

June 2006

codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00100 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 2

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION

Fifty-eighth Session

WHO Headquarters, Geneva, Switzerland, 28 June - 1 July 2006

CRITICAL REVIEW OF THE DRAFT STANDARDS AND RELATED TEXTS SUBMITTED TO THE COMMISSION FOR ADOPTION

1. In accordance with the Uniform Procedure for the Elaboration of Codex Standards and Related Texts, Part 2. Critical Review, paragraph 8, the texts submitted to the Commission for consideration for adoption should be examined:

- for consistency with the mandate of Codex, the decisions of the Commission, and existing Codex texts,
- to ensure that the requirements of the endorsement procedure have been fulfilled, where appropriate,
- for format and presentation, and
- for linguistic consistency.

2. The draft standards and related texts submitted to the Commission for adoption are listed in the Appendix to this document with notes to draw the attention of the Executive Committee and the Commission to specific issues, and the status of endorsement where relevant. Endorsement is mentioned only when applicable for the text under consideration. There are no comments in the Table when no specific problems exist as regards the criteria mentioned in the Critical Review and the texts proposed for adoption were finalized by consensus in the Committee concerned.

3. This document should be read in conjunction with ALINORM 05/28/5 - List of Draft Standards and Related Texts Submitted to the Commission for Adoption and ALINORM 05/28/5A - Comments submitted by Governments and interested international organizations.

Appendix

STANDARDS AND RELATED TEXTS SUBMITTED FOR ADOPTION

Subject	Step	Reference	Notes and/or Relevant Endorsement(s)
Codex Committee on Cereals Pulses and Legumes			
Draft Standard for Instant Noodles (except Sections 4 and 9)	8	Annex to CL 2006/15-CPL	CCMAS: endorsed with an editorial amendment (ALINORM 06/29/23, para. 64 and Appendix II) CCFL: endorsed
Proposed draft Standard for Instant Noodles (Sections 4 and 9)	5/8	Annex to CL 2006/15-CPL	CCFAC: endorsed with amendments, including deletion of the provision for Annatto extracts (INS 160b) (ALINORM 06/29/12, paras. 46-47 and Appendix IV).
Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants			
Draft revision of the Preamble of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives	8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix V	
Draft and proposed draft food additive provisions of the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA)	8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix VII	Appendix VII contains food additive provisions of Codex Standards with a one-to-one relationship with the GSFA Food Category to be included in the GSFA (this is the first step of the ongoing work of CCFAC for moving the food additive provisions of the Codex commodity standards into the GSFA). <u>See Annex 1, Part I</u>
Draft Maximum Level for Lead in Fish	8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XXIV	
Draft Maximum Levels for Cadmium in marine bivalve molluscs (excluding oysters and scallops) and in cephalopods (without viscera) and in polished rice	8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XXV	

Proposed draft food additive provisions of the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XI	Appendix XI contains food additive provisions that are derived from the ongoing work of the Committee to complete entry of food additive provisions in the GSFA
Proposed draft amendments to the International Numbering System for Food Additives	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XVI	Ongoing work
Specifications for the Identity and Purity of Food Additives arising from the 65 th JECFA meeting	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XVII	Ongoing work
Proposed draft Appendix to the Code of Practice for the Prevention and Reduction of Aflatoxins Contamination in Tree Nuts – Additional Measures for the Prevention and Reduction of Aflatoxins Contamination in Brazil nuts	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XX	(N08-2005)
Proposed draft Code of Practice for the Prevention and Reduction of Dioxin and Dioxin-like PCB Contamination in Food and Feeds	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix XXVI	<p><u>Note</u> : The Proposed Draft Code of Practice includes a section on Sampling, Analytical Methods, Data Reporting and Laboratories. While discussing the methods for the determination of dioxins and PCBs, which is a separate issue, CCMAS had the following discussion:</p> <p>“To the concerns raised by several delegations with regard to the range of levels of interest for performance of methods of analysis indicated in the Code of Practice for the Prevention and Reduction of Dioxin and Dioxin-Like PCB Contamination in Foods and Feeds, it was noted that this Committee could no longer make specific comments on this Code to CCFAC since the Code has been forwarded to the Commission for adoption at Step 8, however, members were still in a position to make relevant comments to the Commission.”(ALINORM 06/29/23, para. 96)</p> <p>CCEXEC may wish to consider whether the section on methods in the Proposed Draft Code of Practice could be referred to CCMAS for advice, taking into account that CCMAS is considering methods for the determination of dioxins and PCBs at the request of CCFAC.</p>

