain at Step 2

NOTES

Note A-CXS152: For flours for leavened bread only in products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)*.

Note B-CXS152: Except for use in products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)* as a flour treatment agent only, at a maximum level of 60 mg/kg.

Note C-CXS152: For use in products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)* as a flour treatment agent: calcium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 341(i)), calcium hydrogen phosphate (INS 341(ii)), tricalcium phosphate (INS 341(iii)), ammonium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 342(i)) and diammonium hydrogen phosphate (INS 342(ii)) only.

Note D-CXS152: In products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)*, only for use as a flour treatment agent in flours for biscuit and pastry manufacture: sulfur dioxide (INS 220), sodium sulfite (INS 221), sodium metabisulfite (INS 223) and potassium metabisulfite (INS 224) only.

Note E-CXS152: In products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)*, only for use in flours for high ratio cakes.

Note F-CXS152: For use in products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)* as a flour treatment agent only.

Note A-CXS249: Except for use in products conforming to the *Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)* at 200 mg/kg.

Note B-CXS249: Except for use of beta-carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* (INS 160a(iii)) at 1000 mg/kg, carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) at 200 mg/kg, and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8' (INS 160f) at 1000 mg/kg in products conforming to the *Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)*.

Note C-CXS249: Except in products conforming to the *Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)*: sodium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 339(i)), disodium hydrogen phosphate (INS 339(ii)), trisodium phosphate (INS 339(iii)), potassium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 340(i)), dipotassium hydrogen phosphate (INS 340(ii)), tripotassium phosphate (INS 340(iii)), calcium dihydrogen phosphate (INS 341(i)), calcium hydrogen phosphate (INS 341(ii)), tricalcium phosphate (INS 341(iii)), disodium diphosphate (INS 450(i)), trisodium phosphate INS 450(ii), tetrasodium diphosphate (INS 450(iii)), dipotassium diphosphate INS 450(iv), tetrapotassium diphosphate (INS 450(v)), calcium dihydrogen phosphate INS 450(vii), pentasodium triphosphate (INS 451(i)), pentapotassium triphosphate INS 451(ii), sodium polyphosphate (INS 452(i)), potassium polyphosphate (INS 452(ii)), sodium calcium polyphosphate INS 452(iii), calcium polyphosphate (INS 452(iv)), and ammonium polyphosphate (INS 452(v)) for use only as humectants at 2,000 mg/kg, singly or in combination, as phosphorus.

Note E-CXS249: For products conforming to the *Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)*: sulfur dioxide (INS 220), sodium sulfite (INS 221), sodium metabisulfite (INS 223) and potassium metabisulfite (INS 224) for use as flour treatment agents only.

Note XS152: Excluding products conforming to the *Standard for Wheat Flour (CXS 152-1985)*.

Note XS302: Excluding products conforming to the *Standard for Couscous (CXS 202-1995)*.

Note XS249: Excluding products conforming to the *Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)*.

Note XS175: Excluding products conforming to the *Standard for Soy Protein Products (CXS 175-1989)*.

C. It is proposed to amend Table 3 of the GSFA

At the 50th CCFA (see paras. 41-42 of REP18/FA), a revised procedure for the listing of commodity standards in the last column of Table 3 was put forward and agreed to. It was decided that commodity standards that permit all Table 3 additives or all Table 3 additives with a particular functional class would not be listed in the final column of Table 3. Rather, only commodity standards that only permitted particular additives would be listed with the additive in the last column of Table 3. However, it was also determined that the revised procedure would not be implemented until the Codex Secretariat had overcome certain technological issues with the online GSFA. Until these issues have been taken care of, the old procedure for listing commodity standards in the last column of Table 3 will still be used.

New text is indicated in **bold/underline**. Text to be removed is indicated in ~~strikethrough~~.

STANDARD FOR INSTANT NOODLES (CXS 249-2006)

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
260	Acetic acid, glacial	Acidity regulator, Preservative	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1422	Acetylated distarch adipate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				1981, CS 249-2006
1414	Acetylated distarch phosphate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
1451	Acetylated oxidized starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	2005	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 249-2006
1401	Acid-treated starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
406	Agar	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006
400	Alginic acid	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006
1402	Alkaline treated starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
300	Ascorbic acid, L-	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Flour treatment agent, Sequestrant	1999	CS 88-1981, CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 13-1981, CS 57-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				1981, CS 291-2010 CS 302-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
162	Beet red	Colour	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 319-2015 (special holiday pack canned pears only), <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1403	Bleached starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
170(i)	Calcium carbonate	Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Colour, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Stabilizer	1999	CS 117-1981 (anticaking agents in dehydrated products only), CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
327	Calcium lactate	Acidity regulator, Emulsifying salt, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
529	Calcium oxide	Acidity regulator, Flour treatment agent	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
516	Calcium sulfate	Acidity regulator, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
150a	Caramel I – plain caramel	Colour	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 319-2015 (special holiday pack canned pears only), <u>CS 249-2006</u>
410	Carob bean gum	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), <u>CS 249-2006</u>