Proposed draft revised
Guideline Levels for
Radionuclides in Foods
Contaminated Following a
Nuclear or Radiological
Emergency for Use in
International Trade

5/8

ALINORM 06/29/12,
Appendix XXXI

Amendments sent to the Commission that do not follow the Step Procedure

Codex General Standard for
Contaminants and Toxins in
Foods, including Schedule I

ALINORM 06/29/12,
Appendix XVIII

37th CCFAC agreed to Append Schedule I to the GSCTF and to request the 28th CAC to revoke the existing individual Codex standards for Maximum/Guideline Levels for contaminants and toxins. The 28th CAC in noting that Schedule I had not officially submitted for adoption, requested the CCFAC to submit it for adoption. All current (adopted) provisions for contaminants have been transferred to Schedule I.

Amended Annex to Table 3
of the GSFA

ALINORM 06/29/12,
Appendix VIII

This amendment is a consequential change to the inclusion of the food additives provisions of the commodity standards with a one-to-one relationship with a food category of the GSFA into the GSFA.

Amendment of additives
provisions in individual
standards

ALINORM 06/29/12,
Appendix IX

Replacement of the list of food additives of those Codex commodity standards that have a one-to-one relationship with GSFA food categories, with text that refers to the provisions of the relevant GSFA categories.

Note: This is not consistent with the Format of Codex Standads that refers to the list of additives. See Annex 1, Part I

Revision of the Descriptor of
Food Category 13.6 “Food
supplements” of the GSFA

ALINORM 06/29/12,
Appendix XXXIII

This amendment is related to the descriptor of the Food category 13.6 “Food Supplement of the GSFA” to align it with the Codex *Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements* (CAC/GL 55/2005).

Codex Committee on Food Import and Export Inspection and Certification Systems

Proposed draft Principles and
Guidelines for Imported Food
Inspection Based on Risk

5/8

ALINORM 06/29/30,
Appendix II

N06-2004

Proposed draft Principles for
Traceability/Product Tracing
as a Tool within a Food
Import and Export Inspection
and Certification System

5/8

ALINORM 06/29/30,
Appendix III

N04-2005

Codex Committee on Food Labelling

Draft Amendment to the Guidelines for the Production, Processing, Labelling and Marketing of Organically Produced Foods: Annex 2 – Permitted Substances: Table 3	8	ALINORM 06/29/22, Appendix II	<u>Note regarding procedure:</u> The Draft Amendment was not sent for comments at Step 6 due to late preparation of the revised Draft. Comments were presented in some CRDs and discussed in the Working Group held prior to the Session. The Committee decided to forward the Draft Amendment to Step 8 in view of the consensus reached on a number of substances (ALINORM 06/29/22, paras. 56-60).
Proposed Draft Amendment to the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling: Definition of Trans Fatty Acids	5A	ALINORM 06/29/22, Appendix V	Request of the 26 th CAC (2003) to CCFL and CCNFSDU. Following consideration of a definition by the CCNFSDU, the 33 rd CCFL proposed to amend the Guidelines, which was approved as new work by the 28 th CAC through the Accelerated Procedure (N10-2005)
General Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars: labelling provisions related to processing aids	endors ement	ALINORM 06/29/22 para. 4-5	Completion of the endorsement process for the provisions for processing aids (as endorsed by CCFAC) in the General Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars, adopted by the 28 th CAC.

Codex Committee on Methods of Analysis and Sampling

Methods of analysis and sampling for inclusion in Codex standards and/or in CODEX STAN 234-1999	endors ement	ALINORM 06/29/23, Appendix II	In addition to the endorsement of methods in standards under elaboration, the update of the methods may result in amendments to adopted standards, or to CODEX STAN 234-1999. This includes the completion of the endorsement process for methods of analysis in the General Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars, adopted by the 28 th CAC.
---	-----------------	-------------------------------	--

Codex Committee on Milk and Milk Products

Draft Amendment to Section 2 “Description” of the General Standard for Cheese	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix II
---	---	-------------------------------

For All CCMMP Standards

CCFAC: see below (ALINORM 06/29/12, paras. 40 and 44-45 and Appendix IV)

CCMAS: Endorsed (ALINORM 06/29/23, paras. 65-67 and Appendix II)