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
407	Carrageenan	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006
330	Citric acid	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Colour retention agent, Sequestrant	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS13-1981, CS 57-1981, CS 37-1991, CS 70-1981, CS 90-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-2015, CS 249-2006
424	Curdlan	Firming agent, Gelling agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	2001	CS 117-1981, CS 249-2006
627	Disodium 5'-guanylate	Flavour enhancer	1999	CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 302-2011, CS 249-2006
631	Disodium 5'-inosinate	Flavour enhancer	1999	CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 302-2011, CS 249-2006
635	Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides	Flavour enhancer	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 249-2006
1412	Distarch phosphate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
418	Gellan gum	Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 249-2006
620	Glutamic acid, L(+)-	Flavour enhancer	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 249-2006

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
412	Guar gum	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006
414	Gum arabic (Acacia gum)	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 249-2006
1442	Hydroxypropyl distarch phosphate	Anticaking agent, Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981 (anticaking agents in dehydrated products only), CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
1440	Hydroxypropyl starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, CS 249-2006
416	Karaya gum	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 249-2006
270	Lactic acid, L-, D- and DL-	Acidity regulator	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981 CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, CS 249-2006
322(i)	Lecithin	Antioxidant, Emulsifier	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015 (canned mangoes only), CS 249-2006
296	Malic acid, DL-	Acidity regulator	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
471	Mono- and di-glycerides of fatty acids	Antifoaming agent, Emulsifier, Stabilizer	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
621	Monosodium L-glutamate	Flavour enhancer	1999	CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 302-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1410	Monostarch phosphate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1404	Oxidized starch	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
440	Pectins	Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 87-1981, 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1413	Phosphated distarch phosphate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
501(i)	Potassium carbonate	Acidity regulator, Stabilizer	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
508	Potassium chloride	Firming agent, Flavour enhancer, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 88-1981, CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 319-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				2015 (canned mangoes only), CS 249-2006
407a	Processed eucheuma seaweed (PES)	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Thickener	2001	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 249-2006
262(i)	Sodium acetate	Acidity regulator, Preservative, Sequestrant	1999	CS 117-1981, 309R-2011, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, CS 249-2006
401	Sodium alginate	Bulking agent, Carrier, Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006
500(i)	Sodium carbonate	Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Raising agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981 (anticaking agents in dehydrated products only), CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, CS 249-2006
466	Sodium carboxymethyl cellulose (Cellulose gum)	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Firming agent, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 302-2011, CS 319-2015 (canned mangoes only), CS 249-2006
350(ii)	Sodium DL-malate	Acidity regulator, Humectant	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
365	Sodium fumarates	Acidity regulator	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
500(ii)	Sodium hydrogen carbonate	Acidity regulator, Anticaking agent, Raising agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981 (anticaking agents in dehydrated products only), CS 105-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 141-1983, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
325	Sodium lactate	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Humectant, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-2015, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
420(i)	Sorbitol	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 105-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
420(ii)	Sorbitol syrup	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 87-1981, CS 105-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1420	Starch acetate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981, CS 94-1981, CS 119-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1450	Starch sodium octenyl succinate	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
1405	Starches, enzyme treated	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
417	Tara gum	Gelling agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, <u>CS 249-2006</u>
331(iii)	Trisodium citrate	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Sequestrant, Stabilizer	1999	CS 89-1981, CS 96-1981, CS 97-1981, CS 98-1981, CS 117-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 13-1981, CS 57-1981, CS 291-2010, CS 302-2011, CS 319-

INS No	Additive	Functional Class	Year Adopted	Acceptable in foods conforming to the following commodity standards
				2015, CS 249-2006
415	Xanthan gum	Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	1999	CS 117-1981, CS 105-1981, CS 309R-2011, CS 70-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 94-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 119-1981 (for use in packing media only), CS 249-2006

Section 2 of the Annex to Table 3

It is proposed to amend Section 2 of the Annex to Table 3 as follows:

References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives

06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products
	Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.
Codex standards	Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006)

06.8.8	Other soybean protein products
	Food additives are not permitted in products conforming to this standard.
Codex standards	Soy Protein Products (CXS 175-1989)

12.10	Protein products other than from soybeans
	Food additives are not permitted in products conforming to this standard.
Codex standards	Wheat Protein Products Including Wheat Gluten (CXS 163-1987), Vegetable Protein Products (VPP) (CXS 174-1989)

Appendix 5

CONSIDERATION OF THE ADDITION OF A FOOTNOTE IN TABLE 3 OF THE GSFA

The EWG on Alignment was tasked with considering the addition of a footnote to the portion of Table 3 that follows the Annex to Table 3 that begins with the text “References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives” (para. 49(iii) of REP18/FA). This portion of Table 3 lists the commodity standards that have been aligned with the GSFA, and provides further information regarding the use of Table 3 additives in foods conforming to the commodity standards. As an example, the text below provides detail on the use of Table 3 additives in foods conforming to the Codex *Standard for Certain canned citrus fruits* (CODEX STAN 254-2007).

References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives

04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit
	Acidity regulators and firming agents listed in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to the standard.
Codex Standard	Certain canned citrus fruits (CODEX STAN 254-2007)

A request was made that the EWG on Alignment consider adding a footnote to make it clear to users of this portion of Table 3 that only commodity standards that fall under GSFA food categories that are not in the Annex to Table 3 will be listed. The proposed text for the footnote is as follows:

“This Section only lists Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is not listed in the Annex to Table 3. Provisions for the use of specific Table 3 additives in Commodity Standards where the corresponding GSFA Food Category is listed in the Annex to Table 3 can be found in the corresponding Food Categories in Tables 1 and 2. Be aware that the process to align food additive permissions in commodity standards with the GSFA is a work in progress, and as a result not all commodity standards are yet listed in this Section.”

The EWG on Alignment is requested to consider whether this footnote (or a revised version) should be added to the section of Table 3 “References to Commodity Standards for GSFA Table 3 Additives.”

Comments

Agree: Brazil

Appendix 6

**PROPOSED REVISIONS TO THE ADOPTED PROVISIONS CONTAINED IN CRD 2 ANNEX 4 PART C,
I.E. ASCORBYL ESTERS IN FOOD CATEGORIES 13.1.1, 13.1.2 AND 13.1.3 OF THE GSFA**

The proposed changes to the GSFA due to the requested alignment of provisions for ASCORBYL ESTERS (ascorbyl palmitate (INS 304) and ascorbyl stearate (INS 305)) and the *Standard for Infant Formula and Formula for Special Dietary Purposes Intended for Infants* (CXS 72-1981) and the *Standard for Follow-up Formula* (CXS 156-1987)⁴.

The Codex commodity standards provisions for ASCORBYL ESTERS do not include a condition that limits them to the fat or oil basis. Changes are proposed to the GSFA to remove note 15 which does permit the ascorbyl ester provisions to the fat or oil basis. This condition is not required and to ensure the provisions of the Codex commodity standards are aligned with the GSFA note 15 is removed from the relevant entries in both Table 1 and 2.

Proposed amendments to Table 1 and 2 of the GSFA

New text is indicated in **bold/underline**. Text to be removed is indicated in ~~strikethrough~~.

A It is proposed to amend Table 1 of the GSFA as follows:

Ascorbyl esters					
INS 304	Ascorbyl palmitate	Functional Class: Antioxidant			
INS 305	Ascorbyl stearate	Functional Class: Antioxidant			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category	Max Level	Notes	Step/Year adopted	Recommendation
13.1.1	Infant Formulae	10 mg/kg	Notes 15 , 72 & 187	2009	Adopt
13.1.2	Follow-up formulae	50 mg/kg	Notes 15 , 72, 187 & 315	2015	Adopt
13.1.3	Formulae for Special Medical Purposes for Infants	10 mg/kg	Notes 10, 15 , & 72 & <u>187</u>	2006	Adopt

B It is proposed to amend Table 2 of the GSFA as follows:

Food category 13.1.1 Infant formulae					
Food additive	INS	Step/Year Adopted	Maximum Level	Notes	Recommendation
ASCORBYL ESTERS	304, 305	2009	10 mg/kg	Notes 15 , 72 & 187	Adopt

Food category 13.1.2 Follow-up formulae					
Food additive	INS	Step/Year Adopted	Maximum Level	Notes	Recommendation
ASCORBYL ESTERS	304, 305	2015	50 mg/kg	Notes 15 , 72, 187 & 315	Adopt

Food category 13.1.3 Formulae for Special Medical Purposes for Infants					
Food additive	INS	Step/Year Adopted	Maximum Level	Notes	Recommendation
ASCORBYL ESTERS	304, 305	2006	10 mg/kg	Notes 10, 15 , & 72 & <u>187</u>	Adopt

Note 15 On the fat or oil basis

⁴ Recommendation 22 of CRD2 from CCFA50 meeting, Xiamen, China 26-30 March 2018.