CCFL: see below (ALINORM 06/29/22, paras. 35-42)				
Draft Standard for a Blend of Evaporated Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix III	CCFL: endorsed with amendments (see Annex 1, Part II)	CCFAC: endorsed with some amendments
Draft Standard for a Blend of Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat in Powdered Form	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix IV		
Draft Standard for a Blend of Sweetened Condensed Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix V		
Draft Revised Standard for Whey Cheeses	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix VIII	CCFL: endorsed	CCFAC: endorsed in 2005 (ALINORM 05/28/12, paras 44-45 and Appendix V)
Draft Revised Standard for Cheddar (C-1)	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix VI		
Draft Revised Standard for Danbo (C-3)	8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix VII	CCFL: not endorsed due to lack of consensus on country of origin declaration	CCFAC: endorsed with some amendments. and the deletion of the provisions for Annatto extracts (INS 160b)
Proposed draft Standard for Revised Edam (C-4)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix IX		
Proposed draft Standard for Revised Gouda (C-5)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix X		
Proposed draft Standard for Revised Havarti (C-6)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XI		
Proposed draft Standard for Revised Samsø (C-4)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XII		
Proposed draft Standard for Revised Emmental (C-9)	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XIII		

Proposed Standard (C-11)	draft for	Revised Tilsiter	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XIV	
Proposed Standard for Saint-Paulin (C-13)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XV	
Proposed Standard for Provolone (C-15)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XVI	
Proposed Standard for Camembert (C-33)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XX	
Proposed Standard for Coulommiers (C-18)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XVIII	
Proposed Standard for Brie (C-34)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XXI	
Proposed Standard for Cream Cheese (C-31)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XIX	CCFL: not endorsed due to lack of consensus on country of origin declaration CCFAC: endorsed with some amendments and the deletion of the provisions for Gluconic acid (INS 574)
Proposed Standard for Mozzarella	draft	Standard for	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XXII	
Proposed Standard for Cottage Cheese (C-16)	draft	Revised	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XVII	
Proposed Standard for Dairy Fat Spreads	draft	Standard for	5/8	ALINORM 06/29/11, Appendix XXIII	CCFL: endorsed CCFAC: endorsed with amendments and the deletion of the provisions for a) Annatto extracts (INS 160b) and b) Gluconic acid (INS 574)
Codex Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses					
Draft Processed	Revised Standard for	Cereal-Based	8	ALINORM 06/29/26, Appendix II	CCFAC: endorsed with some amendments (ALINORM 06/29/12, paras. 42-43 and Appendix IV)

Foods for Infants and Young Children	CCFL : endorsed
	CCMAS: Not applicable

Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues

Draft and Proposed Draft Maximum Residue Limits for Pesticides, including Dried Chili Pepper	8 or 5/8	ALINORM 06/29/24, Appendix II and III
--	----------	---------------------------------------

Draft Guidelines on Estimation of Uncertainty of Results	8	ALINORM 06/29/24, Appendix IV
--	---	-------------------------------

Codex Committee on Residues of Veterinary Residues in Foods

Draft Maximum Residue Limits	8	ALINORM 06/29/31, Appendix II
------------------------------	---	-------------------------------

Compendium of Methods of Analysis Identified as Suitable for Support to Codex MRLs	N/A	ALINORM 06/29/31, Appendix IX	This Compendium lists methods of analysis identified by the CCRVDF as suitable for support to Codex MRLs. The Committee will regularly update and revise the Compendium on the basis of information submitted by Codex members and observers.
--	-----	-------------------------------	---

ANNEX 1

PART I**Notes on the texts submitted for adoption by the Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants****ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix VII**

Draft and proposed draft food additive provisions of the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) Step 8 ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix VII

Appendix VII contains food additive provisions of Codex Standards with a one-to-one relationship with the GSFA Food Category to be included in the GSFA (this is the first step of the ongoing work of CCFAC for moving the food additive provisions of the Codex commodity standards into the GSFA).

General issues

The additives provisions listed in Appendix VII are presented as being at Step 8, but they have different status. Several of these provisions are the transfer of additive levels in adopted standards, while others are considered as amendments to these provisions. Some others are proposal for revocation of additive levels in the GSFA in order to eliminate inconsistencies within the Codex Alimentarius.

The following recommendations are proposed for clarification purposes.

CCFAC should, in its future reports, clearly establish a distinction between:

- a) additive provisions included in adopted standards and proposed for incorporation into the GSFA. Their transfer to the GSFA do not require consideration of substantial matters.
- b) revocation of existing provisions in the GSFA in order to endure consistency with existing standards
- c) proposed amendments to current additives provisions in Codex standards for inclusion in the GSFA. These amendments may be referred to the relevant Committee (when active committees exist and relevant standards are under consideration). The Committee may also develop them as new provisions or amendments to the GSFA, in which case they should follow the Step Procedure in order to allow for comments.

When provisions for additives for inclusion into the GSFA result in amendments to additive provisions in Codex standards, consequential amendments should be made to the relevant standards.

The reports of CCFAC should include a table showing the existing additive provisions in the Codex standards in order to facilitate their consideration.

Specific issues**Food Category No. 02.2.1.2 Margarine and Similar Products**

Appendix VII refers to "GSFA food categories with a one-to-one relationship to a single commodity standard". However, the Standard for Margarine applies to margarine only, not to similar products and the category does not correspond exactly to the standard. The Draft Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads is under consideration by the Committee on Fats and Oils, in particular as regards the additives section.

As mentioned above, several provisions are already adopted additive levels in the Standard for Margarine, while some are amendments to these provisions and others are proposals for revocation of current provisions of the GSFA in order to ensure consistency with the Standard for Margarine. For example, phosphates at a level of 40 mg are not included in the current Standard for Margarine.

It is proposed that consideration of all additives provisions for "margarine and similar products" be deferred until the Draft Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads has been finalized by the CCFO in 2007 and a list of additives submitted for endorsement to CCFAC. At the same time, CCFAC is invited to review the relevant section of the food category system in such a way to achieve complete one-to-one correspondence with the provisions in the two standards mentioned above.

Food Category No. 11.1.2 Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose

The additive provisions do not correspond exactly to the provision in the Standard for Sugars, that allows only Calcium phosphate, tribasic, at a level of 15000 mg/kg. The proposal in Appendix VII refers to Phosphates at a level of 6600 mg/kg. CCFAC should clarify whether this provision is at Step 8 as part of the GSFA.

Food Category No 12.1.1 Salt

In the current Standard for Food Grade Salt, ferric ammonium citrate is not listed and calcium ferrocyanide is at a different level (10 mg/kg instead of 14 mg/kg for all ferrocyanides)

Only tricalcium orthophosphate is allowed at a level of 20000mg/kg, while Appendix VII lists all phosphates at a level of 8800 mg/kg.

As regards polysorbates in salt, this is a new level for inclusion in the GSFA and it may be clarified whether it went through the Step Procedure as part of the GSFA. This will also require a consequential amendment to the Standard for Food Grade Salt , that currently lists only Polyxyethylene (20) sorbitan monooleate (433).

551 silicon dioxide (amorphous) (referred to as Step 7) is already included in the Standard for Food Grade Salt and can be transferred to the GSFA.

Food Category No 13.1.1 Infant Formulae

In Appendix VII, all provisions for thickeners, emulsifiers and antioxidants are different from the levels in the Standard for Infant Formula (generally ten times higher) and some conditions of use for various types of infant formula have been deleted.

The levels for acidity regulators correspond with the Standard but the conditions of use related to the section on nutritional requirements are missing.

The revision of the Standard for Infant Formula is currently under discussion in the Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses. CCFAC will have the possibility to consider the list of additives and make any amendments that may be necessary as part of the endorsement process.

It is proposed that the adoption of new levels for additives in infant formula be deferred until the CCNFSDU has completed the revision of the standard.

Food Category No 13.1.2 Follow-up Formulae

The list of additives in the Standard for Follow-up Formula is mostly the same as in the Standard for Infant Formula (only additions being two antioxidants and pectins). All additives in Appendix VII have been amended as in the Standard for Infant Formula, with levels ten times higher.

This standard is not under revision in the CCNFSDU. However, in view of the close relationship with the Standard for Infant Formula, it would be preferable to ask the advice of the CCNFSDU regarding proposed amendments to it is expected that when the additive list is finalized for infant formula, the CCNFSDU may initiate a revision of the Standard for Follow-up Formula.

It is proposed that the adoption of new levels for additives in follow-up formula be deferred until the CCNFSDU has completed the revision of the Standard for Infant Formula or that the matter be referred for consideration by the CCNFSDU.

ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix IX Proposals to revise Commodity Standards with a One to One Relationship with a GSFA Food Category

This is a proposal to replace the section on additives in several individual standards with the following text in all standards corresponding to the food categories listed in Annex VII:

“Food Additives listed in tables 1 and 2 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives in Food Category (reference of the category) may be used in foods subject to this standard”

As regards Margarine and Infant Formula, as mentioned concerning Appendix VII above, these standards are under revision, including the section on additives, and it is proposed to defer any amendment to the current section until the revised standard has been finalized.

This proposal also raises a general issue: the replacement of a section on additives listing specific additives in the standards with a general reference to the GSFA, which is not consistent with the current provisions of the Procedural Manual, whereby the name and levels of food additives should be specified in the standard. The relevant provisions appear in the **Format of Codex Commodity Standards** and the **Relations between Commodity Committees and General Committees**, as follows

Format of Codex Commodity Standards

Food Additives

This section should contain the names of the additives permitted and, where appropriate, the maximum amount permitted in the food. It should be prepared in accordance with guidance given in the section on Food Additives and Contaminants in the Relations between Commodity Committees and General Committees, and may take the following form:

“The following provisions in respect of food additives and their specifications as contained in section of the Codex Alimentarius are subject to endorsement [have been endorsed] by the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants.”

Then should follow a tabulation, viz.:

“Name of additive, maximum level (in percentage or mg/kg).”

Relations between Commodity Committees and General Committees

Food Additives and Contaminants

Codex commodity committees should prepare a section on food additives in each draft commodity standard and this section should contain all the provisions in the standard relating to food additives. The section should include the names of those additives which are considered to be technologically necessary or which are widely permitted for use in the food within maximum levels where appropriate.

All provisions in respect of food additives (including processing aids) and contaminants contained in Codex commodity standards should be referred to the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants

(...)

When an active commodity committee exists, proposals for the use of additives in any commodity standard under consideration should be prepared by the committee concerned, and forwarded to the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants for endorsement. When the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants decides not to endorse specific additives provisions (use of the additive, or level in the end-product), the reason should be clearly stated. The section under consideration should be referred back to the Committee concerned if further information is needed, or for information if the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants decides to amend the provision.

When no active commodity committee exists, proposals for new additive provisions or amendment of existing provisions, should be forwarded directly by member countries to the Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants.

On the other hand, it is recalled that the Commission, at its 28th Session, agreed to transfer the list of endorsed food additive provisions from the General Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars to the General Standard for Food Additives and include the reference to the General Standards for Food Additives (GSFA) under the Section on Food Additives of the Standard, noting that there was full correspondence between the products covered by the Standard and the food category system of the GSFA. The Commission also noted that this approach was consistent with the development of the GSFA although this might not be the case for other commodities which might require the list of additive provisions be retained in the commodity standard until the GSFA was completed in the future. The Commission therefore agreed to request CCFAC to examine the matter of how the endorsed list of additive provisions of commodity standards could systematically be incorporated into the GSFA. (ALINORM 05/28/41 paras 62-63).

Accordingly, the CCFAC has initiated the revision of the relevant sections of the Procedural Manual on this matter (ALINORM 06/29/12, paras 68-69) and this is expected to result in several amendments to the Procedural Manual in the near future.

The Executive Committee is invited to consider the above information as part of the critical review.

PART II

Endorsement of Food Labelling Provisions in the Standards for Milk and Milk Products

Draft Standard for a Blend of Evaporated Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat

Draft Standard for a Blend of Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat in Powdered Form

Draft Standard for a Blend of Sweetened Condensed Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat

The Committee agreed to add the words “Subject to the legislation of the country of retail sale...” at the beginning of section 7.5, which refers to a advisory statement and endorsed the labelling provisions as amended. The Committee noted the concerns expressed by the Delegation of Canada, that it should be considered further whether the addition of the phrase in 7.5 could lead to consistency problems with other standards for milk and milk products (ALINORM 06/29/22, paras. 40-42). The section would then read as follows.

7.5 ADVISORY STATEMENT

Subject to the legislation of the country of retail sale, a statement shall appear on the label to indicate that the product should not be used as a substitute for infant formula. For example, “NOT SUITABLE FOR INFANTS”.

Secretariat Note (for information): The relevant standards were checked and no “advisory statement” appears in the Standard for Evaporated Milks (CODEX STAN A-3 1971, Rev.1-1999) or in any other standard for milk and milk products, therefore the addition of the phrase regarding the legislation of the country of retail sale does not result in any inconsistency with similar provisions in standards for milk and milk products